

STRATEGIES FOR RATIONALIZING PUBLIC SECTOR HUMAN RESOURCES

MD. SHIRAJUL ISLAM
Director (Management)

BANGLADESH PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION TRAINING CENTRE
SAVAR, DHAKA
JULY 2001

Strategies for Rationalizing Public Sector Human Resources

Table of Contents

Acronyms and Glossary	1
Preface	11
Abstract	111
1.0 INTRODUCTION	
1 1 Development Paradigm and the Public Sector Human Resources	1
1 2 Objectives of the Study	5
1 3 Methodology	5
1 4 Scope and Limitations	6
2.0 EMPIRICAL RESULTS	
2.1 Leadership Aspirations	7
2 2 Academic Standing of Respondents	8
2 3 Pay Roll Prices	9
2 4 Take Home Pay and Maintenance	11
2 5 Agriculture Productivity Improvement Potentials	12
2 6 HR Readjustment Options	13
2 7 Terms of Rural Placement	15
2 8 Commitment in Rural Development	16
2 9 Alternate Use of Respondent's Current Skills	17
2 10 Retirement Options	19
2 11 Retirement and Rural Nostalgia	22
2.12 Respondent's Awareness of HR Rationalization	23
2 13 Emerging Human Resource Development Needs	24
3.0 RECOMMENDATIONS AND CONCLUSION	
3 1 Recommendations	26
3 2 Conclusion	29
APPENDICES	
1 Questionnaire	30
2 References	35

ACCRONYMS

BPATC	=	Bangladesh Public Administration Training Centre
HR	=	Human Resource (s)
HRR	=	Human Resource Rationalization

GLOSSARY

Public Sector Human Resources means people who are in the regular employment of public sector organization

Public Sector Organizations are those organizations or institutions owned and management by government out of revenue funds and usually cover government, semi-government, autonomous organizations, corporations and state owned enterprises.

Strategy (ies) means planned and employee-centred response in rationalizing, adjusting or readjusting surplus human resources in other sectors of economy. This, in fact, is a means to an ends, option (s) to meet desired objects.

Preface

Government-led development philosophies after the World War-II, paternalistic attitude of the most developing nations to take lead role in development characterized by archaic administrative systems and structure, low managerial capacity significantly contributed to the unplanned growth of public bureaucracy and human resource employment. Globalized market, open market competition, citizen awareness and rising expectations forced many governments to rethink, reinvent and redefine their roles and restructure, down-size or right-size their human resources. Developed countries, somehow, could manage these challenges. Unfortunately, developing nations like Bangladesh is yet to achieve this ends. Golden handshake and other severance formulas offered by the government of Bangladesh produced insignificant tangible results leaving the process to the natural courses of actions. Thus, this study aims at exploring option(s) for effective public sector human resource rationalization. The study results reinvented innumerable options for such rationalization with potential benefits in terms of revenue saving and improved agriculture productivity.

The first chapter explicitly deals with development philosophies, size of the government and service standards, severance formulas of some selected countries, research objectives and other methodological aspects while the chapter two presented and analyzed empirical data. Chapter three finishes up with recommendations. Chapter four lists questionnaire and other appendices.

Expenses for this research study were met from the exchequer of the Bangladesh Public Administration Training centre. We are indebted to the former Rector Dr. Ekram Hossain and the current Rector Dr. Kshanada Mohan Das for their approval and support to carry out the research work. Member, Directing Staff (Research & Consultancy) Mr. Md. Abdur Razzaque and his officers and staff were involved in processing the research project. Mr. S. M. Zobayer Enamul Karim, (Senior Research Officer) who, as a Research Associate of the project helped me in data collection. I express my gratitude to all of them. Mr. Ram Krishna Gour performed the most arduous job in giving this paper a beautiful shape. I am also thankful to him. Many other officers and staff, directly or indirectly, assisted in preparing this report. It is not possible to name all of them but I pay my regards to all of them.

MD. SHIRAJUL ISLAM

Strategies for Rationalizing Public Sector Human Resources

Abstract

Over the last several decades, world has visualized diverse development paradigms. Trickle-down theory, redistributive growth, capacity building, social justice, empowerment, poverty alleviation, sustainability and other development philosophies influenced developing nations to undertake development projects and to take lead role in business. Socialistic vision after independence of Bangladesh, welfarism, public good policy combined with political influence in public enterprises, low managerial capacity in human resource planning and other indiscrete processes resulted mushroom growth of public bureaucracy and wasteful employment. Tall hierarchy, archaic procedures, obsolete technology and organization culture, corruption, lack of transparency, commitment and accountability and other bureaucratic dysfunctions increased costs and lowered service quality.

Industrialized and developed countries have successfully implemented human resource rationalization scheme popularly termed as 'down or right sizing or 'managing redundancy'. Unfortunately, the human resource rationalization program like "Golden Handshake" and other severance formula offered by the government of Bangladesh produced insignificant tangible results leaving the process to the natural courses of actions. To overcome this plateauing conditions, the study aims at reinventing realistic and workable options for human resource rationalization.

The research results establish wider scopes for human resource rationalization in the form of human resource readjustment and retirement with supporting strivings and commitment in rural development. The readjustment process unfolds innumerable HRR options like inter-agency transfer or secondment with attractive job title, powers and freedom of work, potential annual revenue saving and/or income of over taka 1100 crore, alternate use of respondent's skills and competence with concurrent training needs. The retirement options enlists, among other things, average monthly compensation package of 3.25 month's basic salary for each completed year's of service, lump grants of taka 6.5 lakh per person, voluntary retirement after 50 years of age, administrative and credit supports and other related issues. Major recommendations emanate from the findings include: reformulating human resource rationalization philosophy, inter-agency transfer or secondment with attractive job title, preferably at home district/upazila/union/village including secondment in development projects, police, answar and VDP, educational institutions and other private and NGO sectors, abolish surplus non-technical posts, freeze recruitment and stop contractual appointment, redesign development-led flat and flexible structure with multiple coordination links for union parishad and other public bureaucracy, redefine roles and functions, design and organize need-based training programs by transferred subjects officials of upazila administration, provide full pension benefits upon completion of 20 years of service or attaining 50 years of age, establish a cell or a bank for giving one-stop administrative and credit support to retired officials for business, modify land purchase and house building advance rules to provide cheaper credit for village homes. The options reinvented in this paper would enable policy makers in managing redundancy effectively.

Strategies for Rationalizing Public Sector Human Resources

1.0 INTRODUCTION

1.1 Development Paradigm and the Public Sector Human Resources

Development philosophies of absolute growth during 1950s and 1960s influenced most developing nations to undertake development projects and to take lead role in business. EPIDC (during Pakistan) was founded to set-up industries and motivate private entrepreneurs to undertake ownership. Heavy industries, in most cases, remained in government. Redistributive growth model focusing empowerment, capacity building, social justice, poverty alleviation and other pro-poor philosophies significantly augmented government's role resulting more institutions and human resource employment. After independence of Bangladesh in 1971, taking over of abandoned industries with socialistic vision also increased government's role significantly. Commercial operations was legitimized with the promotional and regulatory functions of the government. A study by the World Bank notes mushroom growth (Table-1) of public service particularly at Class III and IV levels. The study (1996:113) reports that ... Although the ratio of Class I/II staff, as percentage of total staff, has increased from 5% in 1971 to 12% in 1992; in absolute terms about 80% of the increase in staff over the last two decades has been on account of Class III/IV employees, who have little substantive contribution to handling of state functions. The report (1996:132) blames donors for the expansion of the bureaucracy. The report (1996:132) explains that ... 20 per cent of civil servants are hired under the Development Budget (and are largely uncounted). To a considerable degree donors must share the blame for creating this bureaucracy as a requirement for project aid.

Table-1
Employment Growth in the Civil Service

Class	1971	1982	1986	1992	1997
I	11,130	56,100	60,106	78,685	87,669
II	12,320	187,700	32,042	36,858	43,731
III	245,500	308,700	594,300	579,842	597,195
IV	185,500	226,500	386,406	251,364	201,796
Total	454,450	770,000	1072,854	946,749	930,391

- Source
- 1) The World Bank, Bangladesh (1996), Government That Works Reforming the Public Sector, Dhaka The University Press Limited
 - 2) Government of the People's Republic of Bangladesh, Ministry of Establishment (1997), Statistics of Civil Officers and Staff of the Government of the People's Republic of Bangladesh

The developed and the industrialized nations are also not free from the problem of over staffing. Tanzi and Schuknecht (1996:2) certify that.. Over the past century, the size of government in industrial countries has expanded rapidly. In recent decades, this expansion was caused largely by expenditures normally associated with the “welfare state”(Tanzi and Schuknecht 1996:2) The post-World War II period, and particularly the period between 1960 and 1980, saw an unprecedented enthusiasm for activist expenditure policies. Various factors-such as Keynesian economics, the challenge of socialism, and the theory of public goods and externalities-contributed to this development (Tanzi and Schuknecht 1996:2). All these development paradigms stimulated wasteful employment and increased public expenditure with lower socio-economic returns. Table-2 reveal that ... countries with small governments show favorable social indicators in spite of low public spending. (Tanzi and Schuknecht 1996:3). Bryant and White (1982 : 29-30) viewed that the symptoms of administrative incapacity ... would be less deeply worrisome if the public sector were relatively small, or if the private sector were flourishing and dynamic. Thus, downsizing or rightsizing of public sector human resources has become urgent agenda of concern for all nations.

Table-2
Size of government and government performance

	Industrial countries						Newly Industria- lized countries ⁴
	“Big” governments ¹		“Medium-sized” governments ²		“Small” governments ³		
	1960	1990	1960	1990	1960	1990	
Economic and regulatory efficiency indicators :							
Real GDP growth (in percent) ⁵	3.2	2.6	4.0	3.3	4.6	3.3	6.2
Gross fixed capital formation (in percent of GDP)	23.4	20.5	21.1	21.3	19.6	20.7	31.2
Inflation (in percent)	1.7	5.4	1.6	4.3	2.3	6.1	15.3
Unemployment rate (in percent)	2.9	6.1	4.6	9.2	2.7	4.2	2.9

¹ Belgium, Italy, the Netherlands, Norway, Sweden (public expenditure more than 50 percent of GDP in 1990)

² Australia, Canada, France, Germany, Ireland, New Zealand, Spain (Public expenditure between 40 and 50 percent of GDP in 1990)

³ Australia, Japan, Switzerland, the United Kingdom, the United States (public expenditure less than 40 percent of GDP in 1990)

⁴ Chile, Hong Kong, Korea, Singapore

⁵ Average of preceding five years 1956-60 to or 1986-90

Size of shadow economy (in percent of GDP) ⁶	4.9	11.1	3.8	8.2	3.5	6.2	.
Patents /10,000 population (inventiveness coefficient)	.	2.0	..	2.3	..	8.6	.
Social indicators :							
Rank in UN human development ⁷		11.0	.	13.0	.	6.0	..
Income share of lowest 40 percent	15.6	24.1	16.4	21.6	17.4	20.8	17.0
Illiterate population as percent of population over 15 years old	9.3	2.9	13.3	4.6	2.2	0.5 ⁸	9.2
Secondary school enrollment (in percent)	55.0	93.0	51.0	99.0	61.0	89.0	81.0
Life expectancy	72.0	77.0	70.0	77.0	71.0	77.0	74.0
Infant mortality/1,000 births	23.0	6.7	29.0	7.1	22.4	6.4	9.8
Prisoners/ 100,000 people	..	38.0	...	68.0	...	154.0 ⁹	...
Divorces (in percent of marriages contracted, 1987-91)	..	33.0	...	33.0	...	36.0	...
Emigration (in percent of total population) ¹⁰	0.6	0.2	0.3	0.8	0.2	0.1	0.1

Source Organization for Economic Cooperation and Development 1995, Main Science and Technology indicators, OECD, 1994 Trends in international Migration, Annual Report, World Bank, 1993,1994, Social Indicators of Development, United Nations, 1994, Human Development Report, Brian Mitchell, International Historical Statistics, various issues; Hannelore-Weck-Hannemann, Werner Pommerehne, and Bruno Frey, 1984, Schattenwirtschaft Table-7, p 67, IMF, Government Finance Statistics Yearbook various issues, IMF, International Financial Statistics, various issues.

In a developing country like Bangladesh, the scenario is more gloomy. Tall hierarchy, lengthy and archaic procedures, traditional organizational culture, obsolete technology, corruption, lack of transparency, commitment and accountability and other undesirable strivings have contributed to the increased costs, inefficient resource use and worse service standards. The World Bank's study report (1996:116) prove that

⁶ Most recent data available are for 1978, shown in 1990 column
⁷ 1972

⁸ United States only Others below 5 percent, United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization Statistics.

⁹ Excluding United States, average is 64

¹⁰ Data available for 1970 (shown in 1960 column data the 1990 may include 1993 data for some countries For the newly industrialized countries data are available only for Korea (1990).

Indicates data not available

Bangladesh's government expenditure on wages and salaries in comparison to Singapore, Korea, Chile are higher (Table-3) while the productivity of public administration is much lower. This indicates that Bangladeshi taxpayers get much worse standards of service (The World Bank 1996:116)

Table-3
Cross Country Comparison

Countries	Wages as % GDP	Wages as % of Recurrent Expenditures (excl. interest payments)
Bangladesh	4	45
Singapore	6	41
Korea	5	27
Chile	5	21

Source : The World Bank, Bangladesh (1996), Government That Works Reforming the Public Sector, Dhaka The University Press Limited

The process of Bangladesh public sector human resource rationalization began in 1990 popularly known as "Golden Handshake". Under the program, Bangladesh could retrench ... some 23,000 workers without any major political upheaval (The World Bank 1996:132) The severance formulas of the government of Bangladesh, though generous (Table-4) than other Asia, Africa and Latin American countries, did not produce any significant tangible results. The process of rationalization of human resources left to the natural courses of actions of not filling the vacant positions. This policy is politically safer at the cost of future development and employment creation.

Table-4
Severance Formulas in Selected Countries

Country	Formula
<u>Asia</u> Bangladesh	2 month's basic salary for each year of service and additional gratuity payments deposited as contribution (worker/employer).
Pakistan	One month's basic salary with all benefits and four months' basic salary for each year of service.
India	1.5 months' basic salary and dearness allowance for each year of service.
Laos	One year's salary.
Sri Lanka	Employment guaranteed up to the age of 55, even when enterprises are privatized. Retrenchment is on selective basis and has no standard formula. The recent maximum compensation paid to the leather workers was Rs 200,000.
<u>Latin America</u> Argentina	Varies, but on average provides 75% of basic salary for six months, followed by severance payment averaging US\$ 3,000 (depending on years of service), which is paid in six installments.

Africa Central African Republic	Forty months' salary and the employees' accumulated pension fund contribution.
Gambia	1.2 months' salary per year of service
Ghana	Four months' basic salary, plus two months basic salary per year of service.
Guinea	Flat amount equal to about five years' basic salary for the average worker, with 30 percent paid up front and the balance paid in twenty monthly installments.
Guinea Bissau	One year's salary paid in monthly installments.

Source The World Bank, Bangladesh (1996 : 134). Government That Works . Reforming the Public Sector, Dhaka The University Press Limited

Considering the realities and the stagnancy conditions in public sector human resource rationalization., there is a need to explore creative options for rightsizing and readjustment of public sector human resources securing opinion of the relevant stakeholders.

1.2 Objective of the Study

The study aims at achieving following core objectives :

- ❑ to reinvent options for adjustment of surplus public sector human resources;
- ❑ to determine compensation package for voluntary retirement; and
- ❑ to recommend actions for rationalization of public sector human resources.

1.3 Methodology

The research study, exploratory in nature, is founded on both primary and secondary sources of data. However, major segment of the study report represent primary source. In primary source, structured questionnaire (Appendix-I) were used. Interviewing and other face-to-face data collection methods were discouraged in order to allow respondents to express their opinion freely and independently.

Considering the level of respondents, the questionnaire was designed in Bengali with mostly close ended questions. Limited open-ended questions were also set to supplement or reinforce the close-ended questions and to secure creative opinion of the respondents. Secondary source, though covers, small portion of the study report is no less important than the primary source. In fact, the research model, conceptual and analytical framework are built on the secondary source. Literature reviewed in this respect is documented in Appendix-2. Respondents, 103 in number (Table-5), were selected on random sampling basis. Out of the total sample, 63 (61 percent) are class-III while class-IV represents 39 percent (40).

1.4 Scope and Limitations

Contemporary administrative reform study reports do not appreciate the role and contributions of class -III and class-IV employees or human resources in national development. Their contributions have been ranked as little or not substantive in public bureaucracy. The study, thus, exclusively concentrates on these respondent groups to explore options whether their services can be better utilized in other socio-economic sector and/or whether they would opt for early retirement. To establish this hypothesis, class-III and class-IV employees working at national level in ministries, divisions, directorates, corporations and other public sector organizations were included. Major variables centred around the study are listed below .

General Variables	Specific Variables
Pay Roll Price	Average emoluments, service experiences, residual services and future costs
Human Resource Readjustment Terms and Options	Inter-agency transfer or secondment in public, private NGO sector organization including Development projects, possible contribution in rural development, salary and benefits, job security, training needs alternate use of respondent's current skills and experiences
Retirement Terms and Options	Compensation package in the form of extra salary and benefits, lump grant, voluntary retirement with full pension benefits, administrative and credit support, training needs retirement age
Supportive Strivings	Academic standing, take home pay, family maintenance, settlement plan, agriculture productivity improvement potentials, leadership roles and aspirations in civil societies.

2.0 EMPIRICAL RESULTS

The research study view human resource rationalization (HRR) from two broad perspectives :

- a) Readjustment of Human Resources
- b) Downsizing or Rightsizing

The readjustment process explores diverse employee-centred participatory options aiming at better inter-institutional/ sectoral utilization of existing, human resources while the down or rightsizing sometimes termed as redundancy focuses on the determination of actual needs of human resources of an organization and seeks to achieve operating efficiency, eliminate unnecessary tasks and ensure citizen satisfaction. Usually retrenchment, voluntary retirements, early retirement, mandatory retirement, recruitment freeze and other exit or employment separation procedures are adopted.

The research study establishes wider scope for human resource rationalization. Both the readjustment and redundancy programs are implementable without much risks. The risks (political, economic, social, technological or other) usually apprehended can be effectively managed or significantly minimized if the options are realistically founded considering reasonable aspirations of the affected persons.

2.1 Leadership Aspirations

The research study is founded on 103 samples (Table-5). Out of the samples, 61 percent (63) represents class-IV while the rest (39 percent) represents class-III employees. Again, the majority (43 percent) respondent originates from corporate body followed by (31 percent) ministry/division. Directorate, however, accounts for 24 percent.

The table demonstrates executive role of the respondents in civil societies. This signifies that respondents are willing to play a leadership role in trade union, welfare and other societal institutions. Majority (68 percent) respondents have either previously held (20 percent) or currently holding (17 percent) or aspiring to hold (31 percent) executive positions in such civil societies. This reconfirms the inherent human needs for power as espoused by diverse motivation theorists. Maslow termed as "Esteem Need" while McClelland as "Need for Power" (Schermerhorn Jr et. al. 1985 : 134-137). A study by Islam and Kanka also establishes the power need of Bangladesh civil servant. The study identified "power and authority" (2000:8) as one of the major sources of motivation. Delegation of adequate powers, participation in policy/decision making process (Islam and Kanka 2000:17) have also been termed as dominant force in sustainability of motivation.

Table-5 Organizational Status and Leadership Roles in Civil Societies (Trade Union /Welfare Association)					
WORKPLACE	RESPONSE	ORGANIZA -TION STATUS	RESPONSE	EXECUTIVE POSITION IN CIVIL SOCIETIES	
				Status	Yes
Autonomous Bodies/ Corporation	41 (43)	Class-III	63 (61)	Previously Held	21 (20)
Directorate	23 (24)	Class-IV	40 (39)	Currently Holding	17 (17)
Ministry /Division	30 (31)	TOTAL :	103 (100)	Aspiring to hold in Future	32 (31)
Other	2 (2)			No	33 (32)
TOTAL :	96 (100)				

2.2 Academic Standing of Respondents

Table-6 establishes both under and over qualified academic specifications of respondents. Fifty nine percent class-IV employees are over qualified if junior secondary is viewed as usual academic specifications. Out of this job holders, 39 percent posses SSC, 15 percent HSC and 5 percent bachelor degree. There are also 8 percent respondents below the desired academic competence Out of this, 5 percent respondents have no academic background, they can sign only, while 3 percent have completed primary education only.

In case of class-III employees, desired academic specification usually ranges from SSC to HSC and in some cases up to bachelor degree. The statistics presented in the table indicate 10 percent respondents above bachelor and 40 percent above HSC degrees. However, respondents with HSC degrees are most dominant (43 percent) followed by bachelor (30 percent) degree. There are 2 percent respondents below SSC degree.

Both over and under qualifications are undesirable and frustrating. Under qualifications signals corrupt recruitment practices while poor economic conditions and limited employment opportunities forced people to accept lower employment. The mismatch between tasks and people eventually frustrates both the job holders and the supervisors producing sub-optimal or sub-standards results.

Table-6
Academic Standing

ACADEMIC STANDING	RESPONSE		
	Class-III	Class-IV	Total
Can Sign Only	0	2 (5)	2 (2)
Primary	0	1 (3)	1 (1)
Junior Secondary	1 (2)	13 (33)	14 (14)
Secondary	9 (15)	15 (39)	24 (24)
Higher Secondary	27 (43)	6 (15)	33 (32)
Bachelor	19 (30)	2 (5)	21 (21)
Master	6 (10)	0	6 (6)
Other	0	0	0
TOTAL:	62 (100)	39 (100)	101 (100)

2.3 Pay Roll Prices

Job experience and residual services (table-7) prove that respondent employees, on an average, remain in government pay roll for 35 man-years or 420 man-months. Out of these time span, respondents have already spent 12 man-years or 144 man-months leaving a mean unspent man-years of 23 or 276 man-months. This means that these respondent will remain in government payroll for at least 23 man-years or 276 man-months. The rates in case of class-III accounts for 22 man-years (264 man-months) and in case of class-IV employees accounts for 25 man-years (300 man-months).

The table reveal that majority (54 percent) respondents will remain on the government's pay roll for more than 25 years while some (2 percent) respondents are on the verge of retirement. Chances of voluntary retirement for this group are higher than those who have longer period of services. Government may identify those people and encourage them for voluntary retirement with full pension benefits and extra basic pay, if necessary.

Table-7
Experience and Residual Services

EXPERIENCE				RESIDUAL SERVICES			
Years (Inclusive Upper Limit)	Response			Response			
	Class-III	Class-VI	Total	Years (Inclusive Upper Limit)	Class-III	Class-VI	Total
1-5	14 (23)	11 (27)	25 (24)	1-5	1 (2)	1 (3)	2 (2)
5-10	12 (19)	15 (37)	27 (26)	5-10	3 (6)	1 (3)	4 (4)
10-15	14 (23)	8 (20)	22 (21)	10-15	3 (6)	1 (3)	4 (4)
15-20	8 (13)	1 (2)	9 (9)	15-20	11 ()	4 (10)	15 (16)
20-25	7 (11)	4 (10)	11 (11)	20-25	13 (25)	5 (13)	18 (20)
25-30	3 (5)	1 (2)	4 (4)	25-30	18 (35)	22 (56)	40 (45)
30-35	4 (6)	1 (2)	5 (5)	30-35	3 (6)	5 (13)	8 (9)
Total	62 (100)	41 (100)	103 (100)		52 (100)	39 (100)	91 (100)
X̄ (In Years)	13	10	12		22	25	23

PARC report (2000:58) reveal that mean monthly expenses on account of salary and allowances per position/month amounts to Taka 3800/= for class-III and Taka 2800/= for class-IV employees (Table-8). Total pay roll expenses would, thus, stands at Taka 76,861/= crore for the next 23 years or Taka 3,342/= crore per annum(both for class-III and IV employees)

Table-8
Pay Roll Investment

Category	Total Employees ¹¹	Average Cost per Position/Month (Taka) ¹²	Residual Service (In Man-Months)	Total Expenses for Residual Services (In Crore Taka)
1	2	3	4	5
III	597,195	3,800	264	59,910
IV	201,796	2,800	300	16,951
Total	798,991		564	76,861

2.4 Take Home Pay and Maintenance

Table-9 establishes that the compensation package (salary and benefits) of the government is highly inadequate. These benefits are more inadequate for cities and towns than villages. On an averages 92 percent respondents view the compensation package as little or not at all adequate for cities and towns. These rates in case of village homes accounts for 64 percent i.e. 28 percent lower than cities and towns. The table also reveals that class-IV employees are worst sufferer than class-III employees. Their compensation package in terms of 'little' or 'not at all' adequate accounts for 96 percent for cities and towns and 68 percent for village homes as against 91 percent and 61 percent respectively for class-III employees. A considerable number (36 percent) respondents view present compensation package as 'substantial' and 'more than substantial' for family maintenance at village homes as against 8 percent in cities and towns. This signifies that the respondent can lead better quality of life at villages than cities and towns with the same amount of compensation. These statistics were secured to explore positive strivings for human resource readjustment at rural villages.

¹¹ Government of the people's Republic of Bangladesh, Ministry of Establishment (1999) Statistics of Civil Officers and Staff of the Government of the People's Republic of Bangladesh.

¹² (a) PARC (2000), Public Administration for 21st Century Volumes 1, (Dhaka PARC).
(b) Notes on the basis of Pay Scale, 1997 average Pay for each class has been taken

Table-9
Adequacy of Salary and Benefits

INDICATOR	RESPONSE ON THE ADEQUACY OF SALARY AND BENEFITS FOR FAMILY MAINTENANCE IN/AT					
	CITIES/TOWNS			VILLAGE HOMES		
	Class-III	Class-IV	Total	Class-III	Class-IV	Total
Not At All	23 (37)	13 (33)	36 (35)	3 (6)	6 (15)	9 (9)
Little	33 (54)	25 (63)	58 (57)	29 (55)	21 (53)	50 (55)
Substantial	2 (3)	1 (2)	3 (3)	15 (28)	8 (20)	23 (25)
Much	0	1 (2)	1 (1)	1 (2)	1 (2)	2 (2)
Can Save	4 (6)	0	4 (4)	5 (9)	4 (10)	9 (9)
TOTAL:	62 (100)	40 (100)	102 (100)	53 (100)	40 (100)	93 (100)

2.5. Agriculture Productivity Improvement Potentials

One of the prime causes of low agriculture productivity is the absentee land owners. Land owners defected from agriculture landholdings mostly depend on sharecroppers or lessees for cultivation. Consequently the agriculture lands are likely to remain fallow or inefficiently managed. These landowners have lesser direct control over agriculture farming. These eventually contributes to low agriculture productivity.

Table-10 establishes that majority (54 percent) jobholder do not directly cultivate their lands. They are mostly (39 percent) depended on sharecroppers followed by (9 percent) fallow/irregular cultivation. Lease/ contracting out also accounts for 5 percent. The table also proves that if the respondent would live at their village home, they could raise the agriculture productivity to 1.7 times. In terms of taka amount, the mean potential annual income could be raised from taka 8000/- to taka 13,600/- or taka 5,600/- per person/annum. Total 8 lakhs class-III and class-IV employees thus could add about taka 500 crore to the national income with other indirect socio-cultural benefits.

Table-10
Land Cultivation and Land Income Pattern

LAND CULTIVATION		ANNUAL INCOME FROM LAND			
Type	Response	Current Income (In Thousand Taka – Inclusive Upper Limit)	Response	Potential Increase of Income If Lives at Village Home	Response
Share Cropping	22 (39)	No	29 (38)	At Same Level	7 (15)
Lease/Contracting Out	3 (5)	1-5	19 (25)	1.5 Times Higher	14 (30)
Self Cultivation	26 (46)	5-10	22 (29)	2 Times Higher	19 (40)
Fallow / Irregular Cultivation	5 (9)	10-15	7 (9)	3 Times Higher	6 (13)
Other	0	15 +	0	3 + Times Higher	1 (2)
TOTAL:	56 (100)	TOTAL	77 (100)		47 (100)
		$\bar{X}$ = 8 (In Thousand Taka)		$\bar{X}$ Productivity Increase = 1.7 times	

2.6 HR Readjustment Options

Human resources are most valuable resources on earth. They possess innumerable potentials. Policy makers must realize these potentials and continuously strive for exploring, developing, maintaining and utilizing these resources effectively. The policy of down-sizing and /or rightsizing seem contradictory to the 'human resources' notion rather it undermines their skills and potentials and view them as liability. Administrative reform practices in developed countries having innumerable flexibility in their economy to reemploy or readjust retrenched employees are frequently cited as classic model for developing countries are not fully relevant. Stiff resistance delays or frustrates the administrative reform process of these countries. Studies after studies were done by world reputed experts, are yet to be implemented. Government's position, to some extent, has become shaky by the downsizing or rightsizing led philosophy of administrative reform. Thus, the philosophy of the administrative reform should be shifted to "Readjustment of Human Resources or Effective Utilization of Human Resources" rather than down or rightsizing in order to restore confidence of the major stakeholders. The table-11 unveils as many as 15-16 terms and options for readjustment of public sector human resources. The terms and options cover inter-agency transfer/secondment at basic pay ranging from current basic pay to 3 times higher than current basic pay with fringe benefits and provision for job security. The statistics confirms that majority respondents services can be readjusted in other agencies with lower financial investment. Thirty-seven (37) percent respondents expressed their willingness to work in agency(ies) of their choice at a basic salary only (without any allowances). This means that government can save more than 600 crore taka per annum by not paying payment of fringe benefits. The tendency for inter-

agency readjustment, however, is more prone towards home district/ upazila/ union/ village, police, ansar and VDP and school, college and madrasa. Respondent services can also be readjusted in other sectors including NGOs, private sector, development projects at higher pay and benefits with provision for job security. Twenty four (24 percent) respondents also desire for inter-agency readjustment at basic pay and benefits This indicates wider possibility (61 percent) of inter-agency readjustment at current or lower pay and/or benefits.

Table-11
Inter-Agency Human Resource Readjustment Terms

INSTITUTION	WILLINGNESS TO WORK AT CURRENT					
	Basic Pay	Basic Pay and Fringe Benefits	Times Higher Than Current Basic pay and Fringe Benefits			Total Response
			1 5 Times	2 Times	3 Times	
Army	1 (14)	0	0	5 (72)	1 (14)	7 (100)
Autonomous Bodies / Corporation	4 (10)	7 (17)	10 (24)	16 (39)	4 (10)	41 (100)
Directorate	0	8 (50)	1 (6)	6 (38)	1 (6)	41 (100)
Development Projects:						
Government	0	0	1 (25)	2 (50)	1 (25)	16 (100)
GO-NGO Collaboration	0	0	0	3 (42)	4 (58)	7 (100)
Field Administration						
Home Division	0	1 (100)	0	0	0	
Home District	4 (29)	5 (35)	0	1 (7)	4 (29)	14 (100)
Home Upazila	7 (39)	4 (22)	1 (6)	4 (22)	2 (11)	18 (100)
Home Union	3 (60)	0	0	0	2 (40)	5 (100)
Village Home	3 (38)	1 (12)	0	0	4 (50)	8 (100)
Ministry/Division	2 (9)	9 (41)	0	5 (23)	6 (27)	22 (100)
NGO	0	0	0	0	3 (100)	3 (100)
Police, Ansar and VDP	1 (50)	0	0	0	1 (50)	2 (100)
Private Sector	0	0	5 (36)	5 (36)	4 (28)	14 (100)
School, College, Madrasa	2 (25)	2 (25)	0	2 (25)	2 (25)	8 (100)
Other	0	0	0	0	0	
TOTAL:	27 (16)	37 (22)	18 (11)	49 (29)	39 (22)	170 (100)
Respondents	17 (37)	11 (24)	1 (2)	5 (11)	12 (26)	46 (100)

Notes Multiple responses were recorded

2.7 Terms of Rural Placement

It is traditionally believed that people are unwilling to live and work at villages. Their traditional belief is rejected by the statistics presented in table 12. The table proves that opportunity to work at village home is viewed as rewarding. This assumption, on an average, is supported by 32 percent respondents. Out of these, 34 percent represent class-III and 28 percent class-IV employees. In financial terms, average 30 percent (33 percent class-III and 26 percent class-IV) respondents are, even, willing to work at lower emoluments at village homes without any fringe benefits and in 12 percent cases, at lower basic salary (50—75 percent of basic salary). This means that readjustment of human resources at village level can help government saving from Taka 50--60 crore per month or Taka 600--700 crore per annum. Attractive designations, powers and freedom of work that satisfies social, esteem and power needs as espoused by motivation theorists are still valid for the respondents. Thus, these interventions may be formalized in readjusting surplus human resources of the government to work in rural areas. Table-11 also supports this findings

Table-12
Incentives to Work at Village Home

INCENTIVES	RESPONSE		
	Class-III	Class-IV	Total
A) FINANCIAL			
☐ 50 Percent of Basic Pay	3 (6)	0	3 (4)
☐ 75 Percent of Basic Pay	3 (6)	3 (11)	6 (8)
☐ Full Basic Pay	11 (21)	4 (15)	15 (18)
☐ Basic Pay and Fringe Benefits	36 (67)	20 (74)	56 (70)
TOTAL OF (A)	53 (100)	27 (100)	80 (100)
B) ADMINISTRATIVE			
☐ Attractive Designation	12 (29)	6 (29)	18 (29)
☐ More Powers	6 (15)	2 (10)	8 (13)
☐ Freedom of Work	9 (22)	7 (33)	16 (26)
☐ Opportunity to Live in Village Home	14 (34)	6 (28)	20 (32)
TOTAL OF (B)	41 (100)	21 (100)	62 (100)
☐ Others	1	0	1
TOTAL (A+B)	95 (100)	48 (100)	143 (100)

Note Multiple responses were recorded

2.8 Commitment in Rural Development

Human resource have innumerable potentials. Cognitive capacity, creative thinking, skills and experience put them in superior position over other resources. Socio-cultural, economic and technological development that took place over centuries are generous contribution of human intellect. Fashioning agricultural tools and implements, engineering feats of pyramid, specialized craft skills, 18th century's industrial revolution, 20th century's sophisticated technology have been innovated, maintained and operated by men.

Adam Smith termed .. man's talents to be part of his fortune as well as that of the society to which he belonged. Alfred Marshall argued that most valuable of all capital is that invested in human beings, while P. W. Schultz in viewed .. that human resources are a form of capital, a produced means of production and the product of investment (Quoted from Dhar 1996 : 3).

Management studies during 1930s popularly known as "Hawthorne Studies" established outstanding potentials of human resource to increase productivity even under adverse working conditions. Pfeffer (1996 : 71) report that ... production levels increased when illumination was increased ... when the level of light was decreased, production continued to increase .. Elton Mayo and his group (Kast and Rosenzweig (1985 : 80) ... hypothesized that the increased production was a result of changes in social relations, motivation, and supervision of workers. Socio-psychological strivings proved more important than physical conditions. Thus, managers and policy makers must explore human potentials and creative option(s) for effective utilization of these invaluable resources than looking for a simple solution to abandon them by way of retrenchment, retirement, release or other forms of employment separations.

Table-13 reconfirms respondent's willingness to work at village home in 10-11 critically important areas of rural development. The table establishes high level of commitment of the respondents in rural development. The level of 'substantial and much' contribution accounts for 87 percent. The rates in all the cases ranges from 70-97 percent. However, participation in health and family planning, pisciculture and literacy program, respectively accounts for 97, 94 and 92 percent. This indicates wider scope for public sector human resource readjustment. This readjustment strategy demands new skills and orientation of respondents in new profession.

Table-13
Respondent's Commitment for Rural Development

LEVEL OF CONTRIBUTIONS					
AREAS	Not At All	Some	Substantial	Much	Total
Maintenance of Law & Order	1 (3)	4 (14)	9 (31)	15 (52)	29 (100)
Organizing Education / Literacy Program	1 (2)	3 (6)	23 (47)	22 (45)	49 (100)
Participation in:					
Disaster and Relief Management	2 (11)	2 (11)	7 (36)	8 (42)	19 (100)
Health & Family Welfare Program	0	1 (3)	14 (42)	18 (55)	33 (100)
Tree Plantation and Environment Development	0	3 (8)	17 (49)	15 (43)	35 (100)
Rural Infrastructure Development	1 (6)	3 (18)	6 (35)	7 (41)	17 (100)
Land Management and Revenue Collection	1 (6)	4 (25)	9 (56)	2 (13)	16 (100)
Social Mobilization	1 (3)	4 (13)	11 (37)	14 (47)	30 (100)
Train People in Improved:					
Agriculture Farming	1 (2)	4 (11)	19 (50)	14 (37)	38 (100)
Psciculture	0	2 (6)	20 (57)	13 (37)	35 (100)
Other	2 (33)	0	2 (33)	2 (37)	6 (100)
TOTAL:	10 (3)	30 (10)	137 (45)	130 (42)	307 (100)

Note Multiple responses were recorded

2.9 Alternate Use of Respondent's Current Skills

Every respondent, irrespective of levels, possess certain skills, experiences and other competencies. This has been supported by tables 6 and 7 on the academic background and work experiences of the respondents. Moreover, statistics in other sections of the paper also unfolds their feelings on motivation, commitment and training for achievement of national development goals more efficiently and effectively. Every administrative policy and actions, thus, must explore and use these potentials, rather than abandoning This demands securing creative opinion of the respondent stakeholders as to where and how their current skills, experiences and other competencies may be utilized for the socio-cultural and economic development of the country. The responses, secured from open-ended questions are clustered in table-14. The table lists about 12 important areas where respondent wishes to utilize their services. These areas are extremely important for

national development and have wider scope for employing more and more people. Providing training to rural farmers/unemployed youths on improved agriculture, fisheries, livestock and poultry farming, tree plantation and computer operations rate highest (32 percent) followed by (25 percent) education/literacy program. The respondents can also significantly contribute in other areas like : social mobilization (9 percent) health and family welfare (7 percent), computer operations (5 percent), disaster management (3 percent), women development (3 percent) and host of other fields. This establishes that public sector human resources are not redundant rather there are ample scope to utilize their intellect and experience.

Table—14
Alternate Use of Respondent's Skills and Experience

POTENTIAL AREAS OF WORK	RESPONSE
Computer Operations/Word Processing	4 (5)
Disaster Management	2 (3)
Driving	1 (1)
Education/literacy Program	18 (25)
Health and Family Welfare Service	5 (7)
Machine Operations (Photocopying/Duplicating etc.)	1 (1)
Maintain Law and other	1 (1)
Rural Infrastructure Development	8 (12)
Social Mobilization	7 (9)
Tailoring	1 (1)
Training to Rural Farmers/Unemployed Youths on Improved Farming in agriculture, fisheries, livestock, poultry, tree plantation, computer operations)	24 (32)
Women Development	2 (3)
TOTAL :	74 (100)

2.10 Retirement Options

Rationalization of public sector human resources is usually viewed as the most challenging tasks involving high risks and resistance. Current Good Practices and New Developments in Public Service Management, Commonwealth Portfolio, Commonwealth Secretariat (1996) reports four principal risks in managing redundancy :

First, and most self-evidently, the political risks are significant. Ironically, these risks are highest in situations where the public service is largest, as it is in those situations that public service pay, however inadequate, supports the living standards of the largest proportion of the electorate.

Second, at a technical level, the varied experience of redundancy programmes across the Commonwealth suggests that severance arrangements are likely to be most attractive to the most employable public servants as they have better prospects for alternative employment. Redundancy programs can result in a loss of the best talent.

Third, the cost of redundancy programmes can outweigh the savings within a given budget period. In a situation where donor funds or credit may be unavailable for retrenchment, the short-term costs may make it impossible to achieve the long-term benefits...

Finally, there are the risks associated with sustainability. Unless payroll and human resource information systems are tightly and consistently limited to the redundancy policy, experience has indicated that major redundancy programmes can be followed by significant re-employment of retrenchees.

This inhibiting factors led policy to play a safer role and leave the rightsizing or downsizing process on the natural course of employment separation.

Table-15 establishes that rationalization of public sector human resources is possible at modest terms, without much delay and extra grants or expenditure. Administrative and credit support for land purchase, house building, business and industry would motivate respondents to accept early retirement (Table-15). On an average, 16 percent respondents are willing to retire upon completion of 15 years of services with full pension benefits. Majority respondents (45 percent) intends to retire upon completion of 20 years of services at full pension benefits. This means, that 61 percent respondents are willing to retire early. This validates PARC's recommendation to retire public servants upon completion of 20 years of services with full pension benefits. Full pension benefits with 50 percent of basic salary for the residual services may be another option for early retirement. Thirteen percent class-IV respondents have also opted in favor of this option. Respondents who are on the verge of retirement (having 1-5 years of residual services) may be given this benefits for early retirement. Payment of basic salary and lump amount in addition to actual entitlement may be two other options where average 39 months extra basic pay or 3.25 months basic pay for each completed years of services or taka 6.5 lakh lump grant per person would be necessary. Respondent's expectations in terms of basic

pay is closure to the previous offer (Table-4) of the government to pay 2 month's basic salary for each year of service and additional gratuity payments deposited as contribution

Government may establish a cell to provide one stop administrative and credit services to the retrenched or retired employees for land purchase, house-building, and setting -up of business and industry. Alternatively, government may secure opinion of class-III and IV employees who are willing to retire early at minimum benefits.

Table-15
Incentives for Retirement

OPTION TYPES	RESPONSE		
	Class-III	Class-IV	Total
ADDITIONAL BASIC PAY (In Month-Inclusive Upper Limit)			
No Extra Salary Benefits	4 (5)	0	4 (5)
1-5	2 (3)	0	2 (3)
5-10	0	0	0
10-15	0	0	0
15-20	8 (10)	2 (3)	10 (13)
20-25	2 (3)	2 (2)	4 (5)
25-30	4 (5)	0	4 (5)
30-35	1 (2)	0	1 (1)
35-40	0	0	0
40-45	1 (1)	7 (9)	8 (10)
45-50	12 (15)	6 (8)	18 (23)
50 +	16 (20)	12 (15)	28 (35)
TOTAL:	50 (63)	29 (37)	79 (100)
$\bar{X}$ (basic pay in months)	36	46	39

ADDITIONAL LUMP GRANT (In Lakh Taka)			
No Extra Benefits	1 (1)	0	1 (1)
1-2	0	0	0
3-4	7 (7)	1 (1)	8 (8)
5-6	20 (20)	11 (11)	31 (31)
7+	30 (31)	29 (29)	59 (60)
TOTAL:	58 (58)	41 (41)	99 (100)
X̄ (In Lakh Taka)	6	7	6.5
FULL PENSION BENEFITS:			
Irrespective of Length of Service	9 (13)	5 (8)	14 (21)
Upon Completion of 15 Years of Service	8 (12)	3 (4)	11 (16)
Upon Completion of 20 Years of Service	17 (25)	13 (20)	30 (45)
Upon Completion of 25 Years of Service	1 (2)	2 (2)	3 (4)
Full Pension Benefits and Basic Pay at the Rate of :			
50 Percent of Residual Services	9 (13)	0	9 (13)
25 Percent of Residual Services	0	0	0
10 Percent of Residual Services	0	0	0
TOTAL	44 (66)	23 (34)	67 (100)

ADEQUATE CREDIT AND ADMINISTRATIVE SUPPORT FOR:			
Setting Up of Industries, Mills and Factories	5 (11)	1 (2)	6 (13)
Setting Up of Small and Cottage Industries	6 (13)	0	6 (13)
Setting Up of Business	6 (13)	11 (24)	17 (37)
Land Purchase and House Building	12 (26)	2 (4)	14 (30)
Preference in Contractorship in Own Department/Organization	3 (7)	0	3 (7)
TOTAL	32 (70)	14 (30)	46 (100)

2.11 Retirement and Rural Nostalgia

Table-16 explores aspirations of respondents for settlement after retirement. The table establishes that majority respondent's (45 percent) are nostalgic to settle at their village home. This rate is 13 percent higher for class-III than class-IV employees. Settlement at home district is also 8 percent higher for class-III than class-IV employees. On an average, 63 percent respondents are willing to settle at own villages or home districts. Very negligible amount (1 percent for class-III and 4 percent for class-IV) of respondents desire to settle at current workplace. Settlement in Dhaka city, however, accounts for 19 percent for class-III and 18 percent for class-IV employees. The rates in adjoining areas of Dhaka city accounts for 19 percent for class-III and 7 percent for class-IV with overall mean of 14 percent. Leadership roles and aspirations shown in table-5 do not prevent them in settling at rural areas. This, in other words, indicates feasibility of human resource readjustment in rural villages.

The table also displays potential respondents who are willing to retire early. The mean early retirement rate accounts for 23 percent. Out of these, class-III employees consists of 29 percent and class-IV 13 percent. This means that about two lakhs class-III and IV employees can be retired early.

Table-16
Retirement Age and Settlement Location

WILLINGNESS TO							
Retire At				Settle In/At			
Age (In Years)	Response			Location	Response		
	Class-III	Class-IV	Total		Class-III	Class-IV	Total
50	10 (16)	4 (10)	14 (14)	Village Home	24 (38)	24 (25)	48 (45)
55	8 (13)	1 (3)	9 (9)	Home District	13 (22)	6 (14)	19 (18)
57	15 (24)	11 (28)	26 (25)	Current Work Place	1 (1)	2 (4)	3 (3)
60	29 (45)	23 (59)	52 (50)	Dhaka City	12 (19)	8 (18)	20 (19)
65	0	0	0	Adjoining Areas of Dhaka City	12 (19)	3 (7)	15 (14)
Whole Life	1 (1)	0	1 (1)	Other Location (s)	1 (1)	1 (2)	2 (1)
Other (45 Years)	1 (1)	0	1 (1)	TOTAL	63 (100)	44 (100)	107 (100)
TOTAL:	64 (100)	39 (100)	103 (100)				

2.12 Respondent's Awareness of HR Rationalization

Open-ended response (Table-17) proves that non-managerial respondents are aware of the down or right-sizing process. Majority (94 percent) respondents appreciate the need for human resource rationalization and proposed creative, realistic and employee-centred options for such rationalization. Only 6 percent respondents have opposed the down or right sizing process. This unfolds the truth that they are not “resister” rather “co-operators” of the administrative reform process. This augments the chances for the policy makers to initiate the rationalization process considering the employee's needs and aspirations.

Human resource rationalization process should be perceived in a wider context. The term down or right sizing gives partial or limited view or options and explicitly or implicitly threatens survival of employees. Incentive packages like credit facilities inter and intra agency/sectoral transfer/ secondment, negotiated employment in NGO and private sectors under collaborative / contracting out or other joint venture program may be useful strategies where government can lend its surplus human resources. In fact 38 percent respondent advocates for credit facilities for agriculture, fisheries, livestock, poultry farming/rearing, land purchase, house building and other business or commercial activities followed by intra and inter agency/sectoral transfer/secondment (21 percent). Retirement with full pension benefits upon completion of 20 years of services are chosen by 11 percent respondents and 15 years services by 4 percent respondents. This means that 15 percent surplus employees can be retired in 20 of services. This results validate the PARC's recommendation for early retirement with full pension benefits upon completion of 20 years of services. The report (PARC 2000 : 58) recommends ... voluntary retirement by public servants after they have completed 20 years of services, instead of 25 years with full benefits. However, PARC's other recommendation to pay 64% benefits upon completion of 15 years of services are less likely to be accepted by the respondents. Therefore, the feasibility for implementation of this recommendation is lower than the other.

Down or rightsizing by abolition of post after retirement or stopping recruitment, contractual appointment or not extending retirement age have been supported by 10 percent respondents. Transfer at own villages may be another option to readjust the surplus human resource for certain employees. Government may explore these options, where feasible.

Table--17
Respondent's Creative Thinking on Human Resources Rationalization

Down Sizing/Rightsizing Options	Response
Abolition of Posts After Retirement/Stopping Recruitment in Vacant Positions/Not Extending Retirement Age/Stopping Contractual Appointment	10 (10)
CREDIT FACILITIES FOR (Agriculture, Fisheries, Livestock, Farming/Rearing, Land Purchase, House Building, Boutique, Commercial/Business Activities)	35 (37)
Credit Facilities For Retired Officials	1 (1)
Employment in Private/NGO Sector Keeping Service Lien	1 (1)
Golden Handshake	02 (2)
Inter-Sectoral/ Departmental/Transfer/Deputation (Shifting Extra Employees to Organizations where there are demands)	20 (21)
No Need of Down Sizing/Right Sizing	6 (6)
RETIREMENT WITH FULL PENSION BENEFITS :	
☐ Irrespective of Length of Services	2 (2)
☐ Upon Completion of 15 Years of Services	4 (4)
☐ Upon Completion of 20 Years of Services	10 (11)
☐ Upon Completion of 25 Years of Services	4 (4)
☐ Transfer at Village Home	1 (1)
TOTAL :	96 (100)

2.13 Emerging Human Resource Development Needs

Table-18 displays human resource development needs of respondents. Placement in a new job, institution or managing life in case of forced or early retirement, release or retrenchment demands reorientation of respondents to acquire new skills for a new profession. The table demonstrates respondent's willingness to receive skill based training in at least 15 diverse fields. On an average, training on computer operations ranked top (35 percent) followed by pisciculture (12 percent) and livestock and poultry rearing (10 percent). Both the categories of respondents opted for training on computer operations.

The rate in case of class-III accounts for 38 percent and for class-IV 32 percent. Training on livestock and poultry rearing (20 percent) and pisciculture (17 percent) are also significantly preferred by class IV employees and office management (14 percent) by class-III. However, there are other respondents, though negligible, have opted for training in other fields. Government. prior to readjustment, retrenchment of retirement of any respondent, should design and organize need based training in the listed fields. Selection of participants for the training be scheduled according to respondents choices and aspirations.

Table-18
Human Resource Development Needs

HRD AREAS	RESPONSE		
	Class-III	Class-IV	Total
Agriculture Farming	2 (2)	3 (6)	5 (4)
Accounting / Financial Management	8 (9)	1 (2)	9 (6)
Boutique	2 (2)	0	2 (1)
Computer Operations	34 (38)	15 (32)	49 (35)
File Management	5 (5)	0	5 (4)
Human Resource/Personnel Management	4 (4)	1 (2)	5 (4)
Livestock and Poultry Farming/Rearing	5 (5)	9 (20)	14 (10)
Machine (Photocopying, Duplicating etc) Operations	0	5 (11)	5 (4)
Machine/Vehicle Repair & Maintenance	5 (5)	2 (4)	7 (5)
Nursery	2 (2)	1 (2)	3 (2)
Office Management	12 (14)	0	12 (8)
Pisciculture	8 (9)	8 (17)	16 (12)
Shorthand	1 (1)	0	1 (1)
Sewing / Tailoring	1 (1)	2 (4)	3 (2)
Other (Television Repair, Disaster Management)	3 (3)	0	3 (2)
TOTAL:	92 (100)	47 (100)	139 (100)

3.0 RECOMMENDATIONS AND CONCLUSION

3.1 Recommendations

Empirical findings support following recommendations for effective human resource rationalization :

(1) Human Resource Rationalization Philosophy

Mechanistic and ambitious view influenced by the experiences of the developed countries and echoed by the donors to down-size or right size public sector human resources hindered or delayed the human resource rationalization process. Thus, a modest, empathic and more humanistic policy considering socio-cultural and economic realities of Bangladesh should be adopted. The current “down-sizing or redundancy” philosophy, therefore, need be replaced by the philosophy of “Effective or Better Utilization of Human Resource.” Down-sizing, right sizing or redundancy should be viewed as secondary option and should be applied only with the consent of the affected individual.

(2) Inter-agency Transfer or Secondment

Research results prove that majority respondents are willing to work and live in their village homes even at lower emoluments. Leadership role in civil societies (Table-5) are less likely to prevent them from such shift. Lower cost of living (table-9) prospects of increased agriculture productivity (Table-13), better living conditions at rural villages (Table-9) and other positive strivings support that public sector human resources are not redundant rather their services can be better utilized and readjusted in other sectors for more socio-cultural and economic benefits. Government, may use their services in literacy movement including non-formal education, training to unemployed youths and rural farmers on agro-fisheries and livestock farming, social mobilization, disaster management, tree plantation, land and revenue management, health and family welfare, rural infrastructure development, micro-credit and host of other fields listed in tables 11, 13 and 14.

Every year government implements innumerable development projects. More over, it funds and grants NGOs and private sectors including private educational institutions. Contracting out, privatization and other market-led collaborative interventions under government assistance creates new job opportunities. While funding or assisting, government can explore and negotiate with those prospective entrepreneurs to hire appropriate surplus human resources of the government. Private college, school and madrasa teachers and other staff may also be recruited from government’s surplus staff. Government may impose ban on the recruitment of staff in public sector development projects and encourage surplus staff to undertake employment keeping service lien and other benefits. Higher salary and benefits, where possible, may be given during the tenure of such secondment.

The above readjustment process might involve restructuring of the public bureaucracy, and designing and organizing need based training for possible transferee or seconder.

(3) Restructuring Union Parishad

Over the years, the role of union parishad has significantly changed. Development functions have been added as one of the most important role of union parishad. Unfortunately, the structure of union parishad is dafadar (comparable English meaning is police or security guards) driven as was introduced long before. This lacks integrity and consistency between the current role and the archaic structure. Thus, more development- led structure (like agriculture, fisheries, livestock, poultry rearing including micro credit) showing multiple coordination links should be designed for union parishad. Surplus human resources willing to work at own villages/union may be posted there ascribing attractive designations like : RDA (Rural Development Associate) or RDF (Rural Development Facilitator) or other similar prestigious title with adequate powers and freedom and other incentives (Table-11). Upazila administration may monitor the performance of such union parishads.

(4) Retirement Options

Research results (Table-15) establish several retirement options. Payment of extra lump grants averaging taka 6.5 lakh per person is costlier than other options listed in table-15. Payment of extra basic pay is slightly higher (3.25 months) than the previous offer of the government. Payment of full pension benefits upon completion of 20 years of services reconciles with PARC's recommendation may be introduced by the government. Respondents who are on the verge of retirement (having 1-5 years of residual services) may be encouraged to retire early with full pension benefits and 50 percent extra basic pay for residual services. Administrative and credit support for land purchase, house building and setting-up of business and industry may also be considered. A separate cell and/or a bank, if necessary, may be established to provide one stop services to the retired or retrenched employees. The name of the cell and/or bank may be termed as "Redundancy Cell and or Redundancy Bank".

(5) Terms of Voluntary Retirement

Significant number of respondents desire to retire early (Table-16). To encourage this process, voluntary retirement provisions with full benefits may be relaxed from 25 years to 20 years of services or attaining 50 years of age. Extension of the retirement age limit has not been confirmed by the respondents (Table-17). Thus, the retirement age should remain at 57 years of age. However, outstanding talents, experts and technicians whose replacements are difficult should not be retired or retrenched early.

(6) Land Purchase and House Building Advance for Village Home

Majority respondents are nostalgic to settle at their village homes after retirement. In order to reduce the pressure of basic amenities in cities and towns, government should provide land purchase and house building loans for village homes at a cheaper interest rates (not exceeding 5 percent). The relevant rules should accordingly be modified.

(7) Gradual Abolition of Class-III and IV Non-technical Posts

Recent administrative reform reports termed class-III and IV employees contribution as “little substantive” in handling state functions whereas annual government’s pay-roll investment accounts for more than 3000 crore taka. Thus, government may think of gradual abolition of class-III and class-IV posts of non-technical nature or persons performing trifling functions. This might require changes on the following :

- ❑ designing flatter, organization structure showing multiple coordination links; and
- ❑ Redefining roles and functions of the job-holders and the public sector institutions

Future recruitment in vacant posts, contractual appointment and other similar appointments should also be stopped until human resource rationalization process is completed.

(8) Readjustment of over or Under Qualified Human Resource

Mismatch between job and job holders because of over or under qualifications creates unpleasant work environment. In readjusting surplus human resources government may take following actions :

- a) transfer respective human resources to their village home at attractive designations as recommended earlier.
- b) promote them at higher positions, if possible, redesign job descriptions incorporating new job elements with adequate powers and freedom.

(9) Human Resource Development

Research results establishes that readjustment and retirement options are significantly dependent on training needs of respondents. Adjusting in a new situation or managing life after retirement calls for reorientation of respondents to acquire new skills for a new profession. Transferred subject officials working at the upazila may be given the responsibility to design and organise need based training programme for these personnel.

3.2 CONCLUSION

Traditional viewpoints to rely and replicate success stories may not always hold true for every nations or situation(s). Down or right sizing scheme succeeded in one or more country (ies) does not guarantee similar success in other country (ies) . Every prescription, therefore, need be judged in it's own context. Consultation with the affected person(s) or group(s) has no better option(s). This research study is a proof that rejects the traditional beliefs. Human resources rationalization is not an unattainable job. Ambitious and mechanistic view have made it more complicated than what really it was. The philosophy and options reinvented and analysed in this paper may be a useful tool for policy makers in managing redundancy effectively.

বাংলাদেশ লোক-প্রশাসন প্রশিক্ষণ কেন্দ্র
সাভার, ঢাকা

QUESTIONNAIRE
(For class-III and IV Employees)

Research Title : **Strategies for Rationalizing Public Sector Human Resources**

- ১। কর্মবর্ত সংস্থায় আপনার অবস্থান/পর্যায়, সংস্থার ধরন/প্রকৃতি এবং কর্মচারী কল্যাণ সমিতি/ট্রেড ইউনিয়নের আপনি নির্বাহী পরিষদের সদস্য/নির্বাহী ছিলেন কিনা, বর্তমানে আছেন কিনা এবং ভবিষ্যতে হতে আগ্রহী কিনা তার বিবরণ দিন (টিক চিহ্ন দিন) :

সংস্থার ধরন/প্রকৃতি	সংস্থায় আপনার অবস্থান/ পর্যায়	কল্যাণ সমিতি/ট্রেড ইউনিয়নের নির্বাহী কমিটির সদস্য/নির্বাহী		
			হ্যাঁ	না
মন্ত্রণালয়/বিভাগ	তৃতীয় শ্রেণী	পূর্বে ছিলাম		
অধিদপ্তর/পরিদপ্তর	চতুর্থ শ্রেণী	বর্তমানে আছি		
স্বায়ত্তশাসিত প্রতিষ্ঠান/কর্পোরেশন	-	ভবিষ্যতে হতে আগ্রহী		
অন্যান্য (উল্লেখ করুন)	-	-	-	-

- ২। আপনার চাকরি অভিজ্ঞতা এবং অবসর গ্রহণে অবশিষ্ট চাকরি মেয়াদের বিবরণ দিন (টিক চিহ্ন দিন উধসীমাসহ) :

মোট চাকরি অভিজ্ঞতা (বছরে)			অবশিষ্ট চাকরি (অবসর গ্রহণে) বছরে		
১-৫	৫-১০	১০-১৫	১-৫	৫-১০	১০-১৫
১৫-২০	২০-২৫	২৫-৩০	১৫-২০	২০-২৫	২৫-৩০
৩০-৩৫	-	-	৩০-৩৫	-	-

- ৩। চাকরি থেকে বেতন ভাতাদি বাবদ প্রাপ্ত আয় আপনার পরিবারের সদস্যদের পড়াশুনা, ভরণপোষণসহ যাবতীয় ব্যয় নির্বাহে (শহর এবং গ্রামে নিজ বাড়িতে বসবাসের ক্ষেত্রে) কতটুকু পর্যাপ্ত তা উল্লেখ করুন (টিক চিহ্ন দিন) :

শহরে বসবাসের ক্ষেত্রে		গ্রামে নিজ বাড়িতে বসবাসের ক্ষেত্রে	
মোটের ও না	সামান্য	মোটের ও না	সামান্য
যথেষ্ট	অনেক	যথেষ্ট	অনেক
সঞ্চয় করা সম্ভব হবে		সঞ্চয় করা সম্ভব হবে	

- ৪। চাকরির নিরাপত্তা (job security) বজায় রেখে আপনি নিম্নবর্ণিত কোন প্রতিষ্ঠান/প্রকল্পে নিম্নতম কত বেতন ও ভাতা ও অন্যান্য সুবিধায় কাজ করতে আগ্রহী তা উল্লেখ করুন (টিক চিহ্ন দিন) :

প্রতিষ্ঠান/সংস্থার ধরন	কাজ করতে আগ্রহী					অন্যান্য সুবিধাদি (যেমন আকর্ষণীয় পদবী ইত্যাদি) উল্লেখ করুন
	মূল বেতন	মূল বেতন ও ভাতাদি	বর্তমান মূল বেতন ও ভাতার			
			দেড় গুণ	দুই গুণ	তিন গুণ	
সেনা বাহিনী						
পুলিশ, আনহাওর ও ভিডিপি						
স্কুল/কলেজ/মাদ্রাসা						
মন্ত্রণালয়/বিভাগ						
অধিদপ্তর/পরিদপ্তর						
স্বায়ত্তশাসিত প্রতিষ্ঠান/ কর্পোরেশন						
মাঠ প্রশাসন						
ক। নিজ বিভাগে						
খ। নিজ জেলায়						
গ। নিজ উপজেলায়						
ঘ। নিজ ইউনিয়নে						
ঙ। নিজ গ্রামে						
এনজিও						
সরকার এবং এনজিও যৌথ প্রকল্প						
সবকাবী উন্নয়ন প্রকল্প						
বেসবকাবী ব্যবসা প্রতিষ্ঠান						
অন্যান্য (উল্লেখ করুন): -----						

- ৫। ক) সবকাব কর্মকর্তা ও কর্মচারী হ্রাস/যৌক্তিকরণের লক্ষ্যে আপনাকে অবসর/অব্যাহতি দানের সিদ্ধান্ত গ্রহণ করলে আপনি প্রচলিত বিধি অনুযায়ী সকল আর্থিক সুযোগ সুবিধা (পেনশন, গ্রাটুইটি, ভবিষ্যৎ তহবিল) ছাড়া ন্যূনতম আর কত মাসের অতিরিক্ত মূল বেতন চান তা উল্লেখ করুন (টিক চিহ্ন দিন) :

১-৫	৫-১০	১০-১৫	১৫-২০	২০-২৫	২৫-৩০
৩০-৩৫	৩৫-৪০	৪০-৪৫	৪৫-৫০	৫০ মাসের অতিরিক্ত হলে উল্লেখ করুন : -----	

অথবা

- ৫। খ) বর্তমানে আপনি চাকরি থেকে অবসর/অব্যাহতি নিলে অথবা অব্যাহতি প্রদান করা হলে আপনি পেনশন, গ্রাটুইটি, ভবিষ্যৎ তহবিল বাবদ ন্যূনতম আর কত টাকা অতিরিক্ত চান (টিক চিহ্ন দিন) ?

ন্যূনতম আর অতিরিক্ত কত টাকা পেলে আপনি অবসর গ্রহণ/অব্যাহতি নিতে রাজী হবেন			
১-২ লক্ষ	৩-৪ লক্ষ	৫-৬ লক্ষ	৭ লক্ষ টাকার অধিক হলে উল্লেখ করুন : -----

- ৬। গ্রামে জীবন যাত্রা ব্যয় শহুরে তুলনায় কিছুটা কম। আপনাকে নিজ গ্রামে পদায়ন করলে আপনি নিম্নতম কত বেতন/ভাতা/আর্থিক এবং প্রশাসনিক সুবিধায় নিজ গ্রামে আর্থ-সামাজিক উন্নয়নে কাজ করতে আগ্রহী হবেন (টিক চিহ্ন দিন) :

মূল বেতনের শতকরা ৫০ ভাগ পেলে	আকর্ষণীয় পদবী হলে
মূল বেতনের শতকরা ৭৫ ভাগ পেলে	অধিকতর ক্ষমতা পেলে
সম্পূর্ণ মূল বেতন পেলে	স্বাধীনভাবে কাজ করার সুযোগ হলে
সম্পূর্ণ মূল বেতন এবং ভাতাদি পেলে	নিজ গ্রামের বাড়ীতে থাকার সুযোগ পেলে
	অন্যান্য (উল্লেখ করুন) : -----

- ৭। আপনাকে আপনার নিজ গ্রামের বাড়ীতে পদায়ন করলে এবং আপনাকে প্রয়োজনীয় প্রশিক্ষণ প্রদান করলে আপনি নিম্নবর্ণিত ক্ষেত্রে কতটুকু অবদান রাখতে পারবেন তা উল্লেখ করুন (একাধিক ক্ষেত্রে কাজ করতে আগ্রহী হলে একাধিক টিক চিহ্ন দিন)।

ক্ষেত্র/বিষয়	অবদানের মাত্রা			
	মোটঃ না	সামান্য	যথেষ্ট	অনেক
উন্নত কৃষি চাষ পদ্ধতি সম্পর্কে জনগণকে প্রশিক্ষণ প্রদান				
উন্নত মৎস্য চাষ পদ্ধতি সম্পর্কে জনগণকে প্রশিক্ষণ প্রদান				
শিক্ষা কার্যক্রম পরিচালনা				
আইন শৃঙ্খলা বক্ষা করা				
দুর্যোগ ব্যবস্থাপনা ও ত্রাণ কার্যক্রমে অংশগ্রহণ				
বৃক্ষবোপণ ও পরিবেশ উন্নয়ন কার্যক্রমে অংশগ্রহণ				
স্বাস্থ্য ও পরিবার কল্যাণ কার্যক্রমে অংশগ্রহণ				
পল্লী ভৌত অবকাঠামো (রাস্তা, কালভার্ট ইত্যাদি) নির্মাণে সহায়তা/অংশগ্রহণ				
ভূমি ব্যবস্থাপনা ও রাজস্ব আদায়ে সহায়তা/ অংশগ্রহণ করা				
সামাজিক সচেতনতা (Social Mobilization) / উদ্বুদ্ধকরণ কার্যক্রমে অংশগ্রহণ				
অন্যান্য (উল্লেখ করুন) :-----				

৮। নিম্নতম কি সুবিধা পেলে আপনি অনতিবিলম্বে অবসর গ্রহণে রাজী হবেন (টিক চিহ্ন দিন) ?

সুবিধার ধরন	
ক্ষুদ্র ও কুটির শিল্প স্থাপনে প্রশাসনিক ও পর্যাপ্ত ঋণ সুবিধা	শিল্প কাবখানা স্থাপনে প্রশাসনিক ও পর্যাপ্ত ঋণ সুবিধা
নিজ উদ্যোগে ব্যবসা পরিচালনার জন্য পর্যাপ্ত ঋণ সুবিধা	জমি ক্রয় ও বাড়ী নির্মাণে পর্যাপ্ত ঋণ সুবিধা
নিজ/কর্মবত সংস্থায় ঠিকাদারী ব্যবসা করাৰ সুযোগ/অগ্রাধিকার পেলে	চাকরিৰ মেয়াদ পূৰ্তি নিৰ্বিশেষে এখনই পূৰ্ণ পেনশন সুবিধা
২০ বছৰ চাকরি সমাপনান্তে পূৰ্ণ পেনশন সুবিধা	১৫ বছৰ চাকরি সমাপনান্তে পূৰ্ণ পেনশন সুবিধা প্রদান
বর্তমান বিধি অনুযায়ী পেনশন সুবিধা প্রদান এবং অবশিষ্ট চাকরিৰ (যথা ৫ বছৰ হলে আড়াই বছৰেৰ বেতন প্রদান) :	অন্যান্য কোন বিকল্প হলে (উল্লেখ কৰুন) : -----
ক) অৰ্ধেক সময় সীমার মূল বেতন প্রদান	
খ) এক চতুৰ্থাংশ সময় সীমার মূল বেতন প্রদান	
গ) এক দশমাংশ সময় সীমার মূল বেতন প্রদান	

৯। আপনাকে নতুন প্রতিষ্ঠান/কর্মস্থলে পদায়ন/ব্যবসা পরিচালনা/অবসর/অব্যাহতি প্রদান কৰলে আপনি কোন ধৰনেৰ প্রশিক্ষণ গ্রহণ কৰতে আগ্রহী তা উল্লেখ কৰুন (টিক চিহ্ন দিন) :

প্রশিক্ষণেৰ বিষয়/ক্ষেত্র		প্রশিক্ষণেৰ বিষয়/ক্ষেত্র	
কম্পিউটার	শর্টহ্যান্ড	অফিস ব্যবস্থাপনা	অর্থ/হিসাব ব্যবস্থাপনা
কর্মী ব্যবস্থাপনা	নথি ব্যবস্থাপনা	যন্ত্রপাতি/গাড়ী মেবামত	মেশিন চালনা (ফটোকপি, ডুপ্লিকেটিং)
মাছ চাষ	কৃষি চাষ	গবাদি/পশু/মুরগী পালন	সেলাই
নার্সারী	বুটিক	অন্যান্য উল্লেখ কৰুন :-----	

১০। সবকাৰী প্রতিষ্ঠানেৰ অতিরিক্ত লোকবল কিভাবে হ্রাস/সমন্বয় কৰা যায সে সম্পর্কে আপনাৰ সৃজনশীল ও সুচিন্তিত মতামত দিন :

ক) -----

খ) -----

১১। আপনাৰ বর্তমান চাকৰি ছাড়া আপনাৰ বর্তমান যোগ্যতা, অভিজ্ঞতা ও দক্ষতা দেশেৰ আর্থ-সামাজিক উন্নয়নে আৰ কোথায় এবং কিভাবে ব্যবহার কৰা সম্ভব তা উল্লেখ কৰুন :

১।
২।

১২। আপনার শিক্ষাগত যোগ্যতার বিবরণ দিন (টিক চিহ্ন দিন) :

স্বাক্ষরজ্ঞান সম্পন্ন	প্রাথমিক	নিম্ন মাধ্যমিক	মাধ্যমিক (এস, এস, সি)
উচ্চ মাধ্যমিক (এইচ, এস, সি)	স্নাতক	স্নাতকোত্তর	অন্যান্য (উল্লেখ করুন) : -----

১৩। আপনার গ্রামে জমি চাষের ধরন এবং জমি থেকে প্রাপ্ত বাৎসরিক আয়ের বিবরণ দিন (টিক চিহ্ন দিন) :

জমি চাষের ধরন	জমি থেকে বাৎসরিক আয়	
	জমির বর্তমান আয় উর্ধ্বসীমাসহ (টাকা)	গ্রামে বসবাস করলে এ আয় কতটুকু বাড়ানো সম্ভব হবে
বর্গা	মোটেনা	একই রকম থাকবে
ইজাবা/চুক্তি ভিত্তিক	১,০০০-৫,০০০	দেড় গুণ বাড়ানো সম্ভব
নিজ চাষ	৫,০০০-১০,০০০	দ্বিগুণ বাড়ানো সম্ভব
নিয়মিত চাষ করা হয় না/পতিত	১০,০০০-১৫,০০০	তিন গুণ করা সম্ভব
অন্যান্য পদ্ধতি (যদি থাকে উল্লেখ করুন) : -----	১৫,০০০ এর অধিক হলে উল্লেখ করুন : -----	তিন গুণের বেশী হলে উল্লেখ করুন : -----

১৪। সবকাবী চাকরীতে অবসরের বয়সসীমা কত বছর হওয়া উচিত বলে আপনি মনে করেন ?

৫০ বছর	৫৫ বছর	৫৭ বছর	৬০ বছর
৬৫ বছর	সাবা জীবন	অন্যান্য উল্লেখ করুন : -----	

১৫। অবসর গ্রহণের পর আপনি কোথায় স্থায়ীভাবে বসবাস করতে চান তাব বিবরণ (টিক চিহ্ন দিন) :

নিজ গ্রামে	নিজ জেলায়	বর্তমান কর্মস্থলে (ঢাকা শহর না হলে উল্লেখ করুন) : -----	
ঢাকা শহরে	ঢাকা শহরের পার্শ্ববর্তী এলাকায়	অন্যান্য এলাকা/শহর (উল্লেখ করুন) : -----	

১৬। অন্যান্য মন্তব্য (যদি থাকে) : -----

স্বাক্ষর (ঐচ্ছিক) : -

তারিখ : -

পূরণকৃত প্রশ্নমালা পাঠানোর ঠিকানাঃ

মোঃ সিরাজুল ইসলাম

পরিচালক

বাংলাদেশ লোক-প্রশাসন প্রশিক্ষণ কেন্দ্র

সাভার, ঢাকা

ফোন : ৭৭১১৬০০ (অফিস)

৭৭১১৬২২ (বাসা)

REFERENCE

Bryant, Coralie and White, Louise G. (1982), Managing Development in the Third World, (Colorado : Westview Press)

Commonwealth Secretariat (1996), Current Good Practices and New Developments in Public Service Management, (London : Commonwealth Secretariat).

Dhar, Ruby, Techniques and Approaches to Manpower Planning and Labour Market (New Delhi : IAMR)

Islam, Md. Shirajul and Jamil, Kanka (2000), "Research Report on Reformulating Human Resource Management Policy for Sustainable Motivation," (Dhaka : BPATC).

Kast, Fremont E. and Rosenzweig, James E. (1985), Organization & Management; A Systems and Contingency Approach, Fourth Edition (New York : McGraw-Hill Book Company).

Pfeiffer, J. William (ed. : 1996), Theories and Models in Applied Behavioral Science (Volume 4), Organization, (New Delhi : Pfeiffer & Company).

Schermerhorn, Jr., et. al., (1985), Managing Organization Behavior, (New York: John Wiley & Sons)

Tanzi, Vito and Schuknecht, Ludger, Reforming Government in Industrial Countries in Finance and Development, September 1996.

The World Bank, Bangladesh (1996), Government That Works : Reforming the Public Sector, (Dhaka . The University Press Limited)

