

# Corruption Prevention through Community Organizing: The Case of CCCs and YES Groups of Transparency International Bangladesh

Nurul Huda Sakib<sup>1</sup>

## ABSTRACT

*Engaging citizens through a community-based organisation is not a new phenomenon. Research around the world has shown that citizen engagement is one of the most significant ways of combating corruption and promoting good governance. Transparency International Bangladesh (TIB) is undertaking similar types of activities through the Committee of Concerned Citizens (CCCs) and Youth Engagement and Support (YES) Groups. The question is, how much difference is it making in society vis-à-vis preventing corruption? Considering TIB as a case study drawing in-depth interviews, participation observation and document analysis, this paper has found that both CCCs and YES activities are dominated by coercive and mimetic isomorphism to prevent corruption. Second, TIB has managed to create awareness through engaging citizens, the whole process as a 'tortoise movement.' This suggests that the movement against the corruption of these groups is prolonged and time-consuming, and more importantly, it does not make 'direct impact' on service delivery. Third, it also suggests that donor-driven 'isomorphic' approach may prove to be less effective, considering the societal context of Bangladesh. Finally, this paper also identified some loopholes that are mainly linked with the 'tortoise movement.'*

**Keywords:** Transparency International Bangladesh, Coercive Isomorphism, Memetic Isomorphism, Bangladesh, Community-Based Organisation.

---

<sup>1</sup>Department of Government and Politics, Jahangirnagar University, Email: [nhsakib@juniv.edu](mailto:nhsakib@juniv.edu)

## 1. INTRODUCTION

Anti-corruption initiatives through community activism in Bangladesh has become popular in the contemporary period. It is increasing, and countless government and nongovernment efforts have been familiarized through Community-Based Organizations (CBOs) and other forms of the mechanism. Especially since its initiation Transparency International Bangladesh (TIB) mobilize citizens to participate in anti-corruption activities and awareness campaign through community participation. The question is, can community-driven efforts prevent corruption in Bangladesh? Murphy (1990) argues that it is relatively easy to organise poor people on 'need-based' issues, but it is hard to solve problems such as corruption that are 'rights-based.' Therefore, combating corruption always needs special efforts. However, experiences from countries like Hong Kong, Indonesia, Japan, Canada, USA, UK, India, Singapore suggest that engaging citizens in combating corruption is an effective mechanism to fight corruption by creating the social movement. These countries have significant success in corruption prevention via engaging citizens (For Detail see Sakib, 2020). Thus, it is likely that Bangladesh will also get substantial results regarding combating corruption but need special efforts. This paper is aiming to find out the outcome of TIB led community engagement program driven by CCCs and YES in Bangladesh.

This case study drawing some evidence through in-depth interviews, participant observation and document analysis, argues isomorphism of 'citizen engagement' via CCCs and YES of TIB to fight against corruption is less effective and has a minimum impact in Bangladesh. The paper also discusses that the donor led isomorphic model done very little due to a range of factors. Thus, the entire initiatives have become a 'tortoise movement' which indicates many works are going on with a less significant impact. Finally, it shows that community engagement of anti-corruption in Bangladesh may be successful in solving identified loopholes or a different approach.

## 2. Unpacking institutional isomorphism<sup>2</sup>

The dynamics of community organizing can be traced down through a well-accepted theory as for example institutional isomorphism. As new institutional theorists (i.e. Hawley, DiMaggio and Powell) suggest that institutional isomorphism holds key to understand organizational dynamics. Therefore, DiMaggio and Powell (1983) essentially centre around institutional isomorphism as it is crucial where political pioneers take the lead. Hawley (1968) defines institutional isomorphism as the similarity between associations mirrors the comparability of their surroundings and variety in association structures exhibits a decent variety of conditions. In this specific circumstance, the major systems through which isomorphic change happens is a critical issue. Hence institutional isomorphism recognizes these obliging impacts as coercive, mimetic, and normative isomorphism to clarify why organisations are headed to similitude and try to keep up their authenticity (DiMaggio and Powell, 1983);

The table below provides a brief overview of three pillars of institutional isomorphism; regulative (coercive), normative and cognitive (mimetic). It showed the basis of compliance, mechanism, logic, indicators and legal basis of these three types of isomorphism. Institutions can adapt all three types of isomorphism following these criteria.

*Table 1: Three Pillars of Institutions*

Basis of compliance	Regulative Expedience	Normative Social obligation	Cognitive Taken for granted
Mechanism	Coercive	Normative	Mimetic
Logic	Instrumentality	Appropriateness	Orthodoxy
Indicators	Rules, laws, sanctions	Certification, accreditation	Prevalence, isomorphism
Basis of legitimacy	Legally sanctioned	Morally governed	Culturally supported, conceptually correct

**Source:** (Scott, 1995, p. 33)

<sup>2</sup> For detail see Sakib N.H. (2020) Institutional Isomorphism. In: Farazmand A. (eds) Global Encyclopedia of Public Administration, Public Policy, and Governance. Springer, Cham. Author took permission to reuse his materials.'

Nevertheless, all three isomorphic mechanisms can influence organisational behaviour, this paper draws specifically on mimetic (cognitive) and coercive (regulative) isomorphism to explain the effectiveness of the TIB's citizen engagement process. It suggests why isomorphism does not turn out to be successful inside the case of preventing corruption.

### **3. Coercive (Regulative) isomorphism**

Coercive isomorphism is best understood by power, pressure, force or persuasion (Park, 2014). Homogenization of association happens because of weight or unreasonable capacity to one association with other people. Hence, in coercive isomorphism activities can be obliged by the activities of others, all the more impressive units (Mizruchi & Fein, 1999). Ground breaking work of DiMaggio and Powell (2000b, p. 147) define coercive isomorphism in the following words:

*Coercive isomorphism results from both formal and informal pressures exerted on organisations by other organisations upon which they are dependent and by cultural expectations in the society within which organisations function.*

Hence, coercive isomorphism shaped by government regulation or regulatory agencies engages with organisations. Another example of a powerful organisation is the state, as rules influence organisations and legitimised by the state (Meyer & Rowan, 1977). Coercive pressure shapes through various components, for example, execution assessment, budgetary control instruments, (Chang, Mellahi, & Wilkinson, 2009; Yazdifar, Zaman, Tsamenyi, & Askarany, 2008). Furthermore, a higher level of funding and personnel dependence creates more influence and imposition (Pfeffer & Salancik, 2003; Powell & DiMaggio, 2012).

### **4. Mimetic (cognitive) isomorphism**

Reliable with organisation theory, numerous researchers have broadly investigated mimetic isomorphism as a reaction to vulnerability as the foundation looks for authenticity (DiMaggio and Powell, 1983, 2000b; Meyer & Rowan, 1977; Mizruchi & Fein, 1999). Mimetic isomorphism proposes that any organized attempt to follow and the propensity of 'replicating' from another association (Park, 2014; Verbruggen, Christiaen & Milis, 2011). The mimetic procedure may prevail through

suggestions from donors, public consultations, and so on. Modelling other organisation activities would provide a viable response to uncertainty. This modelling may be unintentional or indirect through their working process but may lead to innovation (mother's gathering as in the case of CCC and YES). To describe the mimetic process DiMaggio and Powell (1983) provided the example of Japan's modernisation process and showed how they were successful following western prototypes. Similarly, drawing TIB's community engagement dynamic this paper made an attempt to understand the effectiveness of the isomorphic approach to prevent corruption in Bangladesh.

### **5. Defining community-based organization and its challenges**

Community organising sorting out recommends that the point is accomplishing something advantageous for the residents of the region (Sakib,2020). These are sort of organizations provides social services to the society at local level with no intention of gaining profit and worked completely volunteer basis (Chechetto-Salles and Yvette Geyer, 2006). The subject matter of this definition is that it limits CBOs on the neighbourhood level and just in non-benefit or a volunteer commitment. But, in present days CBO's are framed for non-benefit or volunteer purposes as well as to give some common advantage to the entire network by direct benefit. For instance; fish farmer relationship in Bangladesh at the waterfront zones framed CBOs to pick up benefit, not as a volunteer association. In this way, CBOs could be characterized as a composed network who is coordinated by some objective/s (social, political, financial turn of events) to serve the normal enthusiasm of the community (Sakib, 2019). They might be non-benefit or volunteer-based, however, they can be shaped to accomplish direct benefit as a community. Be that as it may, volunteer or benefit based association; the objective of the CBOs is to safeguard the most huge community interest.

Hence, CBOs are incessant and dynamic in advancing administrations and supporting neediness decrease, improving governance, upgrading manageability, improving productivity and viability, and building social capital and social services particularly in wellbeing, the environment, education, public safety, and so forth divisions (Jennings, 2005; Mansuri and Rao, 2004). However, the most significant problems of CBOs are to organise people as a community and

sustain for a long time. It is primarily identified with authenticity, financing or resource, strategy and population (Walker and McCarthy, 2010). CBOs regularly worked by either improvement accomplices or NGOs or unique individuals' subsidizing and asset assortment. These CBOs either rush to satisfy those associations or its own objective/s or impact the CBOs action to accomplish their (IGOs, NGOs or Individuals) target. Moreover, CBOs can not get by without the help of nearby individuals. In this way, making fellowship or connection attaches inside a network to make social holding is urgent. While investigating the 'Global Justice Movement', Forno and Graziano (2014) argue that local organisation played as 'core activist' in the Sustainable Community Movement Organization (SCMOs) resulted in a thriving campaign re-embedding economy.

Another most significant problem of CBOs is a constant political intervention in their activities and lack of political support. However, there are some examples of community organisations around the world that may either be politically backed by either government or opposition. Even after a successful campaign, they form a political party. For example, in the case of Indonesia, Achwan and Ganie-Rochman (2009) showed that reforms of public governance were problematic due to legitimacy, networking, and political support; which creates a hindrance to performing their active role. They also found that political party creates pressure group or youth organisation and later these groups are being used to fulfil political goals. For example, in Thailand, local politicians and bureaucrats supported the establishment of Cooperative Community Groups (CCGs), which reduced more substantial administrative burden and helped to win the election (Read & Pekkanen, 2009). In the USA, CBOs help to empower some of the country's poorest and least advantaged areas and seeks political power. Nevertheless, they never float away from the higher social setting. The coordinators join together and sort out individuals, develop pioneers, teach individuals, and encourage a deliberately ideological practice (Fisher, 1994). In this manner, governmental issues and CBOs have a success win relationship to accomplish their objectives.

While describing the growth of community organisation in Asia, Murphy (1990) identified ideological conflict among members and leadership are key issues to form a CBO and sustain for a longer time. He

also argued that poor people could be quickly organized in matters like water, light, and footpaths, but it is hard to organised people on issues like land or jobs. Similarly, Walls (2015) thinks that; to serve community interest, these organisations do have many challenges and need some special efforts. Thus, he identified four key issues that may play an essential role in community organising;

- Power: Organizing a powerful organisation needs influential local leaders.
- Self-interest and values of the organisation that needed to clarify by one on one meeting.
- Development of organisers or leaders. And
- Training of the leaders

Finally, there are no alternatives to making CBOs as legitimate. Based on organisation theory, Walker and McCarthy (2010) showed that despite having many challenges in most cases organisations survived because of legitimacy in mobilising low and moderate communities to reduce inequalities and promote citizens' rights. In another research in a Bangladesh context Thompson (2013) showed that the sustainability of the collective action is more of a process, and it depends on the resource system, groups, institutions and external environment. Thus, legal support from the government is crucial in forming and effectiveness of CBOs.

## **6. Methodology**

The case study method can be utilized for both exploratory and informative research. It can bring an extensive scope of elements into account (Halperin & Heath, 2012). Essentially, this exploration is additionally managing numerous components. For instance, the paper is concentrating on the citizen's engagement procedure of TIB through CCCs and YES as a CBOs to fight against corruption, their issues and approaches. In this manner, the case study is essentially founded on key informant interviews (KII), auxiliary reports and participant observation. However, case study research explores, the KII is perhaps the most ideal approaches to accumulate data from onlookers (Creswell, 2012). Bulk of the information for this paper has been gathered through in-depth interviews. Since the emphasis is on a miniaturized scale and just

managing the exercises of the people's engagement in TIB's community organizations. The fieldwork was completed at the various areas in Bangladesh from September 2015 to May 2016. A sum of 16 KII has been utilized to coordinate the discoveries. Interviews lasted between 20-60 minutes, contingent upon interviewees skill, ability to take an interest and time. A meeting plan was readied following the rules of the University of Sydney Ethics. KII was led from various classes of the general public, including lawmakers, previous and present government representatives, ACC officials, CBOs pioneers, scholastics and civil society individuals. Alongside the KII, participant observation strategy has been utilized while visiting CCCs, taking part rallies and classes and different exercises of TIB. Also, a significant number of data was accumulated from TIB and CCCs workplaces and through email correspondence.

### **7. The case of TIB's CCCs and YES groups initiatives**

The Berlin-based worldwide NGO Transparency International opened Bangladesh Chapter (TIB) in 1996 is to speak more piercingly against corruption and to make requests for responsibility, straightforwardness and good governance. To advance and prepare against defilement activities, TIB began the Committee of Concern Citizens (CCCs) and Youth Engagement and Support (YES) Groups in 2001 through network arranging (TIB, 2012). These people group associations reinforced by TIB have gotten straightforwardly engaged with against defilement endeavours in Bangladesh.

Pope (2000) contended that institutional measures to forestall debasement must be compelling if dynamic and concerned residents developed to forestall defilement. Consolidate with Pope's contention TIB demonstrated that in Bangladesh at the nearby level, community commitment was expected to sharpen residents to their privileges, change residents' perspectives towards debasement and enable them to challenge defilement. In this manner, CCCs were presented on a pilot premise, and now they have become natural all over Bangladesh. The point and target of CCCs underlines this with the accompanying words;

This idea stems from the fact that since corruption is regarded by most citizens as an integral part of their lives the real challenge lies in changing people's attitude and behaviour so that they no longer accept corruption as an inevitable aspect of life. While the primary responsibility



of tackling corruption essentially lies with the government, TIB recognises that it is the people who are the ultimate repository of power for exerting pressure for good governance (TIB, 2014).

By 2012, there were CCCs in 45 regions and 60 YES all through the nation (TIB, 2012). The CCCs utilizes various panels to perform their tasks. There are warning advisory groups, involving up to seven senior and famous residents, to give direction and counsel to the CCC. The principle CCC or the advisory group gives initiative and partakes effectively in conceiving procedures, planning plans, planning and actualizing programs. TIB gives just specialized and money related help to these advisory groups. The number of individuals from the focal council ranges from 9 to 21. Individuals are drawn from different expert gatherings, and representation of both gender is also considered. The most adequate, dynamic and excited individual with administration characteristics who is happy to give time and exertion to the general public is chosen as a president by the members and TIB. The tenure of the president is two terms and individuals review crafted by the president yearly and hold an election if important. Two vice-presidents are chosen, one of whom must be a women. The CCCs likewise establish different issue-based sub-advisory groups including 3 to 5 individuals. In each CCC, there is a gender sub-committee, endeavouring to advance women's support and the mainstreaming of gender in CCC exercises. Other subcommittees incorporate wellbeing, instruction, neighbourhood government, YES, procurement, finance and social issues (TIB, 2012).

Anybody somewhere in the range of 30 and 75 years old who is an occupant in the CCCs region, who harmonizes with TIB's vision, targets and is focused on TIB Code of Ethics can be a part of the association. Individuals with any contribution in corruption or who have been indicted for a criminal offence including 'moral turpitude' are not permitted to become members. A public official getting a charge out of any unique status conceded by law or who are effectively associated with party governmental issues or liable of default of any open levy controlled by a court of law is likewise not allowed to turn into a part. Individuals who are close relatives of the official executive of TIB and other full-time individuals from the TIB staff are likewise not permitted to have CCC participation (TIB, 2012).

The YES works at school, school and colleges and TIB give them operational help, financing and guidelines. One of the sub-advisory groups from the CCCs offers vital counsel. Every YES comprises of 35-50 youthful individuals and every one of them are for the most part in the age gathering of 15-25 (TIB, 2012).

## **8. Activities of CCCs and YES Groups**

TIB directs a scope of exercises through CCCs and YES. A portion of these activities is exceptionally new to the Bangladeshi society. In the process of involving citizens in the anti-corruption movement, CCCs and YES attempt two fundamental sorts of exercises.

### **A. Advocacy, Information, Assistance and lobbying**

The CCCs and YES are engaged with a range of advocacy, data support and campaigning related issues. Various sorts of exercises like citizens report cards (CRC), mothers' gatherings, face-the-public (FtP) meetings, citizens' charters (CC), public hearings, Advice and Information Desks (AI-Desks) and support services through Advocacy and Legal Advice Centres (ALAC) (see Table 2) consistently observed by CCCs and YES.

The CRC is a sort of overview to gauge the quality of public services gave in a zone. It gives criticism from people in general to neighbourhood chose pioneers and specialist co-ops. Mother's gatherings permit moms to speak more loudly to improve the nature of education and play facilities. The objective is to make social responsibility to advance revelation, straightforwardness and responsibility in schools and diminish unlawful instalments for school administrations. It is likewise a valuable procedure for women's participation and empowerment. The FtP is composed to communicate mass residents' interests and suppositions to the open agents and authorities. The integrity pledge is a small scale level social responsibility procedure to advance participatory and responsible administration at the degree of neighbourhood administration conveyance by the intentional duty of partners. The citizens' charter is another activity for improving help conveyance at the neighbourhood level.

**Table 2:** Various Types of Activities of CCCs and YES from 2012 to 2015

<b>Name of Activities</b>	<b>04/11- 3/12</b>	<b>04/12- 3/13</b>	<b>04/13- 03/14</b>	<b>04/14- 09/14</b>	<b>10/14- 09/15</b>	<b>10/15- 03/16</b>
Meetings	1173	1180	1209	555	1153	589
Leaflets/ Vajpatra	125	153	129	30	148	107
Satellite AI-Desks	423	437	312	77	361	262
Special Anti- Corruption Campaign <sup>1</sup> by CCCs	70	73	79	24	131	45
Special Anti- Corruption Campaign <sup>2</sup> by YES	106	94	?	18	96	43
Theatre show/ Cultural program/ Folk show	323	327	207	24	73	126
Debate/Essay competition; anti- corruption Cartoon/ photography exhibition; anti- corruption wall painting/ wall magazine; Rally/ bi-cycle Rally/ Human Chain	159	176	153	17	140	78

**Source:** (TIB, 2016a)<sup>3</sup>

The AI-Desks familiarised in 2003, was at first intended to be an outlet in the CCC workplaces to give data on demands got through close to home visits, calls or composed solicitations. The 'satellite' adaptation was made in 2005 in light of the need to take the AI-Desks closer to the

<sup>3</sup> Special anti-corruption campaign is local need-based initiatives- Information fair/ Seminar/ Workshop/ Roundtable meeting, meeting with different professional groups etc. Author collected the activities of CCCs and YES Groups through e-mail communication.

individuals straightforwardly at the doorsteps of important establishments. From an underlying test in six distinct areas, the AI-Desk extended to each of the 45 CCCs by 2011. Driven basically by the YES members under the oversight of the CCCs, the AI-Desks give data on administrations gave by the applicable foundations; for instance, the expense of medications, specialists' hours, assessment charges and the financial plan of the Union Parishad (third level of the nearby government). They simultaneously receive reports of corruption, educating the public at the local level on their rights, entitlements, and duties in challenging corruption. AI-Desks are placed at CCC workplaces, and 'satellite' AI-Desks are put at schools, medical clinics, and nearby government workplaces (TIB, 2016b). Like the AI Desk, ALAC is a CCC office-based activity that gets grievances of corruption from casualties and observers of corruption, examines the case and help and counsel. The ultimate exercises would evoke the receipt of claims for individual or by calling, reaching out to affected communities, ensuring confidentiality, giving guidance on the most proficient method to look for change and making referrals to other care groups.

### **B. Awareness raising and capacity-building activities**

CCCs and YES Group help to sort out a scope of more extensive mindfulness raising exercises at social occasions, for example, people theatres, folk shows, shows and road appears. People's Theatre is a basic support apparatus used to manufacture familiarity with the effect of corruption among the most powerless and ignorant individuals to advise them about corruption and spur them to reject and oppose the abuse of power. Different exercises like debates, essay competitions, anti-corruption cartoons, photography exhibitions, anti-corruption wall paintings, wall magazines, bicycle rallies and human chains include more youthful individuals from schools, universities and colleges in messages against corruption.

TIB likewise distributes a quarterly diary named Nagorik Prottoy ('Commitment from the Citizens') to layout the exercises of CCCs. Aside from this, each CCC distributes flyers dependent on their exercises and advancing neighbourhood crusades against corruption. CCCs and YES likewise observe different national and worldwide days, for example,

International Anti-Corruption Day, International Youth Day and International Mother Language Day to make their essence felt.

With the assistance of TIB, a scope of inner direction, training and improvement workshops are held by CCCs and YES for the advancement of individuals, to make them progressively dynamic and make future pioneers. CCCs and YES compose neighbourhood need-based activities like information fairs, seminars, workshops, roundtable meetings, meetings with specific professional groups, surveys on client satisfaction, meetings with youth groups, petition campaigns and so forth. These are for the most part to build up their technique, mindfulness among residents and features rising corruption issues in the nearby settings.

### **9. Coercive and Mimetic Isomorphic Dynamic in Practice**

The component TIB is applying to draw in citizen involves are coercive and mimetic isomorphism. In Bangladesh, TIB started the civic engagement program following rules of Berlin-based association TI and attempted to set up a donor-supported worldwide civic engagement. TIB gets it is subsidizing for network commitment from TI, which is currently bolstered by various sources, including donors (the UN, DFID, European Commission, Inter-American Development Bank, and so on.), governments and private establishments (TI, 2016a).

Worldwide civic engagement process like community relation department of The Independent Commission Against Corruption (ICAC) of Hong Kong, civic engagement in UK, USA, Canada through neighbourhood government have urged TIB to shape CCCs and YES at the nearby level.

TIB initiated their citizen's engagement program prescribed by TI, which supported mainly by donors. Both CCCs and YES did give primacy to the local context and invent some new ways like mothers' gathering (part of a civic education which is widely popular in Hong Kong) to engage citizens in preventing corruption. Similarly, the concept of AI satellite desk and monitoring government offices through various activities are prevalent in Delhi, when India pass Right to Information Act in 2001. Parivartan (Change) of Arvind Kejriwal and Anna Hazare (engaging middle class) was very successful in monitoring "ration shops"

and other government departments. At the same time, this concerned group also break the brokerage system by providing information, help to fill government forms via using RTI Act (Webb, 2012).

TIB followed these kinds of instruments that had been fruitful somewhere else and applied them in the Bangladeshi setting donors on pressure from TI and the worldwide contributors. The AI satellite desk is one of them, that provide information to mass people. The AI-Desks, presented in 2003, was at first intended to be just an outlet in the CCCs workplaces to give data on a solicitation recognized through close to home visits, calls or composed interests. The Satellite form was made in 2005 to take AI-Desks at the doorsteps of the pertinent organizations. From an underlying test in 6 distinct areas, the AI-Desk has by mid-2011 extended to every one of the 45 CCCs in addition to one in Dhaka. TIB, likewise monitoring climate finance through community engagement with the help of local people (personal communication, December 5, 2015). Some different exercises like face the public, observing special days (like women's day, anti-corruption day) and arrange seminars and workshops, cartoon, animation, social program, and so forth are likewise 'duplicate' adaptation of worldwide anti-corruption movement and somewhat altered in the neighbourhood setting.

### **10. Does isomorphic “Tortoise Movement” make any difference**

The activities of the CCCs and YES (as of Table 2) shows there is some impact on society in various aspects. One of the notable highlights is, many of these CCCs and YES activities are based on semi-urban and rural areas. The study finding suggests that these committees found very active and more focused regarding their mission, vision, and activities. One of such CCC is Potiya (Southern part of Bangladesh residing Chittagong district), where members were found very agile and active. Most of them are participating in the meeting, giving their opinion at the meeting. During the fieldwork, many local people failed to mention or identify the name of the CBOs. However, in the case of Potiya, many ordinary people have been able to identify the presence of CCCs and YES. Many citizens evaluate their role positively. What it suggests is that TIB succeeded to bring anti-corruption movement in Bangladesh at the rural areas and create a foundation where people can raise their voice. Also, one of the anti-corruption officials at the regional level expresses that TIB has been doing an excellent job to create

awareness at many schools through CCCs and YES Group. They provide funding to those schools regularly and promote organising awareness activities (personal communication, October 26, 2015).

The question is, do these activities make any difference? Are these CCCs and YES activities able to make any more significant impact on society regarding combating corruption? As an answer, the process of the social movement of TIB via engaging citizens can be termed as “tortoise movement.”

No doubt, the different types of activities these organisations generally have created a foundation of awareness among people regarding various kinds of public service. These awareness activities are explaining the general people about their rights and what will they get without any cost ( personal communication, December 5, 2015). For example; from AI Desk, people get information and advocacy to get the proper information in any services which set up people to raise their voice. Thus, the efforts CCCs and YES members are putting as a watchdog body; people are occasionally benefitted.

Organising frequent seminar, workshop, rallies, etc. also prove the existence of the organisation and create a mindset among many stakeholders. For example, the Integrity Pledge (Anti-Corruption Oath) taking at school level create a positive mindset among school students to hate corruption. At the same time, when a new YES member or CCCs members are included, they must take the oath, and it creates a sense of anti-corruption mindset among them. Thus, such oath-taking activities will inspire school-going children to hate corruption. Similarly, the members from YES who are students also involved in these types of movement. They started to hate corruption mentally and become more ‘active citizens’ while they are participating in those activities. Regarding the involvement, one CCCs president thinks that it is not about financial benefits, it is about mental satisfaction, and it improves social values and mindset. So involving such organisation always helps to maintain appearance, approaches, and attitudes and most importantly, it keeps people away from corruption (personal communication, December 6, 2015).

So, the activities like ‘raising awareness,’ ‘social movement,’ and making mass people ‘active citizen’ are creating “tortoise movement”.

The word ‘tortoise’ is used to mean slow and steady. It suggests that TIB supported activities are gaining slow and steady progress but making microscopic ‘impact’ regarding corruption prevention due to their isomorphic approach. It also suggests that it is slowly and steadily creating awareness among citizens which cannot be seen with blank eyes. Ultimately it is creating ‘moral foundation’ for many stakeholders through their campaign. According to one academic:

*It is vital to arrange activities like rally, media report, seminars, etc. to keep citizens awake and prove the existence of an organisation. Both TIB and CCCs were able to do that with few limitations. Such activities will create resistance and people will be aware of doing corruption. So, it is ultimately building a strong base for the future generation to raise their voice (personal communication, December 5, 2015).*

As a part of their activities, CCCs members made frequent conversation with Upazilla chairpersons and counsellors regarding public service delivery. They place citizens charters in hospitals and local government offices to reveal what kind of services are available and how much required for the services. While explaining, CCCs president gives a detailed idea about the whole process in the case of creating awareness and minimise the gaps in the public hospital under the following words;

*In public hospitals, the members of CCCs and YES consult with the doctors and the service recipient or the patients to find the actual problems. Service recipient’s share the problems they face, and the CCCs members organise an open discussion on those facts. Members from civil society are also participating in the dialogue. The goal of these types of activities is not to ashamed the doctors. Instead, it encourages them and helps them to develop the quality of the service. Such types of effort have made few changes as doctors were not aware of their office hours. When things are coming within a routine, they are gradually moving away from that position. They are trying to maintain time regularly (personal communication, December 13, 2015).*

Moreover, citizens charter also helps to identify consultants and their expertise. These consultants oversee different rooms. As a result,



patients can find them out, and they cannot ignore them (personal communication, December 6, 2015). Similarly, mother gathering is also doing a tremendous job to create a foundation of future generation regarding awareness campaign. Thus, it can be termed as “tortoise movement” as may be after fifty or sixty years’ things will be change and people will stop corruption by raising the voice.

Nevertheless, considering the present situation, this awareness campaign does not have any direct impact on preventing corruption. People involved with corruption gain benefits and take all. At the same time, the cultural setting of Bangladesh also heavily permits people to engage in corruption (Sakib, 2019). Thus, the other side of “tortoise movement” is dark because slow and steady movement like raising awareness does not always help in combating corruption. In other words, the activities that have been operated by TIB and with the help of CCCs and YES make a tiny contribution regarding ‘direct benefits’ or ‘problem-solving’. At the same time, people face the corruption situation in their public life. For example, there is a CC in every land office to know which services take how much money. However, when they try to get the services, they had to pay extra money either to the broker or officials. Thus, awareness does not always become successful in combatting corruption. As the Bangladeshi citizens are playing ‘dual role’ regarding reporting and resisting corruption; such awareness campaign does not prove to be an active element while the situation demands (Sakib, 2019).

### **11. Key Challenges of “Tortoise Movement”**

This paper has identified the following factors that pave the way of isomorphic process and create hindrance for long term sustainable solution and remained as “tortoise movement”;

**Resource Dependence:** The donor's driven approach of creating awareness has resource dependence throughout the working process. Fernandez (2008) argues that organisations are driven to compliance with material resources (money, human resources), information, and social or political support. The survival of the organisation depends on managing the stream of supplies, autonomy and external groups. The concentration and provided resource importance increase the dependencies. Thus the

organisation faces more significant constraining influences from their environment if they depend heavily on one or very few resource providers (Verbruggen, Christiaens, & Milis, 2011). TIB is not an exception to this. TIB supports all the activities produced by CCCs and YES, and they provide technical and financial assistance. Thus, these CCCs and YES have to follow the procedure of the TIB and follow the prescribed format. Most of the cases, they must follow the orders from high command. Because they do not have an extra budget and way of generating funds for their activity's additional activities. Sometimes, members of the CCCs and YES made a voluntary contribution, but that does not prove enough in most of the cases. According to one interviewee, due to resource dependence, these committees cannot operate their awareness activities (personal communication, November 13, 2015).

Most importantly, now a day's free labours are not available all the time (personal communication, December 5, 2015). Funding dependency in most of the cases sloth the progress of an organisation, and this could happen anytime in the cases CCCs and YES. For example; if donors decided to stop funding such activities, then the future of these organisations will be uncertain. Resource dependence will make the entire process uncertain as it was not built through a bottom-up approach (not initiated by the local people; instead, the donors and TIB launched the program and formed these committees).

**Failure to Involve People with Real Enthusiasm:** TIB's civic engagement of anti-corruption movement failed to engage people with genuine enthusiasm (personal communication, November 22, 2015). Despite the fact that both CCCs and YES individuals are dynamic, discoveries recommend that scarcely just a couple of mass individuals participate in those exercises (personal communication, January 28, 2016). People who draw in and bolster those exercises are generally the individuals and staffs. Probably the best example is the Anti-Corruption Day - 2015, where just 50-70 individuals were available in the anti-corruption human chain. The human chain was sorted out at the heart

---

<sup>4</sup> Participant observation at the Anti-Corruption Day human chain organized by TIB at the University of Dhaka on December 9th, 2015.

of Dhaka University. Among them, a large portion of the individuals are TIB staff and different visitors<sup>4</sup>. That incident suggests that they failed to engage in anti-corruption efforts with real enthusiasm. Despite being a lot of media attention and daily news coverage and various activities on a special occasion, most of the people were not familiar with TIB activities. It is mainly happening for two reasons. First, NGOs are not treated well by the Bangladeshi community, as most of them are involved in the micro-credit program. Secondly; the middle-class in the Bangladeshi society is not growing that much, and most of them were not involved in TIB activities with passion. This is opposite in the case of Delhi, where Parivartan (Change) was successful.

**Limiting in less vulnerable issues:** These organisations are more involved in the awareness campaign and limiting in less sensitive issues like education, health and occasionally in local government. Recently they are working in the land sector as a pilot project. They are not involved in areas like law-enforcement and judiciary. Regarding this issue, one of the CCCs presidents mention that:

*They cannot work sensitive issues directly as they [those sectors officials] do not want to share classified information. At the same time, local authorities do want to allow these sorts of cases. Thus it is hard to work correctly from the outside (personal communication, December 5, 2015).*

Even if they involved in that sector, their contribution regarding direct benefits is very minimum. For example; there is still massive corruption in the education sector in recruitment, stealing sub-scholarship money by the schoolteachers; doctors were not present in their duty station most of the time, there are not enough medicine and facilities in government hospitals. Even if there is CC, people must pay the bribe to get certain services from land offices, hospitals, etc. Thus, on the more significant aspect, their social movement is limiting in a “tortoise movement”.

**Grouping within and outside committee:** As per the guidelines of the CCCs people with any political affiliation cannot be involved with such organisations. However, these CCCs face tremendous pressure from the local political group. According to one interviewee, these committees at

the local level have severe grouping against one another. It happens while they go and create a committee in one place. During that time, a group of people enters those panels and try to ruin everything. Although TIB does not want such people in their committees, they have to include people based on political patronage. When such kind of people enters into the committees, they damage the entire efforts of corruption prevention (personal communication, December 7).

**Lack of support from other stakeholders:** Along with grouping, there is a lack of support from the different stakeholders. According to one CCCs president, both political personnel and government is a big problem for these CCCs to work appropriately. Sometimes local people do not take these organisations easily (personal communication, September 16, 2015). These types of activities need government and local political support to make volunteerism successful. However, in the case of these CCCs, there is a negative mindset from the political parties and government employees. One of the best examples of a lack of support from political parties and government is when TIB commented on the present parliament in 2015. TIB's criticism also affects the relationship between the ACC and TIB. Both were agreed to observed Anti-Corruption Day rally together. Nevertheless, after the comment against the government, the ACC did not observe the day with TIB.

Similarly, in the cases of CCCs and YES at the local level, they find it very hard to get support from the local politicians and government employees. As another CBO leader mentioned, some staff do not like their work and do not participate with them. Occasionally, they also reject their work( personal communication, December 6, 2015). Considering the social context of Bangladesh, citizens sometimes mislead the function of CCCs as most of the NGOs are treated not very warmly at the local level. Thus, these organisations also found a lack of support, especially from the lower and upper class of the society (personal communication, January 28, 2016). It is also linked with 'dual role' citizens as they become a part of the corruption when it is necessary.

**Spending less time:** Volunteerism needs expanded time, and with regards to against corruption. The assignment is a lot of troublesome as on account of CCCs and YES individuals unfit to give continuous time in

the anti-corruption movement. As per one CCCs president, it gets hard for the individuals to give fitting time as the vast majority of the individuals of the CCCs are engaged with some other calling. There are lacking regarding giving time to such activities. In this way time a noteworthy factor in volunteerism (personal communication, April 2, 2016).

## 12. Conclusion

Applying 'force' and 'copying' things from the developed world and using in developing countries does not always prove to be a useful process. Especially in anti-corruption, it is unlikely to have success. In the case of Bangladesh, corruption prevention needs a better framework, somewhat not just limiting those non-government initiatives driven by TIB or donors. It is mainly because of the 'dual role' of Bangladeshi citizens as they hate corruption in one hand and on the contrary, they accept and are involved in corruption whenever it gets the opportunity. That is also linked with the patron-client relationship, which shapes the politics, economy, and society (Khan, 1998). It is tough to break the link, especially for organisations like TIB as they are treated as an NGO and do not have a healthy relationship with the government. In addition, a functioning anti-corruption movement needs successful laws with legitimate authorization. Subsequently, community movement against corruption in Bangladesh generally relies upon the altruism of the party in power. On the off chance that the decision party in power stresses hostile to corruption, at that point such an isomorphic procedure of against corruption activities will liable to be dynamic and assume rotate job and make much 'direct effect' in fighting corruption.

There is no doubt that TIB's initiatives of forming these groups in the local areas have opened a new arena for mass people to be involved in the social movement against corruption in Bangladesh. Their movement not only aware local people to gain their right, but creating future leadership (Mahjabeen & Marinova, 2015). If the challenges mentioned above are taken care of properly, the 'tortoise movement' might become more promising and more efficient along with other types of community movement against corruption. Also, the sustainability and effectiveness of such citizens' engagement campaign may be more effective if they empower citizens at the grassroots level. In that case, spontaneous participation may be a better option rather than an isomorphic approach which is making more 'direct impact' in combating corruption. That largely

depends on a friendly relationship between government and TIB (both need each other to fight corruption) to create a better framework to gather spontaneous movement into an organised, precise movement through the inclusion of different people at the grassroots level in Bangladesh.

### 13. Conflict of interest

The author declares that there is no conflict of interest.

### References

Achwan, R & Ganie-Rochman, M 2009, 'Civic organisations and governance reform in Indonesian cities', *Asian Journal of Social Science*, vol. 37, no. 5, pp. 799-820.

Chang, YY, Mellahi, K & Wilkinson, A 2009, 'Control of subsidiaries of MNCs from emerging economies in developed countries: the case of Taiwanese MNCs in the UK', *The International Journal of Human Resource Management*, vol.20, no. 1, pp. 75-95.

Chechetto-Salles, M & Geyer, Y 2006, 'Community-based organisation management'.

Pretoria, South Africa: U.S. Agency for International Development (USAID), Retrieved from [http://commdev.org/userfiles/files/1625\\_file\\_Manage\\_20Book1.pdf](http://commdev.org/userfiles/files/1625_file_Manage_20Book1.pdf)

Creswell, JW 2012, *Qualitative Inquiry and Research Design: Choosing among Five Approaches*, Thousand Oaks, CA: SAGE publications.

DiMaggio, PJ Powell, WW 1983, 'The iron cage revisited: institutional isomorphism and collective rationality in organizational fields', *American Sociological Review*, vol. 48, no. 2, pp. 147-160. doi:10.2307/2095101

DiMaggio, PJ & Powell, WW 2000, 'The iron cage revisited institutional isomorphism and collective rationality in organizational fields', In Baum, J.A.C. and Dobbin, F. (Eds.) *Economics Meets Sociology in Strategic Management (Advances in Strategic Management, Vol. 17)*, UK: Emerald Group Publishing Limited, Bingley, pp. 143-166. [https://doi.org/10.1016/S0742-3322\(00\)17011-1](https://doi.org/10.1016/S0742-3322(00)17011-1)

Fernandez, JJ 2008, 'Causes of dissolution among Spanish nonprofit associations', *Nonprofit and Voluntary Sector Quarterly*, vol. 37, no. 1, pp. 113-137.

Fisher, R 1994, *Let the People Decide: Neighborhood Organizing in America*. USA: Twayne Publication.

Halperin, S & Heath O 2012, *Political Research: Methods and Practical Skills*. UK: Oxford University Press.

Hannan, MT & Freeman, J 1977, 'The population ecology of organizations', *American Journal of Sociology*, vol. 82, no. 5, pp. 929-964.

Haveman, HA 1993, 'Follow the leader: mimetic isomorphism and entry into new markets', *Administrative Science Quarterly*, vol. 38, no. 4, pp. 593-627.

Hawley, A 1968, *Human Ecology*, In Sills, D. L. (Ed.), *International Encyclopedia of the Social Sciences*, New York: Mancomillan, pp. 328-33.

Jennings, J 2005, 'Community based organizations and the non-profit sector in Massachusetts: Where do we go from here?' Massachusetts: Tufts University. Retrieved from <http://omega.cc.umb.edu/~pubpol/documents/Jennings.pdf>

Khan, MH 1998, 'The role of civil society and patron-client networks in the analysis of corruption', In OECD/UNDP (Ed.), *Corruption and Integrity Improvement Initiatives in Developing Countries*, New York: United Nations Development Programme, Management Development and Governance Division, pp. 111-127.

Mahjabeen, T & Marinova, D 2015, 'Generating leadership through anti-corruption social movement: the case of Transparency International Bangladesh'. In *Proceedings of the 3rd International Conference on Management, Leadership and Governance (ICMLG)*, Kidmore End, UK: Academic Conferences International Limited (ACAD), pp. 308-315.

Mansuri, G & Rao, V 2004, 'Community-based and-driven development: a critical review', *The World Bank Research Observer*, vol. 19, no. 1, pp. 39.

March, JG 1981, 'Decisions in organizations and theories of choice', In Joyce, W. F., & Van de Ven, A. H. (Eds.), *Perspectives on Organization Design and Behavior*, New York: Wiley, pp. 205-244.

Meyer, JW & Rowan, B 1977, 'Institutionalized organizations: formal structure as myth and ceremony', *American Journal of Sociology*, vol. 83, no. 2, pp. 340-363.

Mizruchi, MS & Fein, LC 1999, 'The social construction of organizational

knowledge: a study of the uses of coercive, mimetic, and normative isomorphism', *Administrative Science Quarterly*, vol. 44, no. 4, pp. 653-683.

Murphy, D 1990, 'Community organization. *Environment and Urbanization*, vol. 2, no. 1, pp. 51-60.

Park, S 2014, 'Institutional isomorphism and the Asian Development Bank's accountability mechanism: something old, something new; something borrowed, something blue?', *The Pacific Review*, vol. 27, no. 2, pp. 217-239.

Pfeffer, J & Salancik, GR 2003, *The External Control of Organizations: A Resource Dependence Perspective*. Stanford, California: Stanford Business Books.

Pope, J 2000, *Confronting Corruption: The Elements of a National Integrity System*. Berlin: Transparency International.

Read, BL & Pekkanen, R (Eds.) 2009, *Local Organizations and Urban Governance in East and Southeast Asia: Straddling State and Society*. Milton Park, Abingdon, Oxon, New York: Routledge.

Sakib, NH 2019, 'One size does not fit all: an analysis of the corruption preventative approach of the Anti-Corruption Commission (ACC) in Bangladesh', *Asian Journal of Political Science*, vol. 27, no. 2, pp. 211-234.

Sakib, NH 2019, 'Understanding Cultural Causes of Corruption: The Case of Bangladesh', *International Journal of Research and Innovation in Social Science*, vol. 3, no. 5, pp. 359-368.

Sakib, NH 2020, 'Role of community-based organisation to combat corruption', In: Farazmand A. (Eds) *Global Encyclopedia of Public Administration, Public Policy, and Governance*. Springer: Cham. DOI: [https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-319-31816-5\\_3933-1](https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-319-31816-5_3933-1)

Scott, WR 1995, *Institutions and Organizations. Foundations for Organizational Science*, London: A Sage Publication Series.

The World Bank Institute (WBI) 2002, 'Youth for good governance learning program', Retrieved from <http://www.worldbank.org/wbi/governance/youth>

Thompson, MP 2013, 'Sustainability of community-based organizations in Bangladesh', *Society & Natural Resources: An International Journal*, vol. 26, no. 7, pp. 778-794.



Transparency International Bangladesh (TIB) 2014, Building Integrity Blocks for Effective Change (BIBEC), Dhaka: Author. Retrieved from [https://www.ti-bangladesh.org/beta3/images/2014/project\\_proposal\\_bibec\\_14\\_en.pdf](https://www.ti-bangladesh.org/beta3/images/2014/project_proposal_bibec_14_en.pdf)

Transparency International Bangladesh (TIB) 2012, 'Committees of Concerned Citizens (CCCs)', Dhaka: Author. Retrieved from <http://www.ti-bangladesh.org/beta3/index.php/en/about-us/what-we-do/engaging-people/committee-of-concerned-citizens>

Transparency International Bangladesh (TIB) 2016a, *Various types of activities of CCC and YES Groups from 2012 to present*. Dhaka: Transparency International Bangladesh.

Transparency International Bangladesh (TIB) 2016b, 'What we do', Retrieved from

<https://www.ti-bangladesh.org/beta3/index.php/en/about-us/what-we-do/outreach-communication/ai-desk>

Verbruggen, S, Christiaens, J & Milis, K 2011, 'Can resource dependence and coercive isomorphism explain nonprofit organizations' compliance with reporting standards?', *Nonprofit and Voluntary Sector Quarterly*, vol. 40, no. 1, pp. 5-32.

Waheduzzaman, W & As-Saber, S 2015, 'Community participation and local governance in Bangladesh', *Australian Journal of Political Science*, vol. 50, no. 1, pp. 128-147.

Walker, ET & McCarthy, JD 2010, 'Legitimacy, strategy, and resources in the survival of community-based organizations', *Social Problems*, vol. 57, no 3, pp. 315-340.

Walls, D 2015, *Community Organizing*, UK: Polity Press.

Webb, M 2012, 'Activating citizens, remaking brokerage: transparency activism, ethical scenes, and the urban poor in Delhi', *PoLAR: Political and Legal Anthropology Review*, vol. 35, no. 2, pp. 206-222.

Yazdifar, H, Zaman, M, Tsamenyi, M & Askarany, D 2008, 'Management accounting change in a subsidiary organisation', *Critical Perspectives on Accounting*, vol. 19, no. 3, pp. 404-430.

