

29

২৭

An Evaluation
of the
Training Programme for the Class II Government Officials

Hiralal Bala
Director

Kazi Aminul Islam
Co-Director

Zobayer Enamul Karim
Ahmedur Rahim
Research Associates

Bangladesh Public Administration Training Centre
Savar, Dhaka

Table of Contents

	<u>Page No</u>
Foreward	
List of Tables and Annexures	
Chapter-I	
Background	1
Introduction	2
Conceptual Framework	2-7
- Evaluating a Training Programme	
- Areas of Evaluation	
- Reasons for Evaluation	
- Accuracy of Evaluation	
- Levels of Evaluation	
Chapter - II	
Evaluation of RPATCs	
Objectives	8
Methodology	9
Chapter-III	
Findings	
Class II Government Official : a description	12
Training Need	14
Training Expectation	18
Training Facilities	20
Training Courses	24
Group dynamics	26
The trainer	27
Training Methods	31
Some Aspects of Course Management	32-34
- Assignment & Exercise	
- Training Aid & Handouts	
- Sequencing of course schedule	
- Use of library	
- Recreational facilities	
Impact	34
Training and Working Condition	35
Training and attitude	35
Training and Career	36
Issues related to training of class II Government Officials	
Evaluation & Research at the RPATCs	38
Decentralising of Training	40
Chapter- IV	
Observation	42
Recommendations	44

Foreward

This study attempts to evaluate the training programme for class II government officials. The class II government officials form an important part of the government machinery. Therefore, the efficiency with which public services are rendered to the people depends also on the skill and dexterity of this category of officers. Appreciation of the role of class II government official and serious efforts to improve their capability through training dates back to a decade only. Infact this category of officers have been provided with institutional training since 1980 when the then government started Staff Training Institutes. Even though various training programmes have been designed and conducted by different institutions, an evaluation of those programmes is yet to be made.

This study report has five chapters. Chapter-I deals with the background of training programmes of the class II government officials and a few theoretical and conceptual aspects which usually guides an evaluation study. The objective and methodology have been given in chapter-II. The chapter-III contains the findings of the study. Observations and recommendations have been stated in the concluding chapter, chapter-IV.

We are grateful especially to the members of the evaluation committee namely, Dr. Sheikh Maqsood Ali, Member, Planning Commission, Abdul Mueyed Chowdhury, Director General of the President's Secretariat and Dr. Ekramul Ahsan, MDS, BPATC, who have guided the study. They have made significant contribution with their constructive criticism and valuable comments. Thanks are also due to the officials and staff of the RPATCs and the official interviewed for their whole hearted co-operation and assistance.

We also thankfully acknowledge the troubles taken by the data collectors. Data entry operators Messers Elias Uddin and Rafiqul Islam and typists Messers Jagadish and Dharendra Chandra took lot of patience and care in producing the report. We are also thankful to them. However, there are errors and ommission which are ours only.

Member of he Study Team

List of Tables & Annexures

A. Tables

1. Opinion of the Supervising Officers about the knowledge & skill required of the Class II Officers
2. Training Needs Assessment of Class II Officers
3. Opinion of the Participant about the Areas of Training for Career Development
4. Opinion of the Participants about the Usefulness of Training Course in Service Life.
5. Reasons for Inadequate Participation in the Training Programmes
6. Opinion of the Officers who did not participate in the course about their training need.
7. Response of Officers if training were related to disciplinary action or promotion.
8. Physical Facilities of the RPATCs
9. Opinion of the Second Class Officers about the Training Aids Used and required.
- 9a. Staff Strength of the Regional Centres (as of July '89)
10. Opinion of the Trainees about the Dormitory facilities
11. Requirements of the Regional Centres
12. Training of Class II Officials March/1984-June/90.
13. Opinion about the Arrangement of Training along with the Class I and Class III employees
14. Opinion of the Trainees about the Performance of the Trainers
15. Proportion of Faculty Member / Guest Speaker
16. Required qualities of Trainer of the Trainees
17. Opinion of the Trainees Regarding conduct of the Trainers and other supporting staff.
18. Training Techniques for Training of Class II Officials.
19. Opinion of the Supervising Officers about skill and efficiency of the Class II officers before and after training.
20. Linkage between training and career development.
21. Effectiveness of the Courses

B. Annexures

Annexure-1

Distribution of Class II officials of civil Officers & Employees

Annexure-2

Details of the courses conducted by the RPATCs for Class-II Government Officers

Annexure-3

Proferential Training Methods from amongst the Conventional Methods

Annexure-4

An Organisational Plan for Training of Class II Officials and Staff : A Model Structure for Dhaka District

Chapter I

1.1 Background

1.1.1 Training of class I officers in this part of the sub-continent dates back to the times of British India when the Fort William College was established for training of civil servants. But the training of class-II officers is a matter of recent origin. In the then East Pakistan, efforts were made in the late sixties to provide some sort of training to the class-II government officers. On the basis of the recommendations of the Provincial Reorganisation Committee Report of 1962, a Staff Training Institute (STI) was established in Dhaka in 1963. It started functioning in the Secretariat as a branch of the Services & General Administration (S&GA) of the Establishment Ministry. In fact, it was since 1968 that the Dhaka STI began to develop.

1.1.2 The provision in the First Five Year Plan (FFYP) for establishment of the STIs outside Dhaka laid the foundation for training of class II government officials. However, it was not until 1980-81 that the STIs could actually start training programmes for class-II officers. In the same year three more STIs were established in three Divisional Headquarters outside Dhaka in order to train the support staff including class-II officers. These are called Regional Staff Training Institutes (RSTIs).

1.1.3 Besides the STIs at the divisional headquarters, each of the 21 districts was to have a District STI. During the initial years of the plan, nine DSTIs could be established in Sylhet, Rangpur, Bogra, Mymensingh, Faridpur, Dhaka, Barisal, Kushtia and Chittagong Hill Tracts. These were basically meant for training of class III employees of different ministries and departments. The institutes were assigned with training of class II officers later. In addition to creation of district staff training institutes two projects were implemented for the "Training of Trainers (TOT) and the Staff Training at the Districts. Following Martial Law of 1982, four of the nine DSTIs were discontinued and the two projects were amalgamated into a single project named "Programme for staff training at the District Centre". A small number less than two hundred of class II officers were trained under these programmes.

1.1.4 A major study entitled "Pre-investment Study for Public Administration Training and Management Improvement Project" was conducted by the government in the year 1981. On the basis of that study, the Public Administration Training Project was taken up under an IDA credit agreement. The project was based on integrated approach to training for officers engaged in public administration. The "Martial Law Committee on Organisational Set Up" of 1982 recommended the merger of RSTIs with the Public Administration Training Centre (PATC). The RSTIs at the divisional headquarters and the STI in Dhaka emerged as the regional centres of the BPATC and were renamed in 1984 as the Regional Public Administration Training Centre (RPATC) in 1984. It will not be an exaggeration to say that training of class II officers has taken definite shape only after creation of the regional centres under the BPATC.

1.2. Introduction

1.2.1 This is an attempt to review and evaluate the training programmes for the class II officers conducted by the RPATCs. Since inception in 1984, the RPATCs have been conducting several skill oriented courses for class II officers and employees. But evaluative study on training programmes for assessing the impact of such training on their performance is not known to have been made as yet. The centres have been conducting training programmes and trying to achieve the target of training; but very little is known as to whether the training programmes have met the desired objectives and created desired results in terms of the performance of the trainees. This study is a humble attempt in this direction.

1.3. Conceptual Issues

1.3.1 Broader context of training involves not only training narrowly defined but also education and development designed 'to improve competence to venturing into new area of activity and to move up and grow with the organisation'. This aspect of training is usually embedded in the objectives of a training programme. To be a success, a training programme has to attain those objectives. Generally, trainers put in their efforts and available resources for conducting a programme. A well designed evaluation study gives an idea on how much has been attained expost.

1.3.2 It is not easy to evaluate a training programme, especially those consisting mostly of theoretical lectures and discussions and dealing with the softer skills ; but it is possible. In this study an attempt has been made to identify the specific behaviours or activities that the trainers possess or do following the training and to identify, in some way, the benefits resulting from the training.

1.3.3 There is no denying that evaluation is very often beset with some practical problems such as lack of commitment, inappropriate design of the training programme - which sometimes follows the interest of the trainers rather than the need of the organisation or of the trainees. Besides, the area of evaluation does not have as many literature as many other areas. Moreover, there are factors which are not easy to control. Tremendous difficulties also arise for the researchers from such factors. We know that performance is the end result of a training programme. This is influenced not only by a training programme; but a host of other factors such as the relevance of the programme to the jobs, the environment in which the participant work and the self-motivation of the employees etc. These difficulties remain in conducting a meaningful evaluation.

1.4. Areas of Evaluation:

1.4.1 There may be evaluations of

- i) trainees;
- ii) trainers;
- iii) a particular programme and or
- iv) training Institute/Centres.

1.4.2 In evaluation trainees' role is supreme. They evaluate the trainers, the training programme and the performance of training institutes in conducting programmes. The trainers also evaluate the trainees through some sort of tests and examinations held during or at the end of a course. The trainees are provided with questionnaire both structured and unstructured through which they do the job of evaluation. Generally, they evaluate the course as a whole - its usefulness, effectiveness, and impact. They also evaluate managerial aspects, physical facilities, support services, positive and negative factors that have bearing on the training programmes. The strength and weakness of the course management is also evaluated.

1.4.3 Usually, evaluation of a training programme is undertaken by the trainees just after the conclusion of the programme. The trainees also evaluate the speaker who conducts a session. A common method of evaluation is reflected in the reports of the training institutes containing the number of hours of classes, man-days spent, the number of persons trained, the number of classes held and topics discussed. Undoubtedly, this is necessary for evaluation but not at all sufficient. The training institutes have a long way to go so far as evaluation study of the training programmes are concerned.

1.4.4 Infact, the training programmes should also be evaluated after the expiry of certain period of time by the trainees and/or their supervisors by administering necessary questionnaires to them. Such study will provide information on the impact of training on the performance of trainees at the end-user level. Post training evaluation can provide suitable answers to such questions as to what extent they have been benefited by the training in doing their jobs and changing their behaviour or how much training inputs they have been able to put to their work and apply in their activities.

1.5. Reasons for Evaluation

1.5.1 There may be many reasons for evaluation of a training programme. Some of them are to :

- i) determine whether a programme is accomplishing its objectives. Every properly designed programme does have one or more objectives. The(se) objective(s) should be stated in generally accepted terms(i.e.,measurable, specific, etc.). A very important purpose of the evaluation process is to see whether or not objectives are being (or have been) met.
- ii) identify the strength and weakness in a programme. An evaluation can help determine the effectiveness of the various components of programme.
- iii) determine the cost/benefit ratio of programme. An increasingly common reason for evaluation is to determine whether or not the programme justify the cost.

- iv) determine if the programme was appropriate. Sometimes evaluation can determine whether or not the original problem was indeed a training problem. Too often a training program is conducted to correct problems that cannot be corrected by training and
- v) identify to what extent the participants benefited from the programme. An evaluation can determine which participants excelled and which failed in implementing the skills or knowledge taught.
- vi) reinforce major points made to the participants. A follow-up evaluation can reinforce the information covered in a programme by attempting to measure the results accomplished by participants. It reminds the participants of what they should have accomplished or should be accomplishing.
- vii) gather data to assist in selling future programmes. In many situations, the training institutions are interested in why participants attend a specific programme.
- viii) decide who should participate in the future programmes. Sometimes, a follow-up evaluation simply determines the benefits of the programme. Communicating these benefits to prospective participants can help them decide whether or not they need to be involved in the programme.
- ix) establish a data base which the training institutes can use to demonstrate the productivity and effectiveness of training activities. This can also help improve and rebuild the course programme according to the suggestions and felt need of the trainees.

1.6. Accuracy of Evaluation

1.6.1 Evaluation should be accurate and valid as far as possible. All possible efforts and care should be taken for making evaluation factual, material and objective. However, in theoretical and general type of training, there is no 'best' way to evaluate. Evaluation techniques chosen must fit the situation in which they are used. To evaluate a programme one has to decide on appropriate evaluation instruments. An instrument is a data gathering device that come in variety of forms such as i) questionnaires (ii) attitude survey (iii) tests (iv) interviews (v) observations and (vi) performance records etc.

1.6.2 Irrespective of the type(s) of instrument used there are basic design principles which can lead to more effectiveness of the instrument(s). The most common ones are validity, reliability and usability of the instruments.

1.6.3 Validity : Probably the most important characteristic of an evaluation instrument is validity. A valid instrument measures for the person using the instrument what he wishes to measure. It refers to the evaluation following a training programme stating not only how much changes have been brought about; but also whether those changes are the ones which were expected. Besides, it should also be stated how much of the changes may be attributed to the training programme and how much is to be attributed to other factors. Validity is concerned with isolating the training effects so that the training programme can be evaluated objectively.

1.6.4 Reliability: It is the degree to which an evaluative instrument measures accurately or consistently what it purports to measure. A reliable instrument is one which is consistent in the sense that the subsequent measurement of the item under the same situation gives the same result. Reliability can be enhanced by administering such questionnaire as are unambiguous, clear and direct so that the respondents can understand them in the same way. To obtain reliability, the measuring instrument(s) should also be administered under fairly controlled and similar conditions.

1.6.5 Usability : The instrument(s) applied in evaluation should not only be valid and reliable but also easily useable. An evaluation design for assessing a training programme requires that the instruments are properly administer and scored and the results are interpreted meaningfully. An evaluator has to consider this aspect of usability while deciding on evaluation design.

1.7. Levels of Evaluation

1.7.1 There are various approaches determining levels of evaluation (such as Pocker approach, Bell system approach and CIO approach). However, Kirkpatrick approach is the most widely used approach. According to this approach, a training programme can be evaluated at the following levels:

- i) The trainee reactions
- ii) The change in trainee learning
- iii) Behavioural change(s) on the job
- iv) The result(s) to the organisation.

1.7.2 Evaluations are usually conducted at the first two levels. The trainers record the reactions of the trainees towards the training programmes, the sessions, the speakers or the facilities. Sometimes, the amount of learning the trainees obtained in the programme is also measured through some tests. This is done mostly by holding examinations at the end of the course or individual module. Evaluation is seldom conducted at the third and fourth levels because it takes lot more time and resources. Besides, very often the evaluators are not well equipped for conducting a study at those levels.

Chapter-II

2.1. Evaluation of training programmes of class II officers in the RPATCs

2.1.1 In the RPATCs, evaluation of the training programmes, course management and the concerned speakers is done by the trainees after the conclusion of a course conducted either for class II or class III employees. This type of evaluation addresses such questions as what has been the content of the course, how it has been presented, what was omitted, what should have been included, what was the standard of performance of the speakers the level of efficiency of the course management etc.

2.1.2 All these are assessed by evaluating the reaction of the trainees. They fill-in structured questionnaires in a course ending session in presence of the instructors. The learning activities are mostly assessed by examinations and tests held during the course period. This sort of evaluation has been alleged to be prejudiced and concerned with only the "showing" and "knowing" aspects of the course. For obvious reasons what remain unattended and unanswered is what the trainees are expected to be able to do and what they actually do after the training is over. That is, the "doing" aspect of training.

2.1.3 The trainers of RPATCs may have sufficient reasons to put forward in support of the current evaluation system. Infact, they have very little time and resources to undertake such evaluation on trainees' performances, changes in their attitudes and behaviours and that in their organisations. The RPATCs are ill-equipped to do that job. The reasons seem to be reasonable; but that makes it more necessary to conduct such an evaluation. The end-of-the course assessment is relatively easier but the post-training evaluation is not an easy task. It is difficult to determine the effects tangibly and express them in quantifiable terms. The BPATC felt strongly about the necessity for assessing the impact and effect of the training programme of class-II officials. Hence, it has undertaken this project on evaluation of training programme of class II officials as part of a series of evaluation studies.

2.2. The objectives of the study:

2.2.1 The objective of this study is an evaluation of training programmes offered by the RPATCs for the class II officials, the impact of training on their performance, their behavioural and attitudinal changes and the changes in their organisations. Specifically the objectives are :

- i) to make a review of training programme for class II officers conducted in the RPATCs;
- ii) to assess the impact & effect of training on the performances of the trainees;

2.3 Methodology

2.3.1 To realise the objectives of a study methodology is adopted gives serious consideration to the means available. There may be three types of methodologies for planning a research work. The first one is 'systemic method' which defines ends or objectives to be realised and then chooses means or methods for achieving them. The 'expedient method' is the reverse of the systematic method. It identifies the means or methods first and then sets the ends or objectives. The 'piecemeal method' inter-relates means with ends and defines each other as interdependant. It is held that the systematic method is ideal, the expedient method is prudent and the piecemeal method realistic. In this study piecemeal approach has been chosen.

2.3.2 The broadly based objectives as mentioned above, carry a number of issues that need to be analysed while evaluating a training programme. We usually focus on what has been taught, how it was taught. The learning process, media, course design, contents, curricula; methods media of teaching, speakers' performances, course management. Physical and other facilities also come within the purview of the programme evaluation. In this study such aspects of training programmes have also been evaluated mainly through the assessment of reaction and observations of the respondents and researchers.

2.3.4 Considering the constraints of time and resources, the scope of the study has been limited to a few issues of major concern and concentrated only on the evaluation of the training programmes of class II officers run by the RPATCs. Those selected for interview include a number of trainees of such courses and some of the officers who were nominated but could not participate in the designated courses. A few nominating authorities and supervising officers were also selected. The respondents constituted of the following categories. The number of respondents has been mentioned against each category.

Classes of respondents		No. of respondents
i)	Trained/trainee class II officers	100
ii)	Heads of Training Centres	04
iii)	Class II Officer who could not participate	16
iv)	Nominating authority	16
v)	Supervisors	20

		156

2.3.5 The total number of respondents covered in this study is one hundred and fifty six. Four Divisional Headquarters, the seats of the RPATCs, were selected purposively as the hub of data collection activities. Because trainees of each regional centres come from the respective division. The trainee officers were selected through purposive sampling from amongst those who received or were receiving training in the RPATCs. The nominating agencies, the supervisors and the class II officers who failed to receive training were chosen on the basis of random sampling and also considering the problems access and availability. The number of respondents had to be kept within a reasonable limit so that they could be reached, approached & interviewed within the limited time and resources.

The respondents were drawn from the following categories of officers:

- i) Administrative Officers;
- ii) Office Superintendent;
- iii) Superintendent;

- iv) Assistant Education Officers;
- v) Cooperative Officers;
- vi) Inspectors of Police;
- vii) Sub-Registers;
- viii) Assistant Extension Officers;
- ix) Project Implementation Officers;
- x) Upazila Revenue Officers;
- xi) Statisticians and
- xii) Assistant Accounts Officers.

2.3.6 This study emphasised on the evaluation of course contents, course curricula, course management aspects, speakers' performances, physical facilities, methodologies adopted in achieving course objectives. Attempts have also been made to record the observations on the impact and effect of training on the performance improvement and behavioural changes of the trainees and the organisations they serve.

2.3.7 As for collection of data both primary and secondary sources were explored. Necessary information, data, opinion, reaction and comments were collected from the respondents by administering separate types of questionnaires to each class of respondents. These are mentioned as primary data. The questionnaires were both structured and open-ended to suit the needs of the study. Information & data were also collected from relevant literature, brochure, handouts and has been referred to as secondary data in the study (see bibliography and references). Thus the study is based on reaction assessment, opinion survey, observations and secondary data.

Chapter- III

3.1 Findings:

3.1.1 The class II officers constitute a small fraction of the civilian government functionaries¹ (Annexure-1). Infact, this category of officers is like a decaying species in the biological world. In 1987, there were little over forty thousand class II government officers. Because of the upgradation of many of the class II posts, their relative number has dealined in the recent past.

3.1.2 Even though locationally this group forms a class of officers, they are composed of heterogeneous elements belonging to so many diverse disciplines and areas that it is difficult to trace the common factors of their identity. They come from many different functional areas grades and categories. However, it is possible to list the functions performed and specify the positions held by different categories of the class II government officials. Generally, they hold liaison position between the class I officers on the onehand and the class III and IV employees on the other. Functionally, they have something common with that of the class I officers. They initiate actions, supervise finance, personnel, and logistics, and help make and implement decisions and perform day to day activities.

3.1.3 The functional division between the class II officers and other governmental functionaries can not be watertight. However, the treatment of this issue may run in several terms. The position of a class II officer may be analysed in terms of his role in the process of deccision making and implementation. Usually, he helps the superior officers in the decision making process. Once a decision is taken he helps in execution. Very often he performs supervisory and lower level managerial functions as well.

1. Statistics of Civil Officers and Staff of the Government of the People's Republic of Bangladesh, Ministry of Establishment, Government of the People's Republic of Bangladesh 1989, pp. 1-2.

3.1.4 Sometimes in some respects, inter class differences between class I and Class II is found to be minimal. In some respect a few class III employees also come close to class II officers. If the civil servants are broadly divided among (a) those who make policies and take decisions and those who implement in terms of guided performance of specific jobs and tasks, majority of class I and class II officers are on the same boat. Real distinction probably lies in the specific roles played by class II officers and their relative importance.

3.1.5 On the other hand, intra-class diversity is so much that sometimes lumping them together simply does not make sense. They differ in terms of education, experience, mode of recruitment, selection and appointment. Service condition also differ widely.

3.1.6 Unlike class I officer who are appointed by an authority of the highest executive level, class II officers are appointed by the heads of the ministries/ divisions/ directorates / office. On the otherhand class III employees are appointed by the mid-level officials who usually exercise delegated authority. In terms of qualifications and experiences, they differ widely. The promotion prospects of class II officials are not as limited as that for class III employees. Some of the high officials come from class II officers. The process of a promotion is however, slower. Relative to class I officer they take longer time for promotion to the next position. Some of the class II services also serve a feeder post for different BCS cadres.

3.1.7 This however, does not give a functionally distinctive list of jobs which may guide designing appropriate training programmes for class II officer. Therefore, efforts have been made to trace the attributes that a class II officers should possess

Table-1 : Opinion of the Supervising Officers about the knowledge & skill required of the Class II Officers

Sl. No.	Areas of skills knowledge	No. of respondent	Percentage
1.	Familiarity to the law, rules BSR of Bangladesh government	14	70
2.	Administration and personnel management	9	45
3.	Essential occupational general/ technical knowledge & skill	10	50
4.	Financial managemnet	7	35
5.	Preparation of project work plan	7	35
6.	Sincerety, discipline and punctuality	5	25
7.	Capability to motivate subordinates for work	5	25

3.1.8 It is held that they should have knowledge of Office Management, Governmental policies, Rules and regulations especially those relating to personnel, finance and logistics and the rules of conduct and discipline. The respondents felt that he should be patient, sincere, punctual, able to supervise office work, understand human psychology and be capable of improving human relations. This suggest that it is difficult to isolate those attributes which distinguish a class II officer from other officials. However, a fair amount of description of the qualities they require and the functions they perform is possible. We find that to some extent the functional differences between a class II and other officers is more a matter of degree than of kind. This degree also differs depending on the nature of the organisation, strength of the personnel, composition of functionaries etc.

3.1.9 Training Needs: In order to have an idea about the training needs, the respondents were asked a few questions on the knowledge and skill requirements of class II officials.

Table 2 : Training Needs Assessment of Class II Officers

Sl. No.	Head of	Trained/	Officers	Nominating	Supervising	Total
1. Problem solving, decision making, planning	4 (100.0)1	92 (92.0)1	12 (75.0)2	16 1(100.0)	20 1(100.0)	
2. Use of Computer	2 (50.0)	81 (81.0)3	8 (50.0)	10 (62.5)	9 (45.0)	
3. Project Management	2 (50.0)	85 (85.0)	13 (81.25)	14 2(87.5)	18 2(90.0)	
4. Group dynamics	3 (75.0)2	72 (72.0)4	10 (62.5)3	11 4(68.75)	13 4(65.0)	
5. Financial Management	3 (75.0)2	65 (65.0)	12 (75.0)2	13 3(81.25)		
6. Revenue Administration		57 (57.0)	6	(37.5)		
7. Office & File Management	4 (100.0)	58 (58.0)			2 (10.0)	
8. Conduct & Discipline	1 (25.0)	63 (63.0)	8 (50.0)	13 3(81.25)	5 (25.0)	
9. Foundation Training		61 (61.0)				
10. Official Communications	2 (50.0)3		8 (50.0)4	13 3(81.25)		
11. Human Relations	2 (50.0)3	-	5 (31.25)	2 (12.50)	11 (55.0)	
12. Administration	-	-	-	8 (50.0)	14 3(70.0)	
13. Personnel Management	4 (100.0)1					

*Rating rank

3.1.10 It appears from the above table that four out of five categories of respondents ranked the "Problem Solving, Decision making and Plan formulation" above all other requirements. Financial Management and Official Communication came next. In response

to the open ended questions some of them expressed their feeling about the need for training on "Computer Applications" and "Group Dynamics" while some others required some kind of foundation training for class II officers.

3.1.11 A separate group of officers were asked about 'those requirements of training which may be related to career development'. Their responses are given in the table-3. The areas include office management, administration, personnel development, office communications etc. Here we have different ranking; but the nature of priority and the areas are similar to those described above.

Table 3: Opinion of the Participant about the Areas of Training for Career Development.

Areas	No. of respondent	Percentage
Officer Management	20	22.99
Administrative	16	18.39
Personal Development	24	27.59
Office Communication	10	11.49
Professional skill Development	15	17.24
Socio-economic Development	2	2.30
Total	87	100.00

Sample size : 87

3.1.12 The responses of the participants as regards "effectiveness of training in service life" presented in table-4 suggests that the priority areas for career development has been rated highly in terms of their skill development potential. Such courses include Discipline and Conduct Rules, Office and File Management and Financial Management. This conforms to what has been obtained from the respondents under different set of questions.

Table 4: Opinion of the Participants about the Usefulness of Training Course in Service Life.

Arena	No. of respondent	Percentage
Office and file management	30	30
Discipline and conduct Rules	39	39
Financial management	20	20
Induction course	14	14
Refresher course	4	4
Revenue administration	3	3

One or more than one responses are given by the same respondent.

3.1.13 Thus our reading is that the class II government officials need training in order to be able to detect, analyse and solve problems, help making of a decisions, facilitate implementation of an action plan, handle management of office, personnel and finance.

3.1.14 The officers are nominated for training by different government bodies. Some of them fail to participate. This accounts, among other things, for underutilization of the scarce training resources. There are a number of reasons for their failure to attend a course they are nominated to.

Table 5 : Reasons for Inadequate Participation in the Training Programmes

Reason	Classification of Respondents					Total	Percentage
	Head of the training institute	Trained/ Trainee Officer	Officers who did not participate even though nominated	Nominating authority	Supervision Officer		
Workload/Fewer Officer/Absence of replacement	1 (25.0)	3 (25.0)	10 (62.5)	10 (62.5)	-	-	-
Fewer nomination	4 (100.00)	-	-	-	-	-	-
Family problems	-	1 (4.33)	4 (25.0)	-	-	-	-
Transfer	-	-	1 (6.25)	-	-	-	-
Physical problems of trainees	-	2 (16.66)	1 (6.25)	-	-	-	-
Not being duly informed	1 (25.0)	1 (8.33)	-	-	-	-	-
Housing facility	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Failure to obtain release	-	5 (41.65)	-	-	-	-	-

3.1.15 It appear from the above table that they failed to attend the courses not because of family problems but because they were not released from their offices. According the them lack of adequate staff for replacement and absence of positive attitude of the superiors towards training are among the factors which account for this situation. All the respondents in this category (100%) feel that training improves service quality. They attach importance to some of the training courses namely Financial Management, Office Administration and the Discipline and Conduct courses as shown in Table-6 .

Table 6: Opinion of the officers who did not participate in the course about their training need.

Sl.No.	Areas	No. of respondent		Percentage of the respondent	
		Needed	Not Needed	Needed	Not needed
1.	Financial Management	12	-	75.00	-
2.	Official Communication	8	-	50.00	-
3.	Discipline & conduct	8	-	50.00	-
4.	Revenue Management	6	-	37.00	-
5.	Human Relations	5	-	31.25	-

One or more than one answer is given by the respondent.

Their preference fairly matches with the opinion of those who have been trained even though the later group differ in terms of rating described in table-2.

3.1.16 To address the issue of non-attendance, a few measures have been suggested. Firstly, the authority should fill in the vacancies in the offices & especially those which are significant for smooth functioning of the office. Secondly, the superior officers should properly appreciate the need for training and duly release the officers for attending the training courses. Thirdly, disciplinary action may also be taken but discriminately against those who fail to join the training programmes. Fourthly, better physical facilities and training environment may be provided as incentive for training. Fifthly, training should be related to career.

3.1.17 It appears from the opinion survey (table-7) that coercion in terms of disciplinary action would have induced more of attendance ; but participation could also be higher if pursuasive measures were taken. The respondents feel that attendance will be larger if training is related to career i. e. promotion than if failure to attend a training course involves disciplinary action.

Table-7 :Response of Officers if training were related to disciplinary action or promotion.

If training were related to	response	No. of respondents	Percentage of the respondent
a. Disciplinary Action	1. Insist for release order from the authority	10	62.50
	2. Show reasonable cause	5	31.25
	3. Ignore family obstacles	1	6.25
	Total	16	100.00
b. Promotion	1. Release order by self initiative	13	81.25
	2. Anrange Alternative Replacement of offices by pursuing the authority.	2	12.50
	3. Ignore family problem	1	6.25
Total		16	100.00

3.1.18 Training Facilities :Though training of class II government officials is conducted in four regional centres, only three have dormitories. In Dhaka, the RPATC building which is to meet both dormitory and functional requirement is under construction. Therefore, none of the courses held in RPATC, Dhaka could be made residential. The RPATCs, other than the one in Dhaka, conduct residential courses. But in every RPATC the campus is too small to provide fields or facilities for outdoor games, sports and physical exercise.

Table-8 : Physical Facilities of the RPATCs

Name of the Centre	Dormitory	Nof of Beds	Class room	No. of seats	Overhead projector	P. A system	Radio cassette	Colour T.V.	Photostat Machine	Cyclostyle Machine	Electric Stencil	Comm. procure
Chittagong	1	40	3	100	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Khulna	2	50	2	80	2	1 set	1	1	1	-	-	-
Dhaka	0	-	3	150	3	1 set	-	-	-	-	-	-
Rajshahi	2	70	3	120	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-

3.1.19 The above table contains a brief of the physical facilities in the RPTCs. There are 450 seats available in four regional RPATCs. As for training aid, Chittagong and Rajshahi Centre did not have any Over Head Projector (OHP), Public Address (PA) System, Photocopy machine. Other than Khulna none reported having such training equipment as Radio cassette, colour T. V., cyclostyle machine, electric stencil cutter and 66mm projector for display of films.

Table 9: Opinion of the Second Class Officers About the Training Aids Used and required.

a. Training Aid Used

Sl. No.	Opinion	No. of respondents	Percentage
1.	Handout	65	65
2.	Guard File	3	3
3.	Film Show	2	2
4.	Projector	1	1

b. Training Aids Demanded

1.	Sufficient Relevant Books & Article	25	25
2.	Projector	22	22
3.	Film Show & V.D.O	20	20
4.	Sufficient Handout	15	15
5.	Government Gazette	7	7
6.	P.A. System	6	6
7.	Computer	4	4

3.1.20 The RPATCs are understaffed. There should have been eighty eight persons working in them. Infact there are 3-4 vacancies mostly at the officers - level at each regional centre. This has been shown in the following table.

Table 9a : Staff strenght of the Regional Centres (as of July '89)

Class of employees	Working	Sanctioned Post	Vacant post
Class I	10	12	2
Class II	4	4	0
Class III	37	47	10
Class IV	23	25	2
Total	74	88	14

3.1.21 The courses for class II government officers organised by the RPATCs are residential ; but there is no privision for cook, even though cooking utensils have been procured under the project. The regional centres require additional manpower in order to improve their performance. The trainees placed a long list of required improvements in the dormitories.

Table-10 : Opinion of the Trainees About the Dormitory facilities

Standard/opinion	No. of respondent	Percentage
Sub-standard residential arrangement	27	27
Lack of dining and canteen facility	27	27
Lack of utencils	9	9
Lack of cleanliness	6	6
Lack of sports and recreational facilities	9	9
Lack of separate accommodation for female	5	5
Lack of waiters, room attendants	2	2
Lack of prayer facilities	1	1
Lack of facilities for first aid	1	1
Not enough facilities	23	23
Sufficient	18	18
No response	4	4

One or more than one answer is given by the same respondant.

3.1.21 It appears from the table-10 that they felt the necessity of dining and canteen facilities, sports and recreation, separate accommodation for female trainees, room/class attendants etc. The trainees have reported that only four types of training aids have been used; but the trainees felt the necessity for (i) providing relevant books and publication in sufficient number (ii) using projectors (iii) arranging film show and training videos and (v) distributing sufficient number of handouts (iv) PA system and computers. If this is compared to the list required by the trainers (table-11), we see considerable amount of gap between the two.

Table-11: Requirements of the Regional Centres

Requirements	Number			
	Dhaka	Chittagong	Rajshahi	Khulna
1. Graph	-	1	-	-
2. Map	-	1	-	-
3. Flipchart	1	1	1	-
4. Projector	-	1	-	-
5. Documentary Film	-	(as required)	-	-
6. Computer	1	1	1	2
7. V. C. R.	2	-	-	1
8. Projector Film	50	-	-	1
9. VDO Cassette	-	-	-	1
10. Audio Cassette	-	-	-	1
11. Duplicating machine	-	-	-	1
12. White Board/ Magnetic Board	4/4	-	1	-
13. A. V. Machine	-	-	4	1

3.1.22 However, the gap may be apparent; because what the trainees demanded was infact programme requirement while the trainers put forward the demands more for the training institutes than for a training programme. However, the fact remains that the training aids used are few and many of the requirements of trainees remain unfulfilled.

3.1.23 Training Courses : Until recently the STIs also conducted training programmes for class II government officers at a very small scale. However, it is the Regional Public Administration Training Centres became the nerve centre of their training since 1984. The RPATCs at Dhaka, Rajshahi, Khulna and Chittagong conducted the following courses for class II officers:

- i) Refreshers' Course
- ii) Induction Course
- iii) Short Development & Administration Course
- iv) Financial Administration Course
- v) Conduct & Discipline Course
- vi) Revenue Administration Course
- vii) Official Correspondence & File Management Course.

3.1.24 So far the RPATCs have conducted 109 courses and trained 2334 officers. Relative to a target of 3860 trainees, the rate of achievement is 60.47% only. This suggests that some amount of capacity remains under utilised (table-12).

Table-12: Training of Class II Officials March/1984-June/90

Sl. No.	Name of Courses	Couse	Trrget	Achievement	if %	Comment
1.	Induction Course	26	1040	488	46.92%	
2.	Refreshers course	17	510	314	61.57%	
3.	Financial Management course	15	560	306	54.64%	
4.	Revenue Administration course	8	300	196	65.34%	
5.	Conduct & Decipline	22	820	592	72.20%	
6.	Official communication	21	630	438	69.52%	
		109	3860	2334	60.47%	

3.1.25 Beginning with three courses in the year 1985, the number of courses has risen upto six in the year 1988. These courses may be divided broadly into three, overlapping categories namely (i) skill developing courses such as conduct & discipline course or official communication course, (ii) personality developing courses such as induction course and (iii) specific purpose course such as the revenue administration course. It is only a homogeneous group (e.g. Tahshildars) who require specific purpose type courses. Details of the courses conducted by the RPATCs for class II officers, are given in Annexure-2.

3.1.26 Trainee officers : Other than in Revenue Administration Course, the trainee officers come from diverse functional areas. The trainees include the following categories of class-II officials:

- i) Administrative Offices;
- ii) Office Superintendent;
- iii) Superintendent;
- iv) Assistant Education Officers;
- v) Cooperative Officers;
- vi) Inspectors of Police;
- vii) Sub-Registers;
- viii) Assistant Extension Officers;
- ix) Project Implementation Officers;
- x) Upazila Revenue Officers;
- xi) Statisticians and
- xii) Assistant Accounts Officers

3.1.27 Courses and Content of the Courses : We are not sure as to whether the courses offered serve the purpose they are taken for ; however the trainees of different courses felt that the programme was helpful. They suggested addition of a number of new courses namely, "Computer Applications," "Management of Rural Development" etc. The current courses may help create the skills which are required of class II officials at present or in the near future. However, the new courses suggested also deserve due consideration. In order to meet the challenges of growth and development, the offices of the future will be more and more automated. Therefore, to facilitate adjustment the new office technologies it is necessary that the regional centres conduct such courses as computer applications.

3.1.28 A survey of the training courses shows that most of the topic suits only lectures. It seems that the training courses for the class II officers have been designed in a way which allows little scope for experimentation with and use of other methods. Besides, training inputs works not in the vacuum. A mental framework based on an understanding of the society provides better environment for the effectiveness of training inputs. Even the general purpose type courses for class II officers appear to be deficient in this respect. It may be noted that an understanding of the environment allows one to locate his position and identify his role as a member of the society. Training inputs aimed at improving the professional skill is helpful for carrying out assigned roles ; but to be effective in terms of application of training, it is necessary to have a proper understanding of the socio-economic situation we live in, the framework we operate under and the people we interact with both vertically and horizontally.

3.1.29 Group Dynamics : Most of the jobs in a public office are performed by a team. Since the government office are structured vertically, a team in such offices consists of members belonging to different levels. Officials of class II level constitute an important part of the team. For better performance, a group has to be well integrated ; but the nature and degree of integration, to a large extent, depends on the team spirit which requires sharing among the members. Therefore, we wanted to know if the respondents, as team members, felt that there were issues to be handled, functions to be performed and ideas to be shared by all or most of those who belong to a vertically structured group.

3.1.30 In answer to the question whether employees at different levels should be trained together almost two thirds of the respondent trainee officers held that officials of different level (viz class II, II & I) should not be trained together.

Table-13
Opinion about the Arrangement of Training along with the Class I and Class III employees

Opinion	Respondant			
	Heads of the Training Institution	Participants	Nominating	Supervising Officer
Should be	1	32	3	2
Should not be	3	60	13	18
No opinion	-	8	-	-
Total	4	100	16	20

Only one third replied in the positive. The heads of the training institutions as well as the nominating officers and supervisors of the trainee officers oppose the idea of unified training programmes for multi-level officials. This opinion conforms to an attitude in favour of status quo and a possible resistance against changes for vertical integration through training. This may indicate lack of appreciation of the need for this approach to development of team spirit among the functionaries at different levels. This may also indicate difficulties in designing training input which is common to the vertically related functionaries.

3.1.31 The Trainers : The trainers are composed of the guest speakers and the faculty members. The composition or the ratio of these two categories depends on such factors as the number of the faculty, availability of resource persons locally etc. It is also affected by the policy decision regarding relative use of the guest speakers and faculty members. For example an attempt to encourage own officers to take responsibilities will increase faculty involvement, but it will be otherwise if the idea is to enrich courses by involving outside individuals and institutions.

3.1.32 A trainer, whatever category he belongs to, is evaluated by the trainees.

Table-14 : Opinion of the Trainees about the Performance of the Trainers

Performance Areas	Below standard	Less than average	Average	Good	Very good	Total
Knowledge of the subject	2 (4.76)	4 (9.52)	16 (38.24)	19 (45.24)	1 (2.38)	42 (100)
Presentation Style	-	5 (11.9)	22 (52.38)	14 (33.33)	1 (2.38)	42 (100)
Quality of Handouts	8 (19.05)	14 (33.33)	14 (33.33)	5 (11.9)	1 (2.38)	42 (100)

* Figures in the parentheses indicate percentage. Sample size : 42

3.1.33 The above table shows that the participants of different courses have evaluated their trainers in terms of (a) knowledge and authority on the subject (b) style of presentation (delivery) and (iv) the quality of their handouts. More than 50% trainees ranked the trainers to be "Average or Below Average". Besides, the rating has declined beginning with 'Knowledge and command over the subject matters' through 'delivery' down to the 'quality of the handouts'. This depicts a discouraging picture. One may describe this as a situation characterised by "poor" knowledge "poorer" delivery and "poorest" handouts.

3.1.34 While some of the guest speakers do very well by virtue of their knowledge and experience, usually the faculty members do better than the guest speakers. This was found to happen consistently over a number of courses. This is probably because most of the guest speakers, who concentrate in their own sphere of activity have little time to devote for additional mastery of a particular subject, preparation of lectures, updating of handouts and improving the delivery of the same.

Table-15: Proportion of Faculty Member / Guest Speaker

Centre Faculty	Dhaka	Chittagong	Rajshahi	Khulna	Average Percentage
Faculty Member	80%	70%	70%	60%	
Guest Speaker	20%	30%	30%	40%	

3.1.35 It appears from the above table that in case of training for class-II officials the faculty members constitute the larger proportion of the speakers. They range between 60-80% in terms of sessions conducted. Unfortunately, if this information is related to the findings in table-14 it is suggested that even high level of involvement of RPATC staff in better performance of the trainers and improved quality of training is yet to be achieved. This is indeed a strong suggestion. For policy makers in training a major concern should be the quality of the trainers. Quality of training, in the ultimate analysis, depends to a large extent on the quality of the trainers.

3.1.36 The following table summarises the desired qualities of a trainer.

Table-16: Required Qualities of Trainer of the Trainees (N=32)

Required qualities	Trainers	Percentage
Contemporary Knowledge on relative subject	11	34.38
Devotion	10	31.25
Firm determination	1	3.13
Presentation technique	8	25.00
Educational qualification in related subjects	9	28.13
Motivation technique	1	3.13
Perseverence	4	12.50
Cerativity	1	3.13
Desire	4	12.50
Intuition	3	9.38
Indivlduality/personality	3	9.38
Experience	11	34.38
Quality of Co-ordination	6	18.76
Friendly attitude	1	3.13

(Multiple answers are recorded)

Source: "Training Needs Identification for Training of Trainers, a Study by Jalil & Rahman."

* This refers to the number of respondents who were all trainers.

The trainees like to have a trainer who is personally involved, sincere, co-operative, disciplined, motivated/motivating and possessed of manners and etiquette. On the otherhand, there is a study on Training of Trainers (TOT) where the trainers enumerated a number of qualities they think a trainer should possess. The study emphasises on knowledge devotion, motivational aspect, perseverance attitude etc of a trainer. This has been described in the following table.

Table-17: Opinion of the Trainees Regarding conduct of the Trainers and Other Supporting Staff

Opinion Areas of Conduct	Below	Average	Satisfactory	Highly	More than	Total
Personal involvement	6 (6)	23 (23)	47 (47)	21 (21)	3 (3)	100 (100)
Sincerity	2 (2)	13 (13)	41 (41)	38 (38)	6 (6)	100 (100)
Co-operation	-	15 (15)	43 (43)	25 (35)	7 (7)	100 (100)
Manners and etiquette	2 (2)	14 (14)	40 (40)	36 (36)	8 (8)	100 (100)
Discipline	2 (2)	23 (23)	42 (42)	30 (30)	3 (3)	100 (100)
Motivation	2 (2)	12 (12)	50 (50)	31 (31)	5 (5)	100 (100)

* Figures in the parentheses indicate percentage

3.1.37 The results of two studies are not mutually exclusive. However there is considerable difference. This suggests a substantial difference between the perception of trainers and the trainees as to what qualities a trainer should possess. This may also be a reflection of omission in either of the studies, which might have made the differences in finding so sharp.

3.1.38 Training Methods : Training methods constitute an important aspect of a training design. There may be various training methods such as lectures, syndicates etc. A list of training methods is given in the annexure-3. The methods include group discussion, study tour, case study, role play etc. Most of these methods are not applied in training for class-II government officials. It appears from the following table that the methods used in training of class - II officials are limited only to (i) lecture, (ii) group discussion, (iii) preparation of reports, (iv) exercises and (v) end of the course examination.

Table 18 : Training Techniques for Training of Class II Officials

Training Techniques	Dhaka	Chittagong	Rajshahi	Khulna	Percentage
Lecture	1	1	1	1	100%
Group Discussion	1	1	1	1	100%
Preparation of reports & Case studies	1	-	1	1	75%
Role Playing	-	-	-	-	-
End of the Course examination	1	1	1	1	100%
Excercise	1	1	1	1	100%
Study Tour	-	-	-	-	-
Tour Report Essay Competition	-	-	-	-	-

Some of the training institutes claimed to have undertaken study tour but in fact, those were at best tours with very little of study. This is probably why study tour has not been mentioned at all by the participant as a method of training.

Jalil and Rahman, Training Needs Identification for Training of Trainers, PATC, 1990.

3.1.39 Training methods determine and are sometimes determined by the training content. It is likely that the training methods being used in the RPATCs at present might have been determined simultaneously with the training content. Since the contents of training for class II officers are highly theoretical they, to a large extent, favour lecture method. It is not known whether other options such as syndicate, group discussion, case study, practical works etc. were given due consideration while designing a course or whether those methods were tried later on while its implementation. It is possible to make certain marginal changes in training techniques in isolation. However, it is an imperative that the training techniques are determined in course of training design. In order to do that it may be necessary to bring about changes in the course contents in keeping with the purpose of the course.

3.1.40 Assignment & Exercise : A large number (58%) of the trainee officers did not feel having given enough assignment. This observation is supported by their response on exercise. Most of the trainees feel that there is need for more exercises. This situation indicates a soft approach to training management. The courses offered for class II government officials are mainly skill developing in nature and such courses are better learned with exercises than with lectures. So, more emphasis should be given on exercises & tasks. Evening tasks and homeworks seem to have left little impression on the trainees; because large majority of trainees did not mentioned having felt the pressure of or done any homework/assignment.

3.1.41 Training Aid and Handouts: Only four types of training aids namely handouts, guard files, film show and projector were reported to have been used. Handouts constitutes the largest (65%) percentage of training aids. But only a few trainees (36%) consider that the handouts given were sufficient in number and good in quality. Section B of the table shows that the demand pattern was different. The trainees felt the need for sufficient library facilities in terms of relevant books and articles. They also required adequate training aid such as projector, training films and public address system etc.

3.1.42 Balance Between Lecture / Discussion / Practical Works: The trainees feel that the composition of lectures, discussions and practical works is realistic. However, others have given a mixed view regarding balance among different methods. The latter seems to be more appropriate; because the trainees did not have any alternative to compare with the present arrangements. The responses on exercise and assignments suggest that they would probably prefer a different composition of the course content as well as the training methods used.

3.1.43 Sequencing : Sometimes ordering/ sequencing of a course or the lectures, have some bearing on the outcome of a programme. Even though the training programmes for class II officers may be organised in a better possible order, some of the trainees and trainers considered the current ordering to be satisfactory.

3.1.44 Use of Audio-visual (AV) Equipment : The audio-visual equipment is powerful training aid. It has been regarded useful by most of the trainees; but unfortunately, there has been fewer use of AV aids than it could be. In some cases only films and projectors were used. Most of the AV equipment remained unutilised or underutilised. This has happened not because of inadequacy of facilities but probably because training programmes have been so designed that fewer use of AV aid was required. This situation may also arise if the training managers themselves do not properly appreciate the effectiveness of the use of AV aid.

3.1.45 Use of Library : Every Regional Centre has a library with considerable number of books. The readership from among the trainees ranges between 20-50% ; library resources remain mostly underutilised. The reasons, gathered from different sources, are as follows: (i) list of the books available in the library do not match the requirements of trainees (ii) absence of adequate government publications (iii) absence of book / materials on the content of the training courses (iv) lack of proper management of the library (v) unsuitable library hours. Library remains open only during officer hours when the trainees attend classes.

3.1.46 Recreational Facilities :The recreational facilities consists only of TV. There is no arrangement for outdoor games whatsoever. Other than playing cards there is no other indoor games facilities! Even though the courses for class II officers range between one week to one month, the trainees are not required to undergo physical exercise which is compulsory for class I officers in the foundation course. None reported to have had any film show or display of recreational vedios/films during his training period at the RPATCs. Social events like cultural function are not known to have been organised during a course period.

3.1.47 Impact of training: An effort has been made to identify some indicators for the effectiveness of training which may somehow reflect the impact of training upon the organisation. The ranking of different indicators of change is merely suggestive even though it is possible to quantify those indicators. In fact what we have here is an impressionistic measure of some capabilities and traits of the trainee officers. These traits include consciousness about responsibility, professional knowledge, punctuality, discipline, sincerity and quality of work etc. The results of the opinion survey is furnished below:

Table-19 : Opinion of the Supervising Officers about skill and efficiency of the class II officers before and after training.

Areas	Pre-training stage				Total No.	Post Training stage				Total No
	Excellent	Very Good	Good	Average		Excellent	Very Good	Good	Average	
Sense of responsibility	6(30)	4(20)	8(40)	2(10)	20	13(65)	5(25)	1(5)	1(5)	20
Professional knowledge	4(20)	10(50)	3(15)	3(15)		14(70)	5(25)	-	1(5)	
Punctuality	7(35)	3(15)	9(45)	1(5)		13(65)	6(30)	-	1(5)	
Discipline	5(25)	8(40)	5(25)	2(10)		12(60)	7(35)	-	1(5)	
Sincerity	4(20)	8(40)	8(40)	-		13(65)	7(35)	-	-	
Relation with colleague	2(10)	10(50)	5(25)	3(15)		12(60)	3(35)	-	1(5)	
Volume & quality of work	4(20)	7(35)	7(35)	2(10)		13(65)	5(25)	1(5)	1(5)	
Control & Supervision	2(10)	9(45)	5(25)	4(20)		10(50)	8(40)	-	2(10)	
Ability to implement a decision	-	11(55)	6(30)	3(15)		11(55)	6(30)	1(5)	2(10)	
Oral & writing ability	3(15)	7(35)	6(30)	4(20)		10(50)	6(30)	1(5)	3(15)	
Mass Communication	4(20)	5(25)	7(35)	4(20)		9(45)	8(40)	1(5)	2(10)	
Value system	6(30)	6(30)	6(30)	2(10)		14(70)	5(25)	-	1(5)	
Honesty	9(45)	3(15)	5(25)	3(15)		12(60)	6(30)	-	2(10)	
Overall Behaviour	4(20)	9(45)	6(30)	1(5)		14(70)	5(25)	-	1(5)	

Figures in the parentheses indicate percentage.

3.1.48 There are certain faculties which are developed over a long period of time and there are certain traits which are formed in the long run as well. It is difficult to instill or despel those traits and habits by mere inputs of shorter duration training courses. It is suggested from the survey that some people do not improve in some areas such as 'punctuality' and overall behaviour. There are also areas such as 'oral and writing capability', 'ability to implement decision' etc in which some are affected by training. A large percentage of the trainees is likely to improve in terms of their 'consciousness' and 'sense of responsibility', 'professional knowledge', 'punctuality', 'discipline', 'sincerity', 'relation with colleagues', 'volume and quality of work', 'control and supervision', 'ability to implement a decision' and 'ability to express orally or in writing'. It is held by many that the capability to communicate with the masses and their value system etc. are also influenced by training. This report of the opinion survey is encouraging; however, before any assertion is made it is necessary to verify these findings with further research and follow-up evaluation studies.

3.1.49 Training and Working Condition : There is generally held belief that working environment in the government offices seldom favours change and that the situation at the working place is inimical to the implementation of improvements learned through training. Most of the trainees feel otherwise. According to them, it is true that the environmental deficiencies and lackings are there. Even with these deficiencies which are derived of political, social, economic, or other factors, it is possible to implement some improvements learned through training.

3.1.50 Training and Attitude : It is an area which deserves topmost priority in designing a training programme; because performance depends, to a great deal, on the attitude of the agent. Attitude is formed by many different influences such as family, education, religion, ethics, social norms and values etc. It is also influenced by knowledge, skill and information. In order to appropriately respond to a situation it is necessary to have required knowledge and capability to do certain thing required to meet a situation. This is necessary; but not sufficient to ensure certain expected behavior. The crucial question then is what are the necessary and sufficient conditions to ensure required response from a functionary ? In a developed society individual behaviour is shaped, to a large extent, by the collective norms and values. Very often this social guidance to individual behaviour is lacking, in a

soft society like ours. In such situation it is necessary to emphasise on formation of right kind of attitude. This has to be deliberately and carefully designed in the training programmes. Otherwise, it would be difficult to bring in improvements in performance even though required level of knowledge and skill is achieved.

3.1.51 In case of training of class II government officials, changes in attitude have been reported by the trainees. However, one should be cautious about making an observation. The changes reported may be minimum and those might have resulted from (i) bridging of information and knowledge gap of the trainees through different training programmes, (ii) living in a regimented environment and (iii) sharing a community life with alertness and care about rights, duties and obligation.

3.1.52 Training and Career : Linkage between training and career is a vital issue.

Table-20 : Linkage between training and career development

Opinion	No. of respondent	percentage
Helpful	87	87
Not Helpful	13	13
Total	100	100

It appears from the above table that a large percentage (87%) of the trainees feel that training is helpful for their career development. In fact, training may influence career by affecting financial and promotional incentives. Training may be treated a requirement for crossing of the efficiency bar (EB) and confirmation in service. A trained officer may earn preference in promotion. The idea of the respondents about the linkages between the training courses and the career must have been a factor determining effectiveness of the courses offered for class II officials. This issue of effectiveness has been approached notionally.

Table 21: Effectiveness of the Courses

Courses	Below average		Average		Good		Very good		Excellent		Total	
	Parti- cipants	Head of TI	Parti- cipants	Head of TI	Parti- cipants	Head of TI	Parti- cipants	Head of TI	Parti- cipants	Head of TI	Parti- cipants	Head of TI
Induction course	4 (8.89)	-	8 (17.78)	-	16 (35.55)	1 (25.0)	13 (28.89)	2 (50.0)	4 (8.89)	1 (25.0)	45 (100.0)	4
Conduct & Discipline	5 (9.80)	-	10 (19.61)	-	21 (47.03)	1 (21.57)	11 (24.0)	3 (7.84)	4 (100.0)	-	51 (100.0)	4
Office Management	-	-	3 (12.0)	-	14 (36.0)	1 (25.0)	7 (28.0)	3 (75.0)	1 (4.0)	-	25 (100.0)	4
Financial Management	-	-	6 (35.29)	1 (25.0)	8 (47.06)	1 (25.0)	3 (17.65)	2 (50.0)	-	-	17 (100.0)	4
Revenue admin.	-	-	3 (33.33)	-	5 (55.56)	-	1 (11.11)	-	-	-	9 (100.0)	-
Official Correspondence	-	-	-	1 (25.0)	-	1 (25.0)	-	2 (50.0)	-	-	-	4 (100.0)
Refresher Course	1 (12.5)	-	1 (12.5)	-	3 (37.5)	2 (50.0)	2 (25.0)	2 (50.0)	1 (12.5)	-	8 (100.0)	4

3.1.53 In the above table, the respondents ranked different courses subjectively. Different courses (the survey included seven courses) have been viewed by the participants differently. An interesting pattern has emerged from the data. A few courses were considered by a large percentage of participants to be "good" while the same courses were adjudged by the heads of the training institutions to be "very good". This is a clear indication that the responses consistently differ depending whether the respondent is a trainee officer or a trainer / training manager. This may also suggest that the standard of measurement differs between the trainees and the trainers.

3.1.54 In terms of effectiveness, some courses are ranked high. Among them Office Management scores the highest (56%). This is followed by the Financial Management and the Conduct and Discipline courses. All these three courses are skill based. If we have the premise that career development is expedited by promotion of skills, then ranking of skill (rather than personality /out look) developing courses at a higher level suggests consistency of the responses in this table with those in the table on "linkages of training with career development".

3.1.55 However, the heads of training institutions strongly feel that there is little relationship between training and career of class II officers. This could not be rejected by the records which show lack of relation between training and career development in terms of promotion or a prized posting . On the otherhands, the opinion of the majority of the trained or trainee officers is that training is related to career. To reconcile between the conflicting opinion, one might say that the opinion of the trainees reflect their expectations which are seldom realised. This may and probably does create an element of frustration and an apathy towards work among this category of officials and towards training among those who are yet to be trained.

3.1.56 Evaluation and Research at RPATCs: Evaluation and research are necessary for both continuity and growth of the training programmes. The RPATCs do not have personnel for studying what training programmes are needed, what a training programme requires, what should be the focus of the training programme and what should be the approach content and method, what new courses should be added to the training calender and which programmes, if any, is or are to be dropped from the course list etc. Such studies are no doubt overdue. To run efficiently and institution has to conduct such studies.

3.1.57 Evaluation at the RPATCs are done at a very rudimentary level. At the level of trainees very often test/retest procedure is observed but the crucial aspect of the evaluation exercise is to see if there is any correlation of the scores and to analyse the data and statistics in a meaningful manner. The RPATCs are not yet equipped to perform this job. The most important method of evaluation is the end of the course evaluation in terms of an examination. The results of the end-of -the course evaluation could be very useful for the post-training evaluation. So far no arrangement could be made for post training performance evaluation. As a result , the end-of-the-course examination becomes an end in itself with very little scope to use the score of this examination as a means for the post- training evaluation of the performance of the trainees at the end-user level which is the ultimate aim of all training programmes.

3.1.58 Trainees evaluate the trainers. They are evaluated during each training course. For this purpose, evaluation forms have been prepared and provided by the BPATC. Each trainee gives in writing his opinion about a few aspects of a trainer. It is true that to evaluate performance of a trainer, it is necessary to gather information on the areas in which they are judged; but such evaluation alone gives a partial and sometimes a misleading picture about the performance of a trainer. This is more so because evaluation results so obtained are very often influenced by many extraneous factors which sometimes vitiate the validity of such evaluation. A study (Matiur & Jalil) shows that there are a number of attributes which help make a better trainer. For evaluation to be meaningful, it is necessary that the evaluation is based on exhaustive treatment of all those aspects of a trainer that have important bearing upon the outcome of a training course.

3.1.59 The evaluation referred to above is done periodically. Besides the periodic evaluation, there is a summative evaluation conducted at the end of a course. The end of the course evaluation covers four areas namely content of the course, speakers, course management and mess management. This exercise is also done notionally.

3.1.60 Studies for Planning of Training : At the level of organisation where class II officers work, no attempt has ever been made to study and ascertain the organisational need for training of class II officers. It is necessary to make such study in order to ensure that limited training resources are devoted to the priority areas and best uses. At present, the courses offered are those which the training institution decide to offer and are not necessarily what exactly the clientele organisations require. The fact that the trainees participate in a programme may indicate their requirement for the programme; but in no way it ensures that the programmes conducted by the RPATCs are the ones required most. The training institutions should have conducted studies on training need of different type of class II officers. Besides such appraisal of need, there could be a survey of 'training resources' within easy access of the training institutions in its headquarters as well as other parts of the region. This could help plan the training programmes better both for qualitative improvements and quantitative expansion.

3.1.61 Centralisation of Training: Whatever training need is there for class II government officials, the facilities and the avenues are concentrated at the divisional headquarters. This involves all the disadvantages of centralisation and loss of benefits associated with decentralisation.

3.1.62 At present training programmes are centrally determined at the national level and administered at the regional headquarters with the complete central support in terms of personnel, finance and logistics. Major decisions are also taken centrally. It has been found that the training inputs are confined to the narrow limits of divisional headquarters and the adjoining areas. At present the training institutions are capable of providing training of 1457 man-months only. This causes passive involvement of many strategic agents. For training of class II officials the institutional capacities are shared with the training programmes of the class III and IV employees as well. These are inadequate relative to the total number of class II officials. Though the number of class II Government officers is not large, the coverage of training has been very low relative to the pool of officers yet to be trained. Under the present system of centralized training there is not even any remote hope of covering all those people with required training in the foreseeable future.

3.1.63 Decentralised Training Programme : An alternative to the current arrangements for training of class II government officials is a decentralised training programme spread throughout the country involving much larger number of people than that at present and requiring relatively less resource support from the Government while engaging more human and material resources. This has been shown in the Annexure -4. Under this arrangement, the training programmes are to be arranged at different levels. At the national level, the PATC will provide policy and operational guidelines. The RPATCs to be called Divisional Public Administration Training Centres (DPATCs) will provide policy support such as conducting TOT programmes, organising research, and gathering information and creating data base and designing programmes for formulation and implementation of training plans.

3.1.64 Under the proposed structure, the operational tier of training will be the Upazila Public Administration Training Centre (UPATCs) and the Zila Public Administration Training Centre (ZPATCs) to be supported and supervised intensively by the RPATCs which would be located at the headquarters of the old districts. The Upazila and Zila PATCs may be headed by the officer with interest in training and development and exposure to comprehensive courses such as Foundation Training Course offered at PATC and the TOT course etc. They will conduct courses required locally. Such a local level training arrangement is necessary especially because situation in different upazilas is different and also because calling someone from a remote Upazila to the Divisional Headquarters involves costs both to individual and to the society. Many of the courses currently organised at the RPATCs may be conducted at the Upazila and Zilla Headquarters which are nearer to the workplace of the participants. On the Job Training (OJT) is also an option for catering to the training needs of the staff and improving overall efficiency. In order to provide on-the-job training for the support staff including class II officials the PATC at the Centre and the Divisional Headquarters must conduct TOT courses. The courses for class -1 officers should also incorporate TOT elements so that the class II official may get on the job training from their supervisors.

3.1.65 The proposed Divisional and the Regional PATCs may also conduct courses to be emulated by the PATCs at the District and the Upazilas. The RPATCs may increase their functional mobility by organising courses even at the districts, if not at the Upazilas. They may also monitor the programmes in the district headquarters and help control the quality of the training to be offered at the districts and upazilas. This training network may be used not only for class - II officers, but also for all levels of government officials and staff. This may provide an excellent forum for sharing of experiences of other training and research organisation in the government and non-government sector. Above all, it may also serve as a vehicle for disseminating ideas and information about the development programmes in the government and the non-government sectors.

Chapter-IV

4.1 Observations :

- 4.1.1 Training for class II Government officials is highly centralised. It is concentrated at the Divisional Headquarters in Chittagong, Dhaka, Khulna and Rajshahi. This limits access as well as coverage.
- 4.1.2 Training of class II officials is offered in courses which are participated by officers of diverse functional areas with widely differing training requirements. This reduces the relevance of the courses.
- 4.1.3 Some officers nominated, fail to participate in the training programmes. The prominent reasons are absence of substitutes, lack of effective communication and absence of a system of reward and punishment related to training.
- 4.1.4 There is no arrangement for On-the -Job Training for Class-II Government Officials. They obtain training only from institutional sources with limited capacities.
- 4.1.5 Training programme are predominantly theoretical in content and lecture oriented in technique.
- 4.1.6 The guest speakers; constitute a sizeable percentage of speakers/ facilitators.
- 4.1.7 The training resources and capabilities of the regional centres for training of Class-II Government officials remain underutilised.
- 4.1.8 Few speakers are satisfactory in terms of knowledge of the subject matter and fewer in presentation.

- 4.1.9 Handouts are mostly inadequate in supply and low in quality.
- 4.1.10 Training may have same impact in terms of change in attitude.
- 4.1.11 Training is useful in service life for improvement of the quality of performance but it is not related to career in terms of promotion prospects or other similar aspects.
- 4.1.12 The trainees are forward looking willing to change and conscious about technology and possible changes in the office of the future.
- 4.1.13 There is resistance to change. It appears that this is stronger among the nominating and supervising officers than among the trainees (refer to opinion on group dynamics).
- 4.1.14 Perceptions differ as regards quality of training-sometime very widely-depending whether the evaluator is a trainee or trainer.
- 4.1.15 Few audio visual aids are used. This is probably because of training design or the attitude of the trainer.
- 4.1.16 The RPATCs donot have enough staff to appraise training requirements, assess training need, evaluate training and post training performance of class II government officials
- 4.1.17 There are few recreational facilities. Outdoor games facilities are absent.
- 4.1.18 So far as training methods are concerned there is predominance of heckneyed use of lecture method.

4.2 Recommendations:

- 4.2.1 Training programmes for class II government officials are conducted at the divisional headquarters. This centralised nature of training arrangement explains excess capacity and underutilization of the training facilities at the RPATC. Whereas a larger number of class II officials remain untrained. To address this problem, it is necessary to decentralise training arrangements and extend them upto upazila. For this purpose training centres may be establish at the Zila and Upazila level.
- 4.2.2 Many of the sample data seem to have a tendency for multi-modality. This suggests that diverse groups of people have been lumped together in training programmes. Instead, emphasis should be given for organizing courses for functionally homogeneous group of trainers (such as the one the RPATCs conducted for the Tahsindars).
- 4.2.3 Designing training programmes should be a continuous process which among other this inclues (i) updating of the course content (ii) improving quality of the trainers (iii) deciding on appropriate methods, techniques, materials etc.
- 4.2.4 Since the institutional sources for training is scanty, there should be arrangements for on- the -job training for the class II officials (for that matter staff of all other levels). For this purpose, the PATC should make appropriate incorporation of TOT elements into the training courses for class I officers.
- 4.2.5 To get desired results, all concerned must realise that training is a serious business. The Government must appreciate that it is a job not for every body; but for the 'best' alone. Quality of training can not be better than that of the trainer. To improve quality of training, incentive pattern should be designed in terms of better facilities, future posting and promotion so that the best officers are attracted to the field of training.

- 4.2.6 Training at present is hardly related to career. This is a reason for apathy towards training. To get the most out of a training programmes, it is necessary that training is related to career development.
- 4.2.7 Introduction of computers and other office machines are important steps towards office automation. To make adjustments RPATCs should read the signals obtained in the study and design training programmes for transition to the automated office of the future.
- 4.2.8 The RPATCs, should make study of training needs and resources in the respective region so that the training programmes could be organised locally at the Zila or Upazila level.
- 4.2.9 The present evaluation system is at best partial. It should be modified in such a way that the results of the course evaluation could be related to evaluation of the post-training performance.
- 4.2.10 Recreational and other related facilities have important bearing on the outcome of a training programme. Such facilities should be provided adequately. It appears that available facilities remain underutilised. The training programmes should make best use of all available facilities. For better use by the trainees, RPATC libraries should remain open after the office hours. Facilities should be created for physical exercise and sports.
- 4.2.11 To solve the problem of regular food supply, the RPATCs may arrange a cafeteria to be sub-contracted to a private party.
- 4.2.12 The RPATC should be adequately staffed with additional manpower for programming, research and evaluation.
- 4.2.13 The RPATCs should be brought under an information network which me extend upto upazila level down the line and the BPATC at the top. Computerization of RPATC will be necessary for this purpose.

Evaluation of Training Programmes for Class II Government Officials.

Bibliography

1. Das, K. M., The Staff Training Programme, in Bangladesh, Staff Development Review. Vol. 1, Sept. 1981, No. 1. Bangladesh Secretariate, Dhaka.
2. Deb, S. R & Others, "Evaluation system of Training Programmes for class III & IV Employees: A study", PATC, 1990.
3. Jalil & Rahman. "Training Needs Identification for Training of Trainers, PATC, 1990.
4. Phillips, J.J. Handbook of Training Evaluation & Measurement Methods, and Publishing Company, 1983.
5. Razzak. M. A. Shafiullah M. & Haque Enamul, Training Need Assessment and Curriculum Development for class II officers. A Study, PATC, Savar, 1990.
6. Project Proforma, May 30, 1990.
7. Samad & Kar, "A Study of Regional Public Administration Training Centres (RPATC) Project, PATC, 1990.
8. Statistics & Research Cell & Public Administration Computer Centre O & M Wing, Ministry of Establishment, 1989.

Distribution of Class II officials relative to Civilian Government Service

1. Class-wise manpower of civil Officers & Employees

Class	Min/Div		Dept/Dte		Auto/Corp		Total	
	Sanc	Exist	Sanc	Exist	Sanc	Exist	Sanc	Exist
Class-I	2024	1821	38074	31227	44933	39002	85031	72050
Class-II	60	40	12793	10215	30533	26448	43386	36703
Class-III	4125	3713	415017	377753	145370	119326	564512	500792
Class-IV	2337	2233	230171	215634	104543	93169	337051	311036
Grand Total	8546	7807	696055	634829	325379	277945	1029980	920581

2. Scale-wise Statistics of Class-II Officers.

Tk. 1350-2750	33	23	11037	8637	21333	18112	32403	26772
Tk. 1000-2280	27	17	1756	1578	9200	8336	10983	9931
Total Class-II	60	40	12794	10215	30533	26448	43386	36703

Source: Statistics of Civil Officers & Staff of the Government of the Peoples' Republic of Bangladesh, 1989. Statistics & Research Cell, Ministry of Establishment.

Training of class II Officers 1985

1986

[illegible]

Regional Public Administrative Training Centres.

Trainy of class II Officers of the year 1987

Sl. No.	Name of the Course	Number of Course				Target (Trainees)				Achievements			
		Dhaka	Chitt.	Rajshahi	Khulna	Dhaka	Chitt.	Rajshahi	Khulna	Dhaka	Chitt.	Rajshahi	Khulna
1.	Induction course	2	2	1	1	80	80	40	40	23	39	8	12
2.	Financial Management course	1	-	-	-	40	-	-	-	32	-	-	-
3.	Conduct & Discipline course	2	2	1	1	80	80	40	40	75	49	13	27
4.	Official Communications course	1	1	1	1	40	30	40	40	20	10	19	14
		6	5	3	3	240	190	120	120	150	98	40	53

1988

1.	Refreshers course	1	1	1	1	40	40	40	40	23	12	9	15
2.	Induction course	1	-	1	1	30	-	30	30	8	-	5	9
3.	Conduct & Discipline course	1	1	-	1	40	40	-	40	16	20	-	16
4.	Financial Management course	1	1	1	1	30	30	30	30	18	23	15	34
5.	Revenue Administration course	1	1	1	1	40	40	40	40	16	8	19	26
6.	Official communications course	1	1	-	1	30	30	-	30	11	16	-	22
		6	5	4	6	210	180	140	210	92	79	48	122

Regional Public Administrative Training Centres.

Trainy of class II Officers of the year 1989

Sl. No.	Name of the Course	Number of Course				Target (Trainees)				Achievements			
		Dhaka	Chitt.	Rajshahi	Khulna	Dhaka	Chitt.	Rajshahi	Khulna	Dhaka	Chitt.	Rajshahi	Khulna
1.	Refreshers course	1	-	1	1	30	30	30	30	6	-	16	12
2.	Conduct & Discipline course	1	1	1	1	40	40	40	40	21	18	33	15
3.	Official communications course	1	1	1	1	30	30	30	30	13	27	22	18
4.	Induction course	-	1	1	1	-	25	25	25	-	14	36	13
5.	Financial Management course	1	1	1	1	40	40	40	40	18	19	13	17
6.	Revenue Administration course	1	-	-	1	40	-	-	40	39	-	-	46
		5	4	5	6	180	165	165	205	97	78	120	121
June/1990													
1.	Refreshers course	1	1	1	1	30	30	30	30	9	11	16	22
2.	Induction course	1	-	1	1	25	-	25	25	13	-	16	8
3.	Conduct & discipline course	1	1	1	1	40	40	40	40	17	7	10	9
4.	Official communication course	1	1	1	1	30	30	30	30	26	17	14	14
		4	3	4	4	120	100	120	120	65	35	56	53