

162

160

**Post-Training Utilization of Training of Trainers (TOT)
Course of BPATC: An Empirical Study**

**Md. Mahamud-Ul-Hoque
Md. Nurul Amin**

**Bangladesh Public Administration Training Centre
Savar, Dhaka, Bangladesh
2015**

Acknowledgement

We would like to express our gratitude to Rector, BPATC for his sincere and valuable advice for completion of this research project. We are grateful to the Research Committee of SBPATC Project for approval of the research proposal, continuous monitoring and encouragement to complete this study. The study has been made possible by the financial support of SBPATC Project. We are indebted to Project Director of SBPATC Project for his cooperation during our research. We are also wish to the previous participates of TOT Course of BPATC.

Researchers

Table of Contents	
Subject	Page
Acknowledgement	I
Table of Contents	II
Executive Summary	III-VI
Abbreviations	VII
List of Tables	VIII
Chapter I: Background of the Study	1-6
1.1 Statement of the Problem	1
1.2 Rationale of the Study	3
1.3 Objective of the Study	3
1.4 Scope of the Study	4
1.5 Methodology	4
1.6 Organization of the Research Report	6
Chapter II: The Study of Post Training Utilization: A Note	7-8
Chapter III: Analysis of Survey Data	9-24
3.1 General Background of the Respondents	9
3.2 Accomplishment of TOT Course Objectives	12
3.3 Improvement of Knowledge, Skills and Attitude	13
3.4 Comparison between Pre and Post Training Level of knowledge and Skills	14
3.5 Fields where the Knowledge and Skills had Increased	16
3.6 Application of Improved Knowledge and Skills and Attitude	17
3.7 Problems Faced by the Participants in Applying Training Output	20
3.8 Effectiveness of Training Methodology	23
3.9 Suggestions Offered by the Respondent	23
Chapter IV: Analysis of Cases	25-37
4.1 Background of Case Studies	25
4.2 Cases: 1-10	25
Chapter V: Key Findings of the Survey and Case Studies	38-43
5.1 Findings of the Survey Data	38
5.2 Findings of the Case Studies	41
Chapter VI: Conclusion and Policy Recommendations ...	44-47
6.1 Conclusion	44
6.2 Policy Recommendations	46
References and Bibliography	48
Appendix: A Questionnaire.....	49

Post-Training Utilization of Training of Trainers (TOT) Course of BPATC: An Empirical Study

Executive Summary

Training is recognized as an essential means to develop professionalism of employees and enhance institutional capacity of the corporate bodies. Trainers themselves, therefore, need to be trained through Training of Trainers (TOT) course in the same way healers need to be healed. To unlock the potentials of professional trainers and to assist the government in creating a vast pool of efficient trainers, Bangladesh Public Administration Training centre (BPATC) has been offering Training of Trainers (TOT) course once a year since its inception in 1984.

The specific objectives of the study are to appraise the relevance of Training of Trainers (TOT) course inputs to improve the knowledge, skills and attitude of the participants with respect to the practical training environment; to assess the level of unitization of training inputs in their practical training session; and to discover the factors that influences the utilization of TOT inputs in practical training sessions.

The study has conducted on basis of primary data. Since its inception in 1984, BPATC organized 35 TOT courses and one special TOT for Faculty Member for the professional and prospective trainers in Bangladesh. The total number of participants was about 950. For the purpose of the study, 97 participants from different courses including one Special TOT course were selected as sample on the basis cluster as well as purposive sampling to meet the research needs. The researchers have also selected 10 cases from the 9 organizations purposively as per advice of the 1st faculty seminar.

The study of post-training utilization of any training programme is intended to find out the outcome of that training input. Therefore, the main aspect of the study of TOT Course utilization is to find out the outcome of TOT Course activity. To explore the outcome of the TOT Course conducted by Bangladesh Public Administration Training Centre (BPATC), it would be important to explain the answer of the questions related with course objective one by one, which are stated in the TOT course curricula.

Accordingly, the first objective of the study was to appraise the relevance of Training of Trainers (TOT) course inputs to improve the knowledge, skills and attitude of the participants in the practical training environment. According to the findings, before training in a scale of 1 to 6 (5 to 6 'very high', 4 to 4.99 'high', and 3.5 to 3.99 'moderate' and below 3.5 'low'), the average knowledge and skills on concepts of training and training management were 54 percent and 2.96 (low) in median. After training, the average knowledge and skills on concepts of training and training management has increased 72 percent and 3.93 (moderate) in median and it is 18 percentage points higher than that of the level before TOT course.

The average knowledge and skills on training methodology, before training, were 49 percent and 2.67 (low) in median. After TOT Course, the average level of acquired knowledge on training methodology has increased to 70 percent and 3.84 (moderate) in median and it is 21 percentage points higher than that of the level before TOT. Before training the average knowledge and skills on MS Power Point were 55 percent and 3 in median. The average level of acquired knowledge on research methodology after TOT Course has increased to 73% and 3.99 (moderate) in median and it is 15 percentage points higher than that of the level before TOT course.

The second objective of the study was to assess the level of unitization of training inputs in their practical training session. According to study findings, 73 percent of the trained trainer took initiative to implement their acquired knowledge and skills and attitudes in order to enhance the quality of training in their institutions. On the other hand only 24.74% respondents are failure to take any initiative to apply their training achievements. Therefore, most of the participants are active to apply training inputs. It is also important to apply training inputs in real life training activities. According to the findings, 32% participates are successful to apply the TOT course output in the practical training environment. 45.36% are partially successful and 21.65% are not successful in the practical environment of the training activities.

The third objective of the study was to discover the factors that influence the utilization of training in practical training sessions. According to the findings, the main issues include top management support or institutional approach (55.82%) in implementing skills and

knowledge in practical life. Moreover, 49.48% identified shortage of resources as their problem of application, 35.05% opined on the lack of technological support, 29.90% said demotivating factor in real life working environment, 43.30% identified lack of need bases training curricula and 18.56% says personal demotivation is the main barriers of the execution of training input in practical training activities.

For case studies, all the respondents have participated in the TOT course of BPATC from 1996-2013. In-depth interview and informal discussion with Ex-TOT course participants have considered in order to develop cases. Based on qualitative analysis, the findings of the case studies are given below:

- ❖ After the successful completion of TOT course, the knowledge and skills of the participants on training concept and methods have improved and they are inspired for serving as professional trainers (10).
- ❖ Presentation and feedback session in TOT course have 'great influence' in the utilization of course inputs in practical training sessions in many cases (8).
- ❖ The number of the participants in a classroom has impact on the utilization of TOT course inputs in the practical training sessions (4).
- ❖ Career prospects and on time promotion of the qualified professional trainers are oriented with the motivation and utilization of TOT course inputs (4).
- ❖ There is an indirect relation between the compulsory TOT course for prospective trainers in a training institute and their motivation in training courses and utilization in practice (3).
- ❖ Selection of participants on the basis of their similar and actual training needs is also important for the utilization of TOT course learning (3).
- ❖ Automation of the training institute and their classrooms are contributing in the application of latest training methods (2).
- ❖ Need assessment of the training participants is less emphasized topic in the ToT course which has poor contribution as per the execution of TOT course inputs concern (3).
- ❖ Coordination between service sections in the training organization is also indirectly responsible to utilize and application of acquired knowledge and skills in his case (1).
- ❖ Trainers personal time management capacity within session is also partially influence the application of TOT course inputs (2).

- ❖ An online network (facebook group) or website of the professional trainers could enhance the exchange and application of the latest knowledge and skills on different training methods (1).

In conclusion, TOT course has 'moderate' effect to improve the knowledge, skills of the participants on concepts of training, training management and training methodology. Majority of the participants took initiative to apply the training inputs in practical training sessions and they are partially successful in application. Factors influencing the utilization include 'lack of resources', 'institutional approach to utilize the resources' and demonization in 'career plan' of professional trainers. In order to improve the quality of TOT Course and its utilization the study team identified some issues as recommendations which are given below:

- More personal presentation sessions with feedback will be arranged for self-improvement of the TOT course participants.
- The number of the participants should be selected very carefully and the nomination of the participants must be based on their similar and specific training needs.
- Proper attention should be given on the topic training needs assessment (TNA) with exercise.
- TOT course should be a compulsory course for the prospective trainer at different training institutes.
- 'State of the art' training equipment should be ensured in the training classes.
- Coordination between service sections and course authority should be ensured in the training organizations.
- Career plan of professional trainers is needed in order to ensure qualified faculty pool in public sector training institutes and academics.
- Online network or website of the professional trainers should be developed to enhance the exchange and application of the latest knowledge and skills on different training methods

Abbreviations

BARD	Bangladesh Academy for Rural Development
BPATC	Bangladesh Public Administration Training Centre
BFRI	Bangladesh Forest Research Institute
BSRTI	Bangladesh Sericulture Research and Training Institute
DC	Deputy Commissioner
GOB	Government of Bangladesh
ICT	Information and Communication Technology
LGED	Local Government Engineering Department
NAEM	National Academy for Education and Development
NAPD	National Academy for Planning and Development
NILG	National Institute of Local Government
PATP	Public Administration Training policy
PTU	Post Training Utilization
RAKUB	Rajshahi Krishi Unnayan Bank
RDA	Rural Development Academy
HSC	Higher Secondary Certificate
TOT	Training of Trainers

List of the Tables

Table-1.1	Sample Size of the Study
Table-3.1	Sex Distribution of the Respondents
Table-3.2	Educational Qualification of the Respondents
Table-3.3	Institutional Background of the Respondents
Table-3.4	Achievement Rate of the TOT Course Objectives
Table-3.5	Improvement of Knowledge, Skills and Change in Attitude on Practical Training Environment.
Table-3.6	Comparison between Pre and Post-Training Level of Knowledge and Skills of Major Training Contents and their Application.
Table-3.7	Action or Initiative Taken by the Trained Trainers to implement Gained Knowledge, Skills and Attitude.
Table-3.8	Application of Acquired Knowledge, Skills and Attitude.
Table-3.9	Problems Faced by the Participants in Applying Training on Job Situation.
Table-3.10	Effectiveness of Training Methodology

Chapter I

Background of the Study

1.1 Statement of the Problem

Training is recognized as an essential means to develop professionalism of employees and enhance institutional capacity of the corporate bodies. “Professionals or perish” – is common slogan for institutional development in both the public and private realms. Enhancement of professionalism and quality of training are however linked to the competence of Trainers. Trainers themselves, therefore, need to be trained through Training of Trainers (TOT) course in the same way healers need to be healed.

To hold the trainers acquired competence and to assist the government in creating a vast pool of efficient trainers, Bangladesh Public Administration Training Centre (BPATC) has been offering Training of Trainers (TOT) course once a year since its inception in 1984. Initially, TOT course was designed to upgrade the instructional quality of exiting faculty members and the newly appointed officers of the Centre. But in response to the continuous demands placed by the various training institutes of country, BPATC has extended its TOT jurisdiction to all the management and public administration training institutes of Bangladesh. Up to January 2015, BPATC organized 35 Training of Trainers course including one Special Training of Trainers course for the

Faculty Members. The total number of participants of these training of trainers courses was about 950.

Improving the methodological and managerial aspects aiming at enhancing training efficiency is the thrust of the Training of Trainers (TOT) course. The specific objectives of said course are as follows:

- To make the participants to conceptualize the most recent available concepts, principles, and methods of training;
- To enable the participants to improve their skills as instructor and training management capability and to apply them to their job situations; and
- To provide opportunity to the participants to share their individual experiences and exchange views or ideas for the promotion of quality aimed at development of skilled manpower in Bangladesh (BPATC, 2006:3).

However, the success of the above-mentioned objectives mostly depends on the effective utilization of training in the work place of the professional trainers by using TOT course imputes. Therefore, a study on post training utilization is important for appropriate use of training in building professional instructors in different training institutes and academics. Moreover, Government of the People's Republic of Bangladesh formulated Public Administration Training Policy (PATP) on 6 May 2003 which also recognize the importance of post training utilization (PTU) of the trained manpower to 'make best use of training and to derive maximum value for money spent on training' (GOB,2003). Unfortunately, there is a lack of empirical evidence on post training utilization of the training of trainers (TOT) course of BPATC. In the above perspective, this is an initiative to assess the utilization of training

inputs of the Training of Trainers course of Bangladesh Public Administration Training Centre.

1.2 Rationale of the Study

Empirical research on post training utilization of training courses conducted by the training academies or institutes in Bangladesh including Training of Trainers Course of Bangladesh Public Administration Training Centre (BPATC) is not available. Shortage of experts in this area of study is one of the reasons. However, for improving the knowledge, skills and for changing the mindset of the trainers involved in civil service training, it is indispensable to enhance their instructional capability as well as to improve the Training of Trainers (TOT) course. It is observed that without conducting empirical research on post training utilization (PTU) it is not possible to upgrade the training course and to make the training inputs more pragmatic. Therefore, the proposed study on post training utilization of training of trainers course of BPATC is very much rational and this study will obviously help to meet the needs of empirical data to design and improve the future Training of Trainers (TOT) course of BPATC.

1.3 Objectives of the Study

The general objective of the study is to appraise the actual gap between Training of Trainers (TOT) provided and training inputs applied by the trainers in the real training sessions. The specific objectives of the proposed study are as follows:

- I. To appraise the relevance of Training of Trainers (TOT) course inputs to improve the knowledge, skills and attitude of the course participants in the practical training environment ;

- II. To assess the level of unitization of training inputs in their practical training session ; and
- III. To discover the factors that influences the utilization of training in practical training sessions.

1.4 Scope of the Study

This study covers:

- Major inputs of training of trainers course of Bangladesh Public Administration Training centre (BPATC);
- Extent of utilization of training inputs in the practical training classes by the participants of TOT courses;
- Direct and indirect issues, which are important to utilize the training inputs in the practical training sessions of the training institutes.

1.5 Methodology

For this study the researchers deliberately use multiple methods, for example, survey and case study methods. The major methodological aspects of the research are given below:

(a) Selection of study area and Sample Size

Since its inception in 1984, BPATC has organized 30 TOT courses and one special TOT for Faculty Member for the professional and prospective trainers in Bangladesh. The total number of participants was about 900. For the purpose of the questionnaire survey of the study, 97 participants from 22nd TOT to 28th TOT and one Special TOT was selected as sample on the basis cluster as well as simple random or purposive sampling.

Table-1.1: Sample Size of the Study

No	Name of TOT	No of Participants as Sample
1	22 nd TOT	12
2	23 rd TOT	12
3	24 th TOT	13
4	25 th TOT	12
5	26 th TOT	11
6	27 th TOT	12
7	28 th TOT	13
8	Special TOT	12
	Total	97

(b) Sources of Data

Questionnaire survey was carried out for collection of data from the participant of said TOT courses. Random sampling procedure was followed in selecting previous ToT course participants . Data were also collected from the supervisor of the trainers who participated in TOT courses. On the other hand, secondary data were collected from the books, journals and previous study on the said issue.

(c) Analysis and Presentation of Data

The collected data are presented in most of the cases in the form of simple frequency table. In some cases two-way frequency tables are given to show the relationship between different variables. Most descriptive data are presented in terms of univariate measures as ranges and percentages. Arithmetic means of variables were calculated in order to have a comparative idea between different groups.

(d) Case Studies

The 1st faculty seminar on the research project has advised that the researcher should consult 10 cases along with questionnaire survey from 5 organizations for in-depth analysis of the TOT course utilization in practical training

sessions. The researchers have collected and explained 10 cases to improve the reliability and validity of the data collected from the questionnaire survey method and to extend the methodological spectrum of the research. In this perspective, this is a multi-method research. The selected cases include Bangladesh Airlines Training Center (BATC), Bangladesh Institute of Bank Management (BIBM), Bangladesh Public Administration Training Centre (BPATC), Bangladesh Road Transport Authority (BRTA), Dhaka Bank, Financial Management Academy (FIMA), Grameen Bank, National Academy for Planning and Development (NAPD), National Institute of Local Government (NILG).

1.6 Organization of the Research Report

The research report consists of five chapters including introduction and conclusion. The introductory chapter covers statement of the problem, objectives of the study, scope and study method of the study. Chapter-2 provides a note on the study of post training utilization. The analysis of data of the study is described in Chapter-3. Chapter-4 deals with the study findings. Chapter-5 analyzes the major findings from case studies and survey. Finally, Chapter-6 includes concluding remarks and recommendations for future policy intervention.

Chapter II

The Study of Post-Training Utilization: A Note

The study of post-training utilization of any training programme is focused to find out the outcome of that training input (Sunder and Mottaleb, 2003: 4). Therefore, the main aspect of the study of TOT Course utilization is to find out the outcome of TOT Course activity. To explore the outcome of the TOT Course conducted by Bangladesh Public Administration Training Centre (BPATC), it would be important to find out the answer of the questions one by one, which are stated in the objectives of the TOT course curricula.

In order to explore whether participants' knowledge and skills regarding training have increased and whether any positive change of their attitude towards training environment have taken place, the researchers have compared the level of knowledge, skills and attitude of the participants on training activities before and after the training. In a comparative perspective, the researchers have taken only the contents of the TOT, which were common for all TOT Course offered by BPATC. They have also explored the areas where their knowledge and skills have increased and where some positive changes in their attitude towards training- as an approach to improve human resources and development- have taken place. To find out the achievements of each question, the study team has also tried to explore the objectives set by TOT Course authority at BPATC.

To know the response of the second question, the researchers inquired the respondents about how far they are implementing their acquired knowledge and skills in their day to day training activities in their respective training organizations. To know this answer, the present research management has paralleled the level of developed knowledge with the level of implementation. Moreover, to validate the results where the trained officers have become successful to execute their knowledge, the researchers have found out the areas of solicitation. In these perspectives, the researcher also found the spaces of attention, which were generated after participating in training courses. However, where the respondents were not capable to execute their knowledge, the study team identified the dominant factors or causes, which hampered the use of their knowledge and skills. In this case, the study group, in fact tried to explore the answer of the third question.

With the above analytical note the study team has also explored the aspects of the utilization of knowledge and skills of TOT course of the trainers those who have enough fortunate to implement TOT Course inputs in their training institute. The study group has assumed that the participants belong to apex training institute have better environment to utilize the TOT Course learning in their respective training institutes more efficiently and effectively than the other organizations.

Chapter III

Analysis of Survey Data

3.1 General Background of the Respondents

3.1.1 Sex Distribution

Table-3.1: Sex Distribution of the Respondents

Sex Status	Number	Percentage
Male	78	80.4
Female	19	19.6
Total	97	100

The gender related distribution of the participants is an impotent indicator of the social, economic and cultural aspects of the training environment in the training institutes in Bangladesh. The Table-3.1 shows the unequal participation of the respondents in the TOT Courses offered by BPATC. It indicates that out of 97 participants 78 are male (80.4%) and only 19 participants (19.6%) are female.

3.1.2 Educational Qualification

The educational qualification achieved by the respondents is divided into two broad categories such as graduation and equivalents and post-graduate and equivalents. The respondents have also been categorized on the basis of their academic disciplines such as humanities, social science, natural science, business. Table-3.2 shows that out of 97 respondents, 91 respondents (93.8%)

have post-graduate and equivalent degree and only 6 respondents (6.2%) have graduate and equivalent degree. A significant number of the participants of the respondents surveyed are from social science discipline (46.4%) and only 10.3% respondents are from the business disciplines.

Table-3.2: Educational Qualification of the Respondents

Level of Education	Discipline				
	Humanities	Social Science	Natural Science	Business	Total
Graduate and Equivalents	1	2	2	1	6 (6.2)
Post-Graduate and Equivalents	24	43	15	9	91(93.8)
Total	25 (25.8)	45 (46.4)	17(17.5)	10 (10.3)	97 (100)

3.1.3 Institutional Affiliation of the Respondents

Table-3.3: Institutional Background of the Respondents

No	Name of Training Institute	Frequency	Percentage
1	Bangladesh Public Administration Training Centre (BPATC), Dhaka	19	19.5

2	Bangladesh Academy for Rural Development (BARD), Comilla	7	7.2
3	Bangladesh Forest Research Institute (BFRI), Chittagong	5	5.15
4	National Academy for Planning and Development (NAPD)	4	4.12
5	Rajshahi Krishi Unnayan Bank (RAKUB) Training Institute, Rajshahi	4	4.12
6	National Academy for Education and Development (NAEM), Dhaka	4	4.12
7	Rural Development Academy (RDA), Bogra	3	3.09
8	Bangladesh Sericulture Research and Training Institute (BSRTI), Rajshahi	3	3.09
9	Bangladesh Civil Service (Administration) Academy	6	6.19
10	Bangladesh Institute of Bank Management (BIBM), Dhaka	2	2.06
11	Police Staff College, Mirpur	2	2.06
12	Regional Public Administration Training Centre (RPATC), Khulna	7	7.2
13	Bangladesh Bank, Dhaka	4	4.12

14	Regional Public Administration Training Centre (RPATC), Rajshahi	7	7.2
15	Bangladesh Agricultural Research Institute, (BARI) Gazipur	3	3.09
16	Regional Public Administration Training Centre (RPATC), Chittagong	6	6.19
17	Bangladesh Kria Shikha Protishtan (BKSP)	2	2.06
18	Regional Public Administration Training Centre (RPATC), Khulna	5	5.15
19	Dhaka Bank, Dhaka	1	1.03
20	Office of the Deputy Commissioner, Dhaka	2	2.06
21	Small and Cottage Industries Training Institute (SCITI), Dhaka	1	1.03
	Total	97	100

The target participation of training of the trainers' course of the BPATC is the professional trainer of various training institutes in Bangladesh. Table-3.1 shows the name of different training institutes and their frequency and percentage of the participants from these institutions. According this table, most of the participants (19.5%) were from Bangladesh Public Administration Training Centre (BPATC), the apex training institute in the public sector in

Bangladesh. Moreover, 7.23% from Bangladesh Academy for Rural Development (BARD), Comilla; 5.15% from Bangladesh Forest Research Institute (BFRI), 5.15% from Chittagong; Bangladesh Forest Research Institute (BFRI), Chittagong; 4.12% from National Academy for Planning and Development (NAPD); 7.2% Regional Public Administration Training Centre (RPATC), Rajshahi etc.

3.2 Accomplishment of TOT Course Objectives

In order to know how far the objectives of TOT Course had been achieved, the trained participants were asked the pre-determined objectives using the scale 1 and 6. The minimum score is 1 and the maximum score is 6. The average percentage and median of the achievement of the TOT Course objectives can be shown in the Table-3.3 on the basis of the opinion of the trained participants.

The Table-3.3 shows that in the objective related to conceptualize the most recent available concepts, principals, and methods of training, the average achievement is 71 percent and the average achievement (in median) in this objective is satisfactory (4.23). It also shows that the objective related to improve their institutional skills and training management capability and to apply them to their job situations, the average achievement is 63 percent and the average achievement (in median) in this objective is moderate (3.75). Moreover, the objective related to share their individual experiences and exchange views or ideas for the promotion of quality aimed at development of skilled manpower in Bangladesh, the average achievement is 67 percent and the average achievement (in median) in this particular objective is considered as satisfactory (4.02).

Table-3.4: Achievement Rate of the TOT Course Objectives

Objectives	Achievement (in percentage and in median)	
	Percentage	Median
(1) Conceptualize the most recent available concepts, principals, and methods of training	71	4.23
(2) Improve their institutional skills and training management capability and to apply them to their job situations	63	3.76
(3) Share their individual experiences and exchange views or ideas for the promotion of quality aimed at development of skilled manpower in Bangladesh	67	4.02

Note: Achievement of objectives (median 3.5): 5 to 6 'highly satisfactory', 4 to 4.99 satisfactory, and 3.5 to 3.99 'moderate' and below 3.5 'not satisfactory'.

3.3 Improvement of Knowledge, Skills and Attitude

It is important to explore the level of improvement of the knowledge, skills and change in behavior of the respondents. In the case of knowledge, most of the participants (88.66%) opined that the training inputs have positive impact to improve their existing knowledge level. It also helps them to improve their skills to work better (73.20%) and positive inspiration in their pattern of behavior (65.98%).

Table-3.5: Improvement of Knowledge, Skills and Change in Attitude on Practical Training Environment.

Training Outputs	State of Improvement		
	Yes	No	Total
Improvement of Knowledge	86 (88.66)	13	97 (100)
Improvement of Skills	71 (73.20%)	28	
Change in Attitude	64 (65.98%)	33	

3.4 Comparison between Pre and Post Training Level of knowledge and Skills

Table 3.6: Comparison between Pre and Post-Training Level of Knowledge and Skills of Major Training Contents and their Application.

Training Contents	Level of Knowledge and Skills before TOT		Level of Knowledge and Skills after TOT		Level of Knowledge and Skills Increased	Level of Application in Training Activity	
	%	Median	%	Median	% point	%	Median
Concepts of Training and Training Management	54	2.96	72	3.93	18	70	3.78
Training Methodology	49	2.67	70	3.84	21	68	3.72
MS Power Point	62	3.38	77	4.20	15	73	3.69
Average	55	3	73	3.99	18	70	3.73

Note: Level and application of knowledge and skills (median 3.5): 5 to 6 'very high', 4 to 4.99 'high', and 3.5 to 3.99 'moderate' and below 3.5 'low'.

Twenty-seven topics were included in the guideline to trim up the TOT Course participants of BPATC. The respondent asked that how much knowledge and skills on training they had before joining the TOT Course and how far their knowledge and skills had increased after TOT course. The detail of the findings regarding the comparison between the pre-training and post-training level of knowledge and skills according to the aforementioned 27 general topics might be seen in Table-3.6 of the findings.

The twenty-seven topics of TOT Course were divided into three main contents. These were: (i) concepts of training and training management, (ii) training methodology (iii) and (iii) MS PowerPoint. All the three contents might be seen at Table- 3.6. There were thirteen topics under the head of concepts of training and training management. The study shows that the level of knowledge and skills has increased in each of the topics after TOT Course. The present research have also tried to explore the average level of knowledge and skills after training and average level of application in practical training activity in each of the three broad training heads. The findings of these average results have been displayed in Table-3.4. The average knowledge and skills on concepts of training and training management before training were 54 percent and 2.96 in median. The average knowledge of acquired knowledge after TOT Course on concepts of training and training management after training has increased to 72% and 3.93 in median and it is 18 percentage points higher than that of the level before TOT.

In training methodology part of the TOT Course, there were thirteen general topics. It is visible from the Annex C that the level of knowledge and skills has increased for all the topics after TOT Course. Before training, the average knowledge and skills on research methodology were 49 percent and 2.67 in

median. The average knowledge of acquired knowledge after TOT Course on research methodology has increased to 70% and 3.84 in median and it is 21 percentage points higher than that of the level before TOT.

In MS Power Point part of the TOT Course, there was one topic. It is visible from the Table-3.6 that the level of knowledge and skills has increased for this topic after TOT Course. The average knowledge and skills on MS Power Point head before training were 55 percent and 3 in median. After training, the average knowledge of acquired knowledge on research methodology has increased to in 73% and 3.99 in median and it is 15 percentage points higher than that of the level before TOT.

3.5 Fields where the Knowledge and Skills has Increased and Areas where Attitudinal Change had Taken Place.

The TOT Course participants opined that their knowledge on training has increased after training in the following training fields:

- Training Cycle (7)
- On the job Training. What-Why-How (6)
- Methods of Training Evaluation (6)
- Coordination for Effective Training (6)
- Training as a Tool for HRD (5)
- Managing Courses (5)
- Preparing Institutional Plan (5)
- Lecture Method(4)
- The Art of Presentation(14)
- Syndicate Method (4)
- National Training Policy (4)
- Qualities of a Trainer (3)

- Post-Training Utilization (2)

Moreover, according to the TOT Course participants, their skills on training have increased after training in the following training fields:

- Ice breaking (7)
- Training needs Analysis (7)
- Objective Setting (5)
- Budget Preparation of training (5)
- Techniques of Literature Searching (5)
- Training Methodology (5)
- Training Method (5)
- Use of Audio-visual Aids (5)
- Role Playing Theory (4)
- Techniques of Case Writing (4)
- MS Power Point(3)

The participants opine that some immediate positive change in their pattern of behavior and attitude to take training environment positively have taken also place which have been identified as follows:

- They are motivated to take training seriously for positive change in the society as professional trainer (12);
- They are encouraged enough to read training related professional journal , seminar paper etc. than before(9) ;
- The level of self-confidence has increased (18);

- For any problem they do communicate each other for sustainable solution to improve practical training session (5).

3.6 Application of Improved Knowledge and Skills and Attitude on the Training Situation.

One of the important aspects is to explore whether the trained participants have taken initiative to implement to their acquired knowledge, skills and attitude on the practical job or training situation. Table-3.5 shows that the majority of the participants have taken initiatives to utilize training inputs in their practical training situation.

Table-3.7: Action or Initiative Taken by the Trained Trainers to implement Gained Knowledge, Skills and Attitude.

State of Initiatives taken By the Respondents					
Yes		No		Total	
Number	Percentage	Number	Percentage	Total	Percentage
73	75.26	24	24.74	97	100

The above table shows that 73 percent of the trained trainer took initiative to implement their improved knowledge and skills and attitudes in order to enhance the quality of training in their institutions. On the other hand only 24.74% respondents are failed to take any initiative to apply their training achievements. Therefore, most of the participants are active to apply training inputs.

It is also important to apply training inputs in real life training activities. Table-3.6 shows the application of acquired knowledge, skills and attitude by the trained trainer in their working life. According to the table, 32%

participates are successful to apply the TOT course output in the practical training environment. 45.36% are partially successful and 21.65% are not successful in the practical implementation of the training activates.

Table-3.8: Application of Acquired Knowledge, Skills and Attitude.

Application Status	Frequency	Percentage
Successful	32	32.99
Partially Successful	44	45.36
Not Successful	21	21.65
Total	97	100

The study team also tried to explore the training areas where the trained participants of TOT Course are utilizing their achieved knowledge, skills and attitude. The following are the areas of improvement:

- Prepare a training budget (26)
- Uses of role play method in training (19)
- On the job training (21)
- The art of formal presentation (11)
- Use of multimedia in training session (15)
- Training course coordination (13)
- Syndicate method (17)
- Improved self-motivation (13)

- Communication skills (9)
- Speaking skills (23)
- Preparing attractive PowerPoint (10)

The study team has also tried to find out the areas where the TOT Course has produced some interest among the respondents, which may inspire them to apply training methods and concepts in their practical training works. The following are the main areas of improvement:

- Sharing adult learning challenges (15)
- Managing training programs willingly (22)
- Proactive role in coordinating training activities (28)
- Use of audio-visual aid in training (17)
- Proper utilization of time (13)
- Using internet resources for self-improvement (11)
- Motivating trainees for positive change (5)

3.7 Problems Faced by the Participants in Applying Training Output in Practical Training Activities.

It is not so easy to implement training input of the TOT Course by the participants in their work place. They have to face many problems from

different segments of the training arena. Table-3.7 shows that problems of trained trainers in implementing their knowledge, Skills and attitude in the practical training environment. According to the table, 5.582% participants have experienced problem regarding top management support in implementing skills and knowledge in practical life. Moreover, 49.48% identified shortage of resources as their problem of application, 35.05% opined on lack of technological support, 29.90% said demotivating factor in real life working environment, 43.30% identified lack of need bases training curricula and 18.56% says personal demotivation is the main barriers of the execution of training input in practical training activities.

Table-3.9: Problems Faced by the Participants in Applying Training on Job Situation.

No	Problems	Frequency	Percentage
1	Shortage of resources	48	49.48
2	Lack of support from top management commitment	51	52.58
3	Lack of technological support	34	35.05
4	Demotivating factors in working environment	29	29.90
5	Lack of support from immediate supervisors	42	43.30
6	Lack of need based training curricula	53	54.64

7	Demotivation of participants	18	18.56
---	------------------------------	----	-------

Note: N=97, Multiple answers are counted

3.8 Effectiveness of Training Methodology

It is also very important to know the effectiveness of the training methodology used by the trainer in TOT Course. Table-3.9 shows high level of effectiveness of the training programme (72.34 in percentage and 4.34 in median).

Table-3.11: Effectiveness of Training Methodology

Training Methodology	Level of Effectiveness		
	Percentage	Median	Total Respondent
Lecture/ discussion/ syndicate/ case method/ role playing/film show/study tour etc.	72.34	4.34	97

Note: Level and effectiveness of training methodology (median 3.5): 5 to 6 'very high', 4 to 4.99 'high', and 3.5 to 3.99 'moderate' and below 3.5 'low'.

3.9: Suggestions Offered by the Respondent of TOT Course for Better-Quality TOT Course.

The following are the valuable suggestions offered by the TOT Course participants for improving the quality of aforesaid course in Bangladesh Public Administration Training Centre (BPATC):

- More practical sessions will be arranged for self-improvement (33).

- A qualified faculty pool could be made from public and private sector experts (19).
- The participants of the TOT Course will be selected very carefully in order to ensure the course objective effectively (32).
- All additional reading materials must be provided before the tentative class scheduled (16).
- It is better to provide an online reading reference than hard copy literature for the participants (21).
- A refresher course could be arranged to exchange and share the implementation experiences of the participants (7).

Chapter IV

Analysis of Cases

4.1 Background of Case Studies

The researchers have selected 10 cases from the 9 organizations purposively. All the respondents have participated in the TOT course of BPATC from 1996-2013. In-depth interview and informal discussion have considered in order to develop cases. Among 10 cases, 80 % are from public sector organizations and 20% are from private sector organizations. The 40 % respondent's are female and 60 % are male. The selected academies and organizations include Bangladesh Airlines Training Center (BATC), Bangladesh Institute of Bank Management (BIBM), Bangladesh Public Administration Training Centre (BPATC), Bangladesh Road Transport Authority (BRTA), Dhaka Bank, Financial Management Academy (FIMA), Grameen Bank, National Academy for Planning and Development (NAPD), National Institute of Local Government (NILG).

4.2 Cases: 1-10

Case-1: Utilization of TOT Course Inputs at Bangladesh Airlines Training Center (BATC).

Ms. Pervin Islam (here the original name is coded) is serving as Training Executive (Ground Service) at Bangladesh Airlines Training Center (BATC), Kurmitola, Dhaka. After completion of the Master of Science (MSc) degree in 1990, she started her career with Bangladesh Biman in 1993 as ground service

officer. With more than 20 years practical experience, however, she involved with the training service at BATC in 2012. She has participated 33rd Training of Trainers (TOT) course of Bangladesh Public Administration Training Centre (BPATC) in 2013 for two weeks. As the TOT course is considered as a mandatory course for the trainers at BATC she took the course very seriously and motivated to complete it. She has learned the basic training methodology, the art of formal presentation and communications, time management in the practical training sessions and coordination in training course management. She is also benefited from the feedback session on her as well as the presentation of other TOT course participants. However, he learned little about the training needs assessment (TNA) from the aforementioned TOT course. In terms of the utilization of the training inputs, Ms. Pervin has found very enabling training environment at airlines training centre. The top authority is cooperative to implement the innovation in training methodology and is willing to provide logistics in this perspective. At airlines training centre, the official number of the participants is 20 in each course. This number of participants is very good for a typical training room. Here the 20 participants are also selected on the basis of their similar training needs and motivation. BATC also provides extra curricula, sports and recreation facilities for faculties and training course participants. In this perspective, she opined that the utilization of the TOT course inputs depend not only on the formal TOT course inputs but also on the overall training environment of a training centre. In this connection, according to Ms. Pervin, one important matter is the career prospects and promotion of the “qualified professional trainers”. Therefore, according to Ms. Pervin, faculty qualification, training environment and trainers motivation are the major aspects of the utilization of TOT course inputs.

Case-2: Utilization of TOT Course Inputs at Bangladesh Institute of Bank Management (BIBM)

Ms. Zobaida Hannan is working as Assistant Professor in Bangladesh Institute of Bank Management (BIBM). It is a specialized and leading training institute for the professional bankers in Bangladesh. After graduation in marketing from a recognized university in 2009 she started training career in the same year at BIBM. In 2013, the authority of BIBM advised him to attend TOT course for two weeks at Bangladesh Public Administration Training Centre (BPATC) although the tot course is not an obligation of her service. She took the training course very seriously and completed the course successfully. In the course she has learned about the difference between education and training, the method to conduct training sessions, the way of the assessment of training curricula and the issues of training course management. This course has given state of the art expertise at the beginning of her training career. Her presentation skills have improved through personal feedback during the course and he has learned many tactics from the presentation of other participants and faculty review and recommendations on these. At BIBM both theory and practice are important aspects of training. For theoretical aspects, she use to apply power point presentation. In order to communicate with the participants better, now she is confident to apply syndicate, question and answer, mind mapping methods in practical sessions. As per the factors of the utilization of the TOT course concern she has observed some aspects of the training courses in her organization. The very important is the assessing the needs of the training course participants which is well practiced at BIBM. The number of the participants in each training class is also restricted by rules. The faculty members are also personally motivated and happy with their job at BIBM. Support from the top

management is also important. They have well equipped modern class room facilities with online recourse access. In BIBM, very strict course evaluation system is also indirectly related with the attention of the participants and the faculty members to deliver at his or her level best in a respective training course. Ms. Hannan advices the TOT course for future trainer. She is happy to be a participant of the TOT course at BPATC and its utilization in her training career.

Case-3: Utilization of TOT Course Inputs at Bangladesh Public Administration Training Centre (BPATC)

Dr. Rezia Khatun, is working as deputy director of an apex training institute in Bangladesh. After graduation she started her training career in 2001 in this organization. During initial days of her service her job responsibilities include managing courses, conducting training sessions and evaluate the participants as per evaluation rules of the organization. She attended Training of Trainers Course of Bangladesh Public Administration Training Centre (BPATC) in 2002. The duration of the course was 21 days and this TOT course was mandatory for the trainers as per job of the respective training institute concern. She successfully completed this course including one day attachment with non-government training organization. In this course she oriented with the theoretical and practical aspects of training including theories of adult learning, participatory methods, such as syndicate to conduce a training sessions and need assessment of the training. She opined that the selection of the method depends on the topics and the level of the participants. She likes mixed methods for example, the combination of the lecture, discussion and syndicate. The effective utilization of training inputs, according to Ms. Khatun, closely related with specific course, institutional and personal matter

of the respective trainers. Along with training aids, the number of the participants, the personal motivation of a professional trainer is important and the role of top management is also important in this perspective. After 10 years of her service she got promotion which in one of the causes of her demotivation to deliver her level best to her institute. After promotion now she is motivated enough to conduct the session as her level best. During the initial days, the training aids were not up to date. However, all the class rooms are now well equipped and online leaning resources are now available to every one of the organization. Now she can easily apply most of the methods and techniques she learned in TOT course. She has strongly recommend TOT course for the prospective trainers and recommend the refresher course on TOT to update her learning.

Case-4: Utilization of TOT Course Inputs at Bangladesh Public Administration Training Centre (BPATC)

Mr. Abdur Razzzak is working as Deputy Director of a leading training organization in Bangladesh. After graduation in public administration from a reputed university in Bangladesh, he joined this pioneer training institute in 1998. Training of Trainers (TOT) course is one of the mandatory courses for the confirmation of his service in the training institute in which he has served. He has successfully completed the 23 TOT course for two weeks of the Bangladesh Public Administration Training Centre (BPATC) in 2004. From the course he learned practical aspects of training activity including syndicate method, film show, power point presentation ect. He used to apply lecture and discussion methods in the theoretical training sessions before the TOT course he attended. After TOT course, he has applied syndicate method along with discussion and lecture method with power point presentation. After TOT

course his self-confidence has improved, his service has confirmed and now he has motivated to deliver his level best as a professional trainer. Now online training recourse is available in his organization and he can easily utilize the online reading resource for the improvement of his knowledge. For Mr. Razaak, self-motivation is the first along with physical resources for the quality of training. The motivation of the participation is also important for the application of the effective training methods. In this perspective, need assessment of the trainees is another important matter for the utilization of the TOT course inputs. Although limited promotion in his training career has negative impact on his motivation as professional trainer he has strongly recommended the TOT course offered by BPATC for the prospective trainers in public as well as private sector institutes in Bangladesh.

Case-5: Utilization of TOT Course Inputs at Bangladesh Road Transport Authority (BRTA)

Mr. Kobir Hossain, is working as Assistant Director (Engineering) at Bangladesh Road Transport Authority (BRTC). He is a diploma engineer and graduated in 1983 in power and automobile. He started career at Bangladesh Road Transport Authority in 1990 as instructor. He has participated 33rd Training of Trainers (TOT) course at Bangladesh Public Administration Training Centre (BPATC) in 2013. He is involved with training service in this organizations and use to take class for different short course participants. TOT course is not mandatory for his service. However, through TOT course his level of understanding has increased about the classical concept of training and his skills has improved for better training management. Before the participation of the TOT course, the time management was a great challenge of his training classes and practical sessions. After TOT course his time

management capacity has improved and now he feels better to cover all the aspects of the training content in training sessions. Specially, he has benefited from the presentation and feedback sessions during his TOT course tenure and learned about the organization of the content and training sessions. He has also learned about the sitting arrangement in the classroom. In terms of utilization of the TOT course inputs he has received cooperation from his organizations despite some limitations. He has satisfied about the method he has learned in TOT course and the application of them in the practical training sessions. On the other hand, one of the limitations is the nomination of the appropriate person. Moreover, the different level of the participants is also influence the utilization of the training inputs. The time pressure and the number of the participants are other issues of the utilization of TOT course inputs. After TOT course, the authority assigned him two special training sessions for the departmental officials and he was confident to deliver his level best. In these sessions, he has presented the topic "the art of presentation in a digital era". Now he is motivated and confident for the future courses and he has strongly recommended TOT course for 3 weeks for the prospective trainers in institutes.

Case-6: Utilization of TOT course Inputs at Dhaka Bank

Mr. Rakib Hossain is serving as Senior Officer at Dhaka Bank which is one of the leading private sector banks in Bangladesh. After completion his graduation in Finance in 2006 from a reputed private university Mr. Hossain started his banking career in this bank in the same year. His responsibility is to manage the human resource division specially the training for the probationary officers in this Bank. In this connection the bank authority nominated him to participate the 33rd TOT course at Bangladesh Public

Administration Training Center (BPATC) in 2013 for two weeks. In this course Mr. Hossain learned about the basic concepts, methods and challenges of professional trainers in a typical training session. He has introduced with the adult learning theories and the role play, case analysis, syndicate method, mind mapping method of the training. He has to present a topic before the audience during the training of trainers course and he received sound recommendations to improve his presentation skill from the other participants and the faculty members. Now he has considered that the formal presentation is an art as well as a science of logic. Communication is a two way process and the feedback is important in order to discover the fact. He is confident and motivated to apply the new methods such as case study, role play and visual presentation before the participants in his organization. After TOT course he has received better score by the trainees in different courses offered by his Bank. He opined that the best use of TOT inputs not only depends on the quality of trainers but also the logistics and the size of the motivated participants. For better utilization of training inputs, they are very careful to select the participants for a course on the basis of their urgent training needs. So the participants are generally motivated in the class room. Their participants number are also regulated by the standard classroom rules and it is generally under forty. He does maintain dress code to make his presentation formal and try to get the response of the participants through eye contact and open discussion. Time management is another aspect that he has learned from the course and use to apply in the training session's management. He opined that he has specially benefited from the TOT course and recommend this course for the perspective young trainers. There is no direct link between TOT course and the promotion in his organization, however, TOT course indirectly help his career prospects and success in the training sessions.

Case7: Utilization of TOT course Inputs at Financial Management Academy (FIMA)

Sukumar Roy has served as faculty member in Financial Management Academy (FIMA), Dhaka. He started career as an Audit and Accounts Officer to the government of Bangladesh in 1986. Before that he has completed MSc degree from a reputed university. He started training career in 2007 when he joined FIMA as a trainers as well as an active member of the course management at this specialized training organization. Mr. Roy attended 29th Training of Trainers (TOT) Course of Bangladesh Public Administration Training Centre (BPATC) for two weeks in 2008. He noted some aspects of training of trainers course which has positive impact on the actual training environment in his context. First, the presentation and feedback session. In the TOT course he got feedback from the audience and experienced the goods and limitations of his presentation. Second, the training methodology session. In this session he learned different method of training including role play and case study method. Third, the study tour in another training institution which gives motivation, inspiration and learning to work in a training institute and their course management capacity. He has also learned about the communication between course management and course participants. On the other hand, he opined that the main limitations of the applications of the training inputs in the practical training session are the nomination of the appropriate participation in their institution and organizing training based on the need of the specific participation. The need assessment of the training was neglected in the tot course as well as in the practical training courses in his case. The lack of qualified faculty pool is another limitation in the specialized

training courses offered by the FIMA. However, he is happy to engage himself in the training academy and after tot course he is more confident to conduct training sessions. He receives proper support from the higher authority to modernize the training classrooms and make the hand out available online in due time. Though TOT is a backbone course he has recommend TOT course for the prospective trainers of the financial management affairs to know the art of training better.

Case 8: Utilization of TOT course Inputs at Grameen Bank

Mr. Ali Azom is working as Training Executive in Grameen Bank (GB) which is pioneer in poverty alleviation initiatives in Bangladesh through microcredit programme. After completion of the masters in political science in 1986 he joined Grameen Bank as Field Organizer in the same year. He has started training career at Head Office in Grameen Bank after more than 15 years working experience as field level officer. He has participated in the 29th TOT course organized by Bangladesh Public Administration Training Center (BPATC) in 2009. During the course he has oriented with the Basic training ideas, concept, training approach and elementary knowledge and skills on training needs assessment. This TOT course was not a mandatory course to continue his training service at GB. However, TOT course was very relevant to enhance his motivation for working as a career trainer. He has successfully applied the concepts and approaches he learned in the TOT course. He was impressed to participate in the innovative 'Ice Breaking Session' organized by the course management at BPATC. Now he along with his colleagues has been practicing the ice-breaking session during the kick-off days of the training programme at Grameen Bank. He has also successfully applied the case study method in the session concerning the loan recovery process of the

micro credit. The Audio-visual presentation in the training session is another successful methodology he has applied in the practical training session at Grameen Bank where the training class rooms are well equipped. The elementary knowledge on training needs assessment also helps him to design and organize training courses at GB. He has observed few factors that influence the utilization of the tot course inputs in the practical training activities. He would like to say that the participants in the training classes are adult and their motivation depends. We should very careful about the traditional lecture method in training sessions for adult people. Selection of the right method is very impotent in order to utilize the TOT course inputs. Personal job satisfaction and the overall learning and working environment, 'internal management crisis' coordination between service sections in the organization is also responsible to utilize and application of acquired knowledge and skills in his case.

Case-9: Utilization of TOT Course Inputs at National Academy for Planning and Development (NAPD)

Ms. Farzana Begum is working as an instructor in a national level training academy in Dhaka, Bangladesh. She did masters in natural sciences discipline from a reputed university in Germany and joined the academy in 2009. She attended the 31 Training of Trainers course at Bangladesh Public Administration Training Academy (BPATC) in 2010. Though TOT course was not mandatory to confirm her service in this academy, it was recommended by her reporting officer. During TOT course Ms. Farzana has introduced with different aspects of the theories and practices of training including concepts of training, training cycle, training needs assessment, training course management, training methods. Along with others she enjoyed the practical

sessions in the TOT course which help her to improve her presentation skills. Based on his learning in TOT course, she has successfully applied the role play and syndicate training methods in addition with traditional lecture method in day to day training activities. For successful utilization of the TOT course inputs Ms. Farzana has pointed some factors such as, the training participants are not selected on the basis of their current training needs. In a course on 'evaluation of development project' she had to train the participants who are currently working with the project formation aspects. The excessive number of participants is another problem for the typical training class room in her case. On the other hand, after her TOT course, at the very beginning of her training career, she was motivated enough to build her career as professional trainer. However, the prospect of promotion as career trainer here at NAPD is very limited and there is no direct link with TOT course and its utilization, evaluation and outputs with her promotion.

Case 10: Utilization of TOT Course Inputs at National Institute of Local Government (NILG)

Mr. Nazrul Islam is working as Deputy Director at National Institute of Local Government (NILG). NILG is leading specialized institute to train up the elected and appointed local government functionaries in Bangladesh. After completion of his graduation in 1981 Mr. Islam joined NILG in 1988 as Assistant Research Officer. He got promotion in 2003 as Research Officer and became Deputy Director in 2013. His job responsibilities include conducting training sessions, managing training courses and conduct action research on local government problems and issues. He has participated 29th Training of Trainers Course organized by Bangladesh Public Administration Training Centre (BPATC) in 2008 for two weeks. He said that during TOT training

course he has introduced with the latest literature on adult learning and the advanced methods of training. In the presentation and feedback session he has introduced with the positive and limitation of his and other presentation and learned a lot about the practical aspects of training. This TOT course is not a mandatory service condition in his institute. However, after the TOT course his confidence has improved to build his career in national training institute. Now he is happy to apply the group discussion, role play, syndicate methods mind mapping along with classical lecture method. Automation of the classroom at NILG also helps to utilize modern training methods in practical training sessions. However, the majority of the participants are the people's repetitive as well as political leaders at NILG. It is a major challenge to apply the modern training methods before leaders motivated with different ideologies in the course on local administration and development. The TOT course gives him tips, tactics and confidence to manage extempore classroom situation and diverse interest of the participants. Another important issue is the number of the participants in a classroom. As NILG has to cover long list of local government functionaries the number of the trainees is usually higher than the ideal number of participants in a responsible training session. He has to wait many years for first proportion at NILG which is considered as 'a reality' in personal motivational factor for his career as a professional trainer. After the completion of TOT course there is no follow up initiative for the career trainers in Bangladesh. An online network or website or 'facebook group' of the professional trainers could enhance the exchange and application of the latest knowledge and skills on different training methods. However, he does support the TOT course offered by BPATC for a young trainer.

Chapter V

Key Findings of the Survey and Case Studies

5.1 Findings of the Survey Data

5.1.1 Background of the Participants

The socio-economic background of the respondents indicates that out of 97 participants 78 are male (80.4%) and only 19 participants (19.6%) are female. Out of 97 respondents, 91 respondents (93.8%) have post-graduate and equivalent degree and only 6 respondents (6.2%) have graduate and equivalent degree. most of the participants (19.5%) were from Bangladesh Public Administration Training Centre (BPATC), the apex training institute in the public sector in Bangladesh. Moreover, 7.23% from Bangladesh Academy for Rural Development (BARD), Comilla; 5.15% from Bangladesh Forest Research Institute (BFRI), 5.15% from Chittagong; Bangladesh Forest Research Institute (BFRI).

5.1.2 Findings of the Objectives of the Study

5.2.1 In order to know how far the objectives of TOT Course had been achieved, the trained participants were asked the pre-determined objectives using the scale 1 and 6. The objective related to conceptualize the most recent available concepts, principals, and methods of training, the average achievement is 71 percent and the average achievement (in median) in this objective is satisfactory (4.23). It also shows that the objective related to improve their institutional skills and training

management capability and to apply them to their job situations, the average achievement is 63 percent and the average achievement (in median) in this objective is moderate (3.75).

- 5.2.2 In relation with the improvement of knowledge, skills and attitude, most of the participants (88.66%) opined that the training inputs have positive impact to improve their existing knowledge level. It also helps them to improve their skills better (73.20%) than positive change in their attitude (65.98%). The average knowledge and skills on concepts of training and training management, before training, were 54 percent and 2.96 in median. The average knowledge of acquired knowledge after TOT Course on concepts of training and training management, after training, has increased to in 72% and 3.93 in median and it is 18 percentage points higher than that of the level before TOT. The average knowledge and skills on research methodology, before training, were 49 percent and 2.67 in median. The average knowledge of acquired knowledge after TOT Course on research methodology has increased to in 70% and 3.84 in median and it is 21 percentage points higher than that of the level before TOT.

Their knowledge has improved on the topic such as, training Cycle, on the job training, methods of training evaluation, coordination for effective training, training as a tool for HRD, managing courses, preparing institutional plan, lecture method etc. Their skills have also enhanced on the topic such as ice breaking, training needs analysis, objective setting, budget preparation of training, techniques of literature searching, training methodology, training method, use of audio-visual

aids, role playing theory, techniques of case writing, MS Power Point etc.

5.2.3 Regarding the application of archived knowledge, skills and attitude in the practical training activities, the 73 percent of the trained trainer took initiative to implement their improved knowledge and skills and motivation in order to enhance the quality of training in their institutions. Among them 32% participates are successful to apply the TOT course output in the practical training environment. 45.36% are partially successful and 21.65% are not successful in the practical implementation of the training activates.

5.3.4 Regarding different constraints faced by the participants in their practical life, about 55.82% participants face problem regarding top management support in implementing skills and knowledge in practical life. Moreover, 49.48% identified shortage of resources as their problem of application, 35.05% opined on lack of technological support, 29.90% said demotivating factor in real life working environment, 43.30% identified lack of need bases training curricula and 18.56% says personal demotivation is the main barriers of the execution of training input in practical training activities.

5.3.5 Regarding the future improvement of TOT Course, the respondents opined that they identified some loopholes which could be considered for the effectiveness of the aforesaid course in future perspectives such as the curricula could be consulted with the needs of all participants, the medium of instruction was not fully in English, the dormitory and the class room facilities were not well equipped, the training and

learning process was not very good, the contents of the training were not discussed in details, the renowned trainers of the private sector could be invited for conduction training sessions. Moreover, the high level of effectiveness of the training programme (72.34 in percentage and 4.34 in median) is also observed. The valuable suggestions offered by the TOT Course participants for improving the quality of aforesaid course in Bangladesh Public Administration Training Centre (BPATC) are more practical sessions will be arranged for self-improvement, a qualified faculty pool could be made from public and private sector experts, the participants of the TOT Course will be selected very carefully in order to ensure the course objective effectively, all additional reading materials must be provided before the tentative class scheduled, it is better to provide an online reading reference than hard copy literature for the participants, a refresher course could be arranged to exchange and share the implementation experiences of the participants of previous TOT courses.

5.2 Findings of the Case Studies

- ❖ After the successful completion of TOT course, the knowledge and skills of the participants on training concept and methods have improved and they are inspired for serving as professional trainers (10).
- ❖ Presentation and feedback session in TOT course have 'great influence' in the utilization of course inputs in practical training sessions in many cases (8).

- ❖ The number of the participants in a classroom has impact on the utilization of TOT course inputs in the practical training sessions (4).
- ❖ Career prospects and on time promotion of the qualified professional trainers are oriented with the motivation and utilization of TOT course inputs (4) .
- ❖ There is an indirect relation between the compulsory TOT course for prospective trainers in a training institute and their motivation in training courses and utilization in practice (2).
- ❖ Selection of participants on the basis of their similar and actual training needs is also important for the utilization of TOT course learning (3).
- ❖ Automation of the training institute and their classrooms are contributing in the application of latest training methods (2).
- ❖ Need assessment of the training participants is less emphasized topic in the ToT course which has poor contribution as per the execution of TOT course inputs concern (3).
- ❖ Coordination between service sections in the training organization is also indirectly responsible to utilize and application of acquired knowledge and skills in this case (1) .
- ❖ Trainers personal time management capacity within session is also partially influence the application of TOT course inputs (2).

- ❖ An online network (for example, facebook group) or website of the professional trainers could enhance the exchange and application of the latest knowledge and skills on different training methods (1).

Chapter VI

Conclusion and Policy Recommendations

6.1 Conclusion

The first objective of the study was to appraise the relevance of Training of Trainers (TOT) course inputs to improve the knowledge, skills and attitude of the participants in the practical training environment. According to the findings, the average knowledge and skills on concepts of training and training management, before training, were 54 percent and 2.96 in median. The average knowledge of acquired knowledge after TOT Course on concepts of training and training management, after training, has increased to in 72% and 3.93 in median and it is 18 percentage points higher than that of the level before TOT.

The average knowledge and skills on research methodology, before training, were 49 percent and 2.67 in median. The average knowledge of acquired knowledge after TOT Course on research methodology, after training, has increased to in 70% and 3.84 in median and it is 21 percentage points higher than that of the level before TOT. The average knowledge and skills on MS Power Point, before training, were 55 percent and 3 in median. The average knowledge of acquired knowledge after TOT Course on research methodology, after training, has increased to in 73% and 3.99 in median and it is 15 percentage points higher than that of the level before TOT course.

The second and important objective of the study was to assess the level of unitization of training inputs in their practical training session. According to

study findings, 73 percent of the trained trainer took initiative to implement their improved knowledge and skills and motivation in order to enhance the quality of training in their institutions. On the other hand only 24.74% respondents are failure to take any initiative to apply their training achievements. Therefore, most of the participants are active to apply training. It is also important to apply training inputs in real life training activities. According to the findings, 32% participates are successful to apply the TOT course output in the practical training environment. 45.36% are partially successful and 21.65% are not successful in the practical implementation of the training activates.

The third objective of the study was to discover the factors that influence the utilization of training in practical training sessions. According to the findings, the main problems include 5.582% participants face problem reading top management support in implementing skills and knowledge in practical life. Moreover, 49.48% identified shortage of resources as their problem of application, 35.05% opined on lack of technological support, 29.90% said demotivating factor in real life working environment, 43.30% identified lack of need bases training curricula and 18.56% says personal demotivation is the main barriers of the execution of training input in practical training activities.

To sum up, TOT course has 'moderate' effect to improve the knowledge, skills of the participants on concepts of training, training management and training methodology. After successful completion of TOT course, the participants are inspired for serving as professional trainers. Majority of the participants took initiative to apply the training inputs in practical training sessions and they are "partially successful" in utilization. Factors influencing the utilization of TOT inputs include: top management support, lack of resources and rewards,

number and selection of participants, automation of the organization, personal de-motivation in terms of 'career plan' of professional trainers, mandatory condition of the course, individual time management capacity and coordination between service sections within organization.

Therefore, TOT Course has moderator effect on the knowledge and skills of the participants and they are inspired to serve as trainers. However, in practice the participants are partially successful for the application of TOT course inputs. Both TOT course inputs, institutional and personal working environment are responsible for the successful utilization of TOT course learning in the practical training sessions.

6.2 Policy Recommendations

In order to improve the quality of TOT Course and its utilization the study team identified some issues as policy recommendations which are given below:

- ❖ More personal presentation sessions with feedback will be arranged for self-improvement of the TOT course participants. In order to implement this recommendation, BPATC may allocate more time for the 'presentation and feedback session' of the TOT course.
- ❖ The number of the participants should be selected very carefully and the nomination of the participants must be based on their similar and specific training needs. To execute this recommendation, all training institute should ensure the number of their training course participants up to forty. The same level of the participants should be ensured very carefully.

- ❖ Proper attention should be given on the topic training needs assessment (TNA) with exercise. During TOT Course, BPATC should ensure more exercise on training need assessment topic.
- ❖ TOT course should be a compulsory course for the prospective trainer at different training institutes. TOT course should be a mandatory course for all trainers working in the public sector institutes.
- ❖ 'State of the art' training equipment should be ensured in the training classes. Ministry of Public Administration and Ministry of Finance should take necessary step to allocate more money for the automation of the training institutes.
- ❖ Coordination between service sections and course authority should be ensured in the training organizations. The CEO of training institutes should ensure the proper cooperation between different service sections within training organizations.
- ❖ Career plan of professional trainers is needed in order to ensure qualified faculty pool in public sector training institutes and academics. The Ministry of Public Administration should take initiative for on time promotion of career trainers and ensure a faculty pool for training organizations.
- ❖ Online network or website of the professional trainers should be developed to enhance the exchange and application of the latest knowledge and skills on different training methods. BPATC should take initiative to form an online network of career trainers in Bangladesh.

References and Bibliography

- Abella, Kay Tter (1986). Building Successful Training Programme" Step-by-Step Guide, California: AW Publishing Company, Inc.
- Bangladesh Public Administration Training Centre (BPATC) (2006). Special Training of Trainers Course for Faculty Members (October03-17, 2006) OMNIBUS-I (PPR) and II (Course Management), Savar, Dhaka: BPATC.
- Government of Bangladesh-GOB (2003). Public Administration Training Policy, Dhaka: Ministry of Establishment.
- Hussain, Saadat (2002). Issues in Training and Development, Dhaka: New Age Publication.
- Kirkpatrick, Donald L.,(1983). A practical Guide to Supervisory Training and Development, California: AW Publishing Company, Inc.
- Laird, Dugan (1985). Approaches to Training and Development, California: AW Publishing Company, Inc.
- Nadler, Leonard(1982). Designing Training Programme: The Critical Events, California: AW Publishing Company, Inc.
- Rae, Leslie (2000). Effective Planning in Training and Development, London: Kogan Page.
- Sundar, Banik Gour and Mottaleb. Khondoker Abdul (2003), Post-Training Utilization of English Language Programme: A Case Study of 24th and 25th Foundation Training Course. Dhaka: Bangladesh Public Administration Training Centre.
- Simigal, Lloyd Merritt (2000). Basic Training for Ne Manager, Los Angels: Lowell House.
- Wilson, Joe B, (1995). Mapping A Winning training Approach, London: Kogan Page Ltd.
- Watson, Charles E. (1985). Management Development Through Training, California: AW Publishing Company, Inc.

Bangladesh Public Administration Training Centre
Savar, Dhaka-1342, Bangladesh

**Post-Training Utilization of Training of Trainers (TOT)
Course of BPATC: An Empirical Study**

(Note: this questionnaire is formed to collect opinions from the previous participants of the Training of Training Course about the Post-Training Utilization of the training inputs of the Training of the Trainers Course. All personal data and information collected through this questionnaire will be kept confidential and will only be used for research and development only)

QUERTIONNAIRE

Part-I: Personal Data and General Information

- 1.1 Name of the Respondent :
- 1.2 Age :
- 1.3 Sex : Male/Female (Please put tick mark)
- 1.3 Educational Qualification : BA/BSS/B.Com/Bsc.(Subject.....)
(Please put tick mark) MA/MSS/M.Com/Msc.(Subject.....)
MS/M.Phil
Ph.D
- 1.4 Designation :
- 1.4 Official Address and Tel. :
- 1.5 Please Write your TOT Course No. :
- 1.6 Had you participated in any training courses on TOT before joining in the TOT Course of BPATC? (Please put tick mark).
: Yes/No
- 1.7 If yes, please fill in the following table:

Sl. No	Institution	Title of the Course	Duration
--------	-------------	---------------------	----------

1			
2			
3			

Part-II: Comments on the Course Contents

- 2 Following were the objectives of the Training of the Trainers course of Bangladesh Public Administration Training Centre as mentioned in the course guideline of the courses. How far this has been achieved? (Using a scale 1-6, you are requested to tick the number with which you closely agree. 1 indicate minimum and 6 maximum).

- 2.1 Conceptualize the most recent available concepts, principles and methods of training.

1 2 3 4 5 6

- 2.2 Enable the participants to improve their institutional skills and training management capacity and to apply them to their job situations.

1 2 3 4 5 6

- 2.3 Provide opportunity to the participants to share their individual experiences and exchange views or ideas for the promotion of quality aimed at development of skilled manpower in Bangladesh.

1 2 3 4 5 6

- 3.1 Following were the topics of the TOT Course as mentioned in the course brochure of the course. Please give your opinion on the level of your knowledge before participating in the course and after participating in the course and its application in your day-to-day life training environment. (Using a scale 1-6, you are requested to tick the number with which you closely agree. 1 indicate minimum and 6 indicate maximum).

Topics	Level of knowledge and skills before TOT						Level of knowledge and skills after TOT						Application in day-to-day training activities					
Concepts of Training and Training Management																		
Ice breaking	1	2	3	4	5	6	1	2	3	4	5	6	1	2	3	4	5	6
Training Cycle	1	2	3	4	5	6	1	2	3	4	5	6	1	2	3	4	5	6
On the job Training. What- Why-How	1	2	3	4	5	6	1	2	3	4	5	6	1	2	3	4	5	6
Training needs Analysis-1	1	2	3	4	5	6	1	2	3	4	5	6	1	2	3	4	5	6
Training needs Analysis-2	1	2	3	4	5	6	1	2	3	4	5	6	1	2	3	4	5	6
Objective Setting	1	2	3	4	5	6	1	2	3	4	5	6	1	2	3	4	5	6

Curriculum Design	1	2	3	4	5	6	1	2	3	4	5	6	1	2	3	4	5	6
Methods of Training Evaluation	1	2	3	4	5	6	1	2	3	4	5	6	1	2	3	4	5	6
Coordination for Effective Training	1	2	3	4	5	6	1	2	3	4	5	6	1	2	3	4	5	6
Budget Preparation of training	1	2	3	4	5	6	1	2	3	4	5	6	1	2	3	4	5	6
Techniques of Literature Searching	1	2	3	4	5	6	1	2	3	4	5	6	1	2	3	4	5	6
Training as a Tool for HRD	1	2	3	4	5	6	1	2	3	4	5	6	1	2	3	4	5	6
Managing Courses	1	2	3	4	5	6	1	2	3	4	5	6	1	2	3	4	5	6
Training Methodology																		
Training Method	1	2	3	4	5	6	1	2	3	4	5	6	1	2	3	4	5	6
Use of Audio-visual Aids	1	2	3	4	5	6	1	2	3	4	5	6	1	2	3	4	5	6
Preparing Institutional Plan	1	2	3	4	5	6	1	2	3	4	5	6	1	2	3	4	5	6
Lecture Method	1	2	3	4	5	6	1	2	3	4	5	6	1	2	3	4	5	6
The Art of Presentation	1	2	3	4	5	6	1	2	3	4	5	6	1	2	3	4	5	6
Syndicate Method	1	2	3	4	5	6	1	2	3	4	5	6	1	2	3	4	5	6
Role Playing Theory	1	2	3	4	5	6	1	2	3	4	5	6	1	2	3	4	5	6
Role Playing Practice	1	2	3	4	5	6	1	2	3	4	5	6	1	2	3	4	5	6
Techniques of Case Writing	1	2	3	4	5	6	1	2	3	4	5	6	1	2	3	4	5	6
National Training Policy	1	2	3	4	5	6	1	2	3	4	5	6	1	2	3	4	5	6
Qualities of a Trainer	1	2	3	4	5	6	1	2	3	4	5	6	1	2	3	4	5	6
Transactional Analysis	1	2	3	4	5	6	1	2	3	4	5	6	1	2	3	4	5	6
Post-Training Utilization	1	2	3	4	5	6	1	2	3	4	5	6	1	2	3	4	5	6
Computer																		
MS Power Point	1	2	3	4	5	6	1	2	3	4	5	6	1	2	3	4	5	6

4 Do you recommend any change in the contents of this module? (Please put tick mark)

Yes/No

4.1 If yes, what topics would you like to be include?

(1)

(2)

(3)

4.2 What topics would you like to omit?

(1)

(2)

(3)

4.3 How do you rate the effectiveness of training methodologies used in the TOT? (Those are lecture/ discussion/ syndicate/ case method/ role playing/film show/study tour). Using a scale 1-6, you are requested to tick the number with which you closely agree. 1 indicate minimum and 6 indicate maximum.

1

2

3

4

5

6

4.4 Do you think by attending the TOT Course, some positive change/improvement in your knowledge, skills and attitude in this area have taken place (please put tick mark).

Yes/ No

4.5.1 If yes, what are those changes?

(1)

(2)

(3)

4.5.2 If no, please mention reasons in favour opinion.

(1)

(2)

(3)

4.6 Have you tried to utilize the gained knowledge, skills and attitude of TOT Course in your place of training? (Please put tick mark).

Yes/No

4.6 If yes, what is the result? (Please put tick mark).

Successful / Partially Successful/ Not Successful

4.6.1 If partially successful or not successful then what are the factors impeding the use of training knowledge/skills/motivation achieved from the TOT Course.

- Lack of cooperation from the authority

- Scarcity of training aids

- Lack of enabling training environment

- Presence of personal demotivating factors

- Limited infrastructural facilities

- Others (if any).....

5. Would you agree that participation in TOT Course has generated your interest to conduct training sessions effectively than before? (Please put tick mark).

Yes/ No

- 5.1 If yes, what are the areas of interest?

(1)

(2)

(3)

6. How have you utilized the gained knowledge, skill and experience of the TOT Course in your present job?

(1)

(2)

(3)

7. Any additional comments please:

-Thank you very much for your kind coordination-